Journal of Leadership, Accountability and Ethics

North American Business Press
Atlanta – Seattle – South Florida - Toronto
Journal of Leadership, Accountability and Ethics

Dr. Charles Terry,  
*Editor*

Dr. David Smith,  
*Editor-In-Chief*

NORTH AMERICAN BUSINESS PRESS  
EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD

Dr. Andy Bertsch - MINOT STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dr. Jacob Bikker - UTRECHT UNIVERSITY, NETHERLANDS  
Dr. Bill Bommer - CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY, FRESNO  
Dr. Michael Bond - UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA  
Dr. Charles Butler - COLORADO STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dr. Jon Carrick - STETSON UNIVERSITY  
Dr. Mondher Cherif - REIMS, FRANCE  
Dr. Daniel Condon - DOMINICAN UNIVERSITY, CHICAGO  
Dr. Bahram Dadgostar - LAKEHEAD UNIVERSITY, CANADA  
Dr. Deborah Erdos-Knapp - KENT STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dr. Bruce Forster - UNIVERSITY OF NEBRASKA, KEARNEY  
Dr. Nancy Furlow - MARYMOUNT UNIVERSITY  
Dr. Mark Gershon - TEMPLE UNIVERSITY  
Dr. Philippe Gregoire - UNIVERSITY OF LAVAL, CANADA  
Dr. Donald Grunewald - IONA COLLEGE  
Dr. Samantha Hettihewa - UNIVERSITY OF BALLARAT, AUSTRALIA  
Dr. Russell Kashian - UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN, WHITewater  
Dr. Jeffrey Kennedy - PALM BEACH ATLANTIC UNIVERSITY  
Dr. Dean Koutramanis - UNIVERSITY OF TAMPA  
Dr. Malek Lashgari - UNIVERSITY OF HARTFORD  
Dr. Priscilla Liang - CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY, CHANNEL ISLANDS  
Dr. Tony Matias - MATIAS AND ASSOCIATES  
Dr. Patti Meglich - UNIVERSITY OF NEBRASKA, OMAHA  
Dr. Robert Metts - UNIVERSITY OF NEVADA, RENO  
Dr. Adil Mouhammer - UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS, SPRINGFIELD  
Dr. Roy Pearson - COLLEGE OF WILLIAM AND MARY  
Dr. Veena Prabhu, California State University, Los Angeles  
Dr. Sergiy Rakhamayil - RYERSON UNIVERSITY, CANADA  
Dr. Robert Scherer - CLEVELAND STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dr. Ira Sohn - MONTCLAIR STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dr. Reginal Sheppard - UNIVERSITY OF NEW BRUNSWICK, CANADA  
Dr. Carlos Spah - LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY, SHREVEPORT  
Dr. Ken Thorpe - EMORY UNIVERSITY  
Dr. Robert Tian - MEDIAlLE COLLEGE  
Dr. Calin Valsan - BISHOPS UNIVERSITY, CANADA  
Dr. Anne Walsh - LA SALLE UNIVERSITY  
Dr. Thomas Verney - SHIPPENSburg STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dr. Christopher Wright - UNIVERSITY OF ADELAIDE, AUSTRALIA
**This Issue**

**Organizational Leadership – The Strategic Role of the Chief Exec**

Mohammed Salleh, Donald Grunewald

The owner of a company will want to directly or through the medium of professional executive management to control the operation of that company. Placing a distinct and separate authority at the top of the organization, is not leadership as commonly understood by many. Rather, it is a command that gives legitimate expression to the role of management over the function of leadership. The focus of this paper is on the strategic role performed by the chief executive in providing the embodiment of vision, executive management, and control toward organizational leadership.

**Anthropology of Leadership: An Integrative Approach to Intercultural Leadership in Armenia**

Petros G. Malakyan

Cultural Anthropology provides a framework for delineating, understanding, and interpreting leadership behaviors across the great cultural divides. Since cultural variations endorse different leadership behaviors (House, 2004), attempts have been made to understand the contemporary Armenian leadership behavior, whether or not a co-relation exists between the Armenian cultural characteristics and leadership styles. To test this anthropological premise, first, I have studied current cultural characteristics and leadership styles and their relationships in the Armenian cultural context. Second, in light of the research findings, I have tried to predict leadership behaviors as a result of shifts of cultural characteristics and leadership styles for current Church, National, and Democratic leadership models in Armenia. Third, I made recommendations for culturally relevant and integrative approaches to intercultural leadership, known as interculturation, for the country to face the challenges of the 21st century globalized world.

**Management Journals and the Celebrity Researcher Effect on Tiers**

Reginald L. Bell

I used two-way analysis of variance, with a 4 x 3 factorial design, to compare the means of 420 articles published in 21 reputable management journals—20 articles per journal. The independent variables were a corroborated list of 1st, 2nd, 3rd, and 4th tier management journals and three publication periods were 1989 and before, 1990 to 1999 and 2000 and after. The dependent variable was the 617,299 citations of articles found in a Google Scholar citations search. I ascertained means differed on the main effects of tier (p< .001) and publication period (p< .05). The measure of the magnitude of decreases in citations among journal tiers did not differ across the three publication periods, with a non-significant interaction effect of p = .794. Super-cited articles published in 1st tier management journals give them a competitive advantage over lower tier journals when journals are ranked by counting citations. This celebrity researcher effect, however, is negated over time.
An Exploration of Institutional Climate and Supports Enabling Career Growth for Female Leaders at Utah Valley University

Susan Seymour, Anne Wairepo

This study investigates the underrepresentation of female leaders at Utah institutions compared to peer institutions and national averages. Using one Utah institution as a case study, this research considers existing female leadership dynamics in relationship to institutional support and climate factors. It also considers opportunities for developing an executive female leadership pipeline despite challenging contextual factors such as a conservative religious culture, an institutional climate that is challenged by perceptions of diversity and fairness, and few female role models.

Making a Difference: Role of Women Religious in Bridging Democratic Leadership in Africa

Jane Wakahiu

Women religious play a colossal role in bridging democratic leadership gap thorough programs that address needs for the underprivileged. Using 22 women participants of a three-year Hilton Foundation funded Sisters Leadership Development Initiative; this study examines the impetus for Catholic Sisters starting development programs in Africa, and implications of ethics of care in their practice of leadership. Data were collected through a Survey Monkey and face-to-face interviews. Findings indicate the overarching goal of their programs is to alleviate poverty for the underserved, to improve life and to increase opportunities for self-reliance. Also, capacity building programs increase effectiveness in service delivery.

A Study of the Relationship Between Moral Maturity and Respondent’s Self-Rated Leadership Style

Charles R. Salter, Mary H. Harris, Mark Woodhull, Jay McCormack

The study of moral development and the effects it has on decision making have garnered a good deal of interest in the last thirty years. Rest, Thoma, and Narvaez (1999e) discuss the cognitive schemas associated with the different levels of moral development as stated by Kohlberg (1984). Rest et al. (1999e) suggest that cognitive moral schemas present in our conscious aid our retention of factual similarities between our experiences and ultimately aid in our decision making and search for further information. This implicit moral theory is similar to the leadership theory noted as Implicit Leadership Theory or the theory that one also carries in her or his memory a certain slate of factors which they use to identify a leader’s behavior as being those of a good leader or an ineffective leader (Salter, Green, Ree, Carmody-Bubb, & Duncan, 2009).

Nightingale, Curie, and Roosevelt as Exemplars of the Fabulous Five Dimensions of Centered Leadership

Kelley A. Conrad, Anastasia Metros, Barbara Shambaugh

Phenomenological patterns identified from lived experiences described in the biographies of Nightingale, Curie, and Roosevelt were found consistent with the Centered Leadership model (Barsh, Cranston, & Lewis, 2011) confirming the model as a valuable guide for leadership development of women. This biographical case study of three outstanding women from the last century analyzed information from their own words quoted in collected works, books, and articles they authored or written about them. We documented evidence of the fabulous five dimensions of meaning, framing, connecting, engaging, and energizing from Centered Leadership for all three exemplars supporting the model.
GUIDELINES FOR SUBMISSION

Journal of Leadership, Accountability and Ethics
(JLAЕ)

Domain Statement

The Journal of Leadership, Accountability and Ethics is dedicated to the advancement and dissemination of business and management knowledge by publishing, through a blind, refereed process, ongoing results of research in accordance with international scientific or scholarly standards. Articles are written by business leaders, policy analysts and active researchers for an audience of specialists, practitioners and students. Articles of regional interest are welcome, especially those dealing with lessons that may be applied in other regions around the world. Research addressing any of the business functions is encouraged as well as those from the non-profit and governmental sectors.

Focus of the articles should be on applications and implications of management, leadership, ethics, and governance. Theoretical articles are welcome as long as there is an applied nature, which is in keeping with the North American Business Press mandate.

Objectives

- Generate an exchange of ideas between scholars, practitioners and industry specialists
- Enhance the development of the management and leadership disciplines
- Acknowledge and disseminate achievement in best business practice and innovative approaches to management, leadership and governance
- Provide an additional outlet for scholars and experts to contribute their ongoing work in the area of management, leadership and ethics

Submission Format

Articles should be submitted following the American Psychological Association format. Articles should not be more than 30 double-spaced, typed pages in length including all figures, graphs, references, and appendices. Submit two hard copies of manuscript along with a disk typed in MS-Word (preferably).

Make main sections and subsections easily identifiable by inserting appropriate headings and sub-headings. Type all first-level headings flush with the left margin, bold and capitalized. Second-level headings are also typed flush with the left margin but should only be bold. Third-level headings, if any, should also be flush with the left margin and italicized.

Include a title page with manuscript which includes the full names, affiliations, address, phone, fax, and e-mail addresses of all authors and identifies one person as the Primary Contact. Put the submission date on the bottom of the title page. On a separate sheet, include the title and
an abstract of 100 words or less. Do not include authors’ names on this sheet. A final page, “About the authors,” should include a brief biographical sketch of 100 words or less on each author. Include current place of employment and degrees held.

References must be written in APA style. It is the responsibility of the author(s) to ensure that the paper is thoroughly and accurately reviewed for spelling, grammar and referencing.

**Review Procedure**

Authors will receive an acknowledgement by e-mail including a reference number shortly after receipt of the manuscript. All manuscripts within the general domain of the journal will be sent for at least two reviews, using a double blind format, from members of our Editorial Board or their designated reviewers. In the majority of cases, authors will be notified within 60 days of the result of the review. If reviewers recommend changes, authors will receive a copy of the reviews and a timetable for submitting revisions. Papers and disks will not be returned to authors.

**Accepted Manuscripts**

When a manuscript is accepted for publication, author(s) must provide format-ready copy of the manuscripts including all graphs, charts, and tables. Specific formatting instructions will be provided to accepted authors along with copyright information. Each author will receive two copies of the issue in which his or her article is published without charge. All articles printed by JLAIE are copyright protected by the Journal. Permission requests for reprints should be addressed to the Editor. Questions and submissions should be addressed to:

North American Business Press  
301 Clematis Street #3000  
West Palm Beach, Florida 33401  
jlae@na-businesspress.com  
866-624-2458
Organizational Leadership – The Strategic Role of the Chief Exec

Mohammed Salleh
SBP Academia Limited

Donald Grunewald
Iona College

The owner of a company will want to directly or through the medium of professional executive management to control the operation of that company. Placing a distinct and separate authority at the top of the organization, is not leadership as commonly understood by many. Rather, it is a command that gives legitimate expression to the role of management over the function of leadership. The focus of this paper is on the strategic role performed by the chief executive in providing the embodiment of vision, executive management, and control toward organizational leadership.

INTRODUCTION

One of the basic principles of modern business is the separation of ownership and management. In other words, those who have a financial stake in the firm (i.e. owners, including private owners and public shareholders) may not have a management role (Hitt & Ireland, 2008). Instead, the management role is filled by a staff of professionally trained managers who manage the firm in accordance with the interests of the firm (Hitt & Ireland, 2008). The Chief Executive Officer (CEO) is the highest-ranked of these professional managers, and is tasked with general strategic direction, management, and control of the firm (Carver & Carver, 2011). In many organizations the CEO also plays a role in corporate governance, with a seat on the board. (Carver & Carver, 2011).

In many United States public corporations (corporations required to report quarterly by the U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission as public corporations), the CEO may also have the title Chairperson of the Board of Trustees. When the CEO also serves as Chairperson of the Board, the CEO has the extra powers inherent in presiding over the board meetings even though he or she has only one vote on the Board. This dual role as CEO and Chairperson of the Board is causing increasing controversy in the USA as some shareholders and many academics believe that the different interests of stockholders and those of managers would make it more useful for the Chairperson to be an outside member of the board who is not a paid member of management. This is common in many other countries such as in the United Kingdom where the CEO often has the title of Managing Director but the Chairperson of the Board is an outside member of the Board who does not work full time for the corporation. In non-profit organizations in the USA, the CEO often has the title of President or Executive Director of the organization. In such non-profit organizations, the Chairperson of the Board is ordinarily someone who is a volunteer for the organization and is not paid any salary for his or her work with the organization. (Lublin, 2009). (Grunewald, 1991).
Regardless of title, the CEO plays a substantial role in the creation of a coherent group (the organization), the identification of a vision and goals, direction of the group through executive management, and creation of systems of controls and accountability to help achievement of these goals.

ANALYSIS

The roles and processes of the CEO follow from the separation of ownership and management in the modern firm and the need for organization of the group of people associated with the corporation. The specific roles that are identified include creation of a vision for the organization, direction of the organization in order to achieve these goals through executive management and transformational leadership, and creation of systems of control and accountability in order to ensure that the corporation can reach its goals.

This analysis first begins with deconstruction of the separation of ownership and management interests and the need for organization of the group. It then follows with discussion of each of the three roles of the CEO (strategic vision, management, and control) and how these roles serve to organize the group and direct it. These discussion areas also critique the ideas presented, particularly presenting the potential issues that can occur in these areas and specific cases where the theoretical position is not shown. These cases show where more attention needs to be placed on the theoretical development of the role of the CEO as well as potential gaps in CEO skills and training.

THEOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS OF THE CEO’S ROLE

The role of the chief executive is based on two distinct theoretical concepts that influence group organization and direction. The first of these concepts is separation of ownership and management interests, while the second is the role of leadership in the organization of the group. The theoretical foundations of these roles are discussed in order to show how the CEO influences the organization.

SEPARATION OF OWNERSHIP AND CONTROL

The separation of ownership and control is a long-standing principle of Western management of non-family firms. This concept simply refers to the idea that, in the large firm, economic ownership of the firm is not associated with the management of the firm (Clarke, 2007). This is due to the dispersed ownership through shares or multiple investors, which means that there is no clear candidate for the firm to select for management and leadership. Furthermore, none of the majority shareholders in the firm may have the technical skills or desire to manage the firm, being engaged in other business. Instead, the firm as a corporate body selects a professional group of managers to control the business in the interests of the shareholders (Clarke, 2007). This focuses the management interest in a single individual, rather than using a group management model. This model is obviously not followed in small business, entrepreneurial businesses that have not yet been listed on the market, and family firms, but it does hold for public corporations (Clarke, 2007).

The literature has long supported the increased efficiency that is found with separation of ownership and control. For example, one early study found that for large firms, there was a strong financial benefit to be gained from the professional skills of managers (Monsen et al., 1968). However, this study also found a clear disadvantage to the separated arrangement – specifically, that the financial interests of the manager and the corporation are not necessarily aligned, and thus it is difficult to force the manager to act in the interests of the firm (Monsen et al., 1968). This condition is formalized in economic theory as a principal-agent problem (Nicholson & Snyder, 2011). The classical form of the principal-agent problem holds that there is one party (the principal) that holds economic ownership of an asset, but for some reason does not want to manage the asset himself. In order to efficiently manage the asset, the principal hires a second party (the agent) and tasks him with managing the asset in line with the interests of the principal. In the firm, the owners (distributed or otherwise) are the principals, and the CEO is the agent.
The problem arises in the principal-agent problem because the economic interests of the principal and the agent are not aligned, and the agent (who is active in managing the asset) has more information than the principal. This allows for the potential that the agent may use the favorable information asymmetry for his own gain, rather than the gain of the principal (Nicholson & Snyder, 2011). The problem is further exacerbated by the problem of moral hazard, as it is the principal (the owners of the firm) rather than the agent (the CEO) bears the penalty for any errors that accrue from the principal’s ownership of the firm (Nicholson & Snyder, 2011). In order to prevent the misuse of agent information by the CEO, the most common approach is to use a compensation package that aligns the interests of the CEO and the ownership of the firm (Hall, 2008). For example, executive compensation may be composed primarily of performance incentives, such as bonuses and stock grants, that tie the executive’s compensation levels to the financial performance achieved by the firm (Hall, 2008).

The final question regarding the use of separation of management and control is whether or not it is actually effective in terms of financial performance. As previously noted, earlier studies have enthusiastically supported the financial benefits of this separation (Monsen et al., 1968). However, more recent studies have had more ambiguous findings. For example, one study found that firms had to employ more outside directors as the degree of separation between ownership and control became higher, which the authors attributed to increasing principal-agent effects and increasingly poor alignment of interests (He & Sommer, 2010). There have also been increasing questions about the role of separation of ownership and control in risky behavior on the part of corporate managers (Cole et al., 2011). Cole et al.’s (2011) study of risk management in various firm structures did find that there were significant differences between mutual companies (where ownership and management are blended) and stock companies (where they are separate), and that stock companies tended toward higher levels of risk than mutual companies. This lends support to the theoretical foundations that suggest a difference in risky behaviors based on alignment of interests. Furthermore, studies of separation of ownership and control and its effect on financial performance have become more nuanced. For example, a study of French firms from 2000 to 2006 found that the amount of diversification pursued by CEOs was high when there were high free cash flows and a shared CEO/Chairman role (Castañer & Kavadis, 2013). However, the study also found that these conditions did not necessarily occur at low levels of cash flow. Thus, there is not a simple relationship between separation of ownership and control and financial performance, as suggested by earlier studies. Instead, the relationship is more complex. Nonetheless, this separation still forms the basis for the role of the professional CEO.

LEADERSHIP AND GROUP ORGANIZATION

While separation of ownership and control provides a basis for the role of the CEO, it does not explain what the CEO’s role actually is. The role of the CEO can be found in leadership theory. Leadership can be defined as “a process whereby an individual influences a group of individuals to achieve a common goal (Northouse, 2010, p.3).” This definition has a number of distinct implications. First, that leadership is a process rather than a trait means that it is a mutual series of influencing actions, rather than an innate capability (Northouse, 2010). Second, leadership requires a group, or more than one person who are devoted to achieving a particular goal (Northouse, 2010). Third, the goal of the group must be shared, that is the group must have at least some consensus on what the goal is (whether formal or informal) in order to allow the leader to direct the group. Finally, there is influence involved in leadership; that is, the leader must be able to convince members of the group to follow his or her lead toward a given goal (Northouse, 2010). This definition provides the basis for understanding what is the role of the CEO.

The question of influence is something that requires more explanation, because it is not clear where this influence may come from. One of the most commonly used frameworks for understanding the sources of power is the five forms of power framework, which was initially proposed by French and Raven (1959) (Daft, 2008). This framework suggests there are five distinct sources of power that leaders and followers use to influence each other, including:
• Legitimate power – the power of the individual within the formal organizational hierarchy;
• Coercive power – the power to force another individual to do something through the threat of formal or informal sanctions;
• Reward power – the power to convince another individual to do something with the promise of rewards (such as pay incentives or promotions);
• Referent power - the power an individual has to influence another based on personal position, such as social position or esteem; and
• Expert power – the power the individual has to influence another based on perceptions that the individual is an expert or holds specialist knowledge in a particular field (Daft, 2008).

Of these five forms of power, the first three can be considered to be formal (or obtained through the position in the organization), while the last two can be considered to be informal (obtained based on who or what an individual is, regardless of position within the organization) (Daft, 2008). A sixth form of power, informational power, was later added to the set of five above (Forsyth, 2010). Informational power is a third informal form of power, based on how well the individual can influence another through the effective use of information and argument (Forsyth, 2010).

The reasons for using the leadership role are various. First, the leadership role is intended to accomplish the goals of the group or organization (Northouse, 2010). By implication, in the modern firm these goals should be aligned with the interests of the owners of the firm (Hall, 2008). In other words, the leadership role is a strategic role. However, the leadership role is also directed to followers and their development in many cases (particularly modern transformational leadership) (Daft, 2008). This means that in addition to the responsibilities to the owners of the firm, the CEO’s leadership role also implies responsibilities to employees and others that accept his or her leadership. In some cases, however, leadership may not be directed to the best interests of the group, but may instead be directed toward achieving the goals of the leader (Northouse, 2010). This type of leadership often falls under charismatic leadership, where it is the personal power of the leader, rather than the goals of the organization, that are achieved (Northouse, 2010). This suggests that the leadership role of the CEO cannot be taken as a wholly benign role, as it does offer opportunities for misuse. One notorious example of the misuse of leadership was that of Enron, the American energy company that collapsed due to routine misdealing that was encouraged and promoted by the firm’s management team (Eichenwald, 2005). This case demonstrates that the simple use of leadership is not sufficient to ensure that the organization’s CEO will be successful in the role of improving performance within the firm. This issue will be explored in more detail below.

THE BASE OF THE CEO’S ROLE

Based on the two theories above, we can state that there is a specific basis for the role of the CEO in the organization. First, the CEO is appointed based on the separation of ownership and control, and (theoretically) has compensation that aligns his or her interests with the owners of the firm. This is intended to achieve the interests of the firm’s owners without inducing a group management crisis. Second, the CEO uses leadership mechanisms (directed influence) to direct the group toward achieving its goals. The discussion below examines exactly how the CEO does this, using the bases of formal and informal power described above. The three areas of CEO responsibility that are explored include creation of vision and goals for the organization, executive management in order to direct the firm toward achieving these goals, and creation of controls and accountability to ensure that goals are achieved.

DISTINGUISHING BETWEEN MANAGEMENT AND LEADERSHIP

Leadership in a corporation should be distinguished from Management. John P. Kotter, writing in an article on “What Leaders Do” in the Harvard Business Review (Kotter 2010) stated:
“Management is about coping with complexity. Its practices and procedures are largely a response to one of the most significant developments of the twentieth century: the emergence of large organizations. Without good management, complex enterprises tend to become chaotic in ways that threaten their very existence. Good management brings a degree of order and consistency to key dimensions like the quality and profitability of products.

Leadership, by contrast, is about coping with change. Part of the reason it has become so important in recent years is that the business world has become more competitive and more volatile... The net result is that doing what was done yesterday, or doing it 5 percent better, is no longer a formula for success. Major changes are more and more necessary to survive and compete effectively in this new environment. More change always demands more leadership.”

Organizations need both strong leadership and strong management for optimal effectiveness. Leaders can challenge the status quo, create visions of the future and inspire members of the organization to want to achieve the vision and mission of the organization. Managers can formulate detailed plans, create efficient organizational structures and oversee day to day operations of the organization. (Robbins and Judge, 2013, p. 368). The CEO of an organization may be able to function in both capacities.

CREATION OF THE VISION AND THE GOALS

“Where there is no vision, the people perish” (Proverbs 29: 18). The first and most important task of the CEO is to act as a visionary leader, or one that creates a vision and a set of goals for the firm to achieve (Northouse, 2010). As noted above, the shared goals of the organization are the foundation of leadership, since it is these goals that are inherent in group formation and provide the basis for leadership influence (Forsyth, 2010). Typically, the goals of the organization are based on the strategic interests of its principals (in the case of the corporation, its owners) (Furrer, 2010). The goals of the organization describe specific achievements that should be met in order to achieve the vision of the organization (Furrer, 2010). The vision of the organization is also a strategic statement, but one that focuses on the desired end state of the organization following completion of the corporate strategy (Furrer, 2010). Thus, the CEO must first determine the desired end state of the organization (the vision), then identify strategic goals that will help achieve this end state.

A case study of Lee Ji-Song, a Korean CEO who managed a major merger between two Korean public corporations, showcases the importance of visionary leadership (Hahm et al., 2013). In this case, Ji-Song was instrumental in setting the vision and goals for the newly merged corporation, which was rated as one of the most important factors in the success of his leadership (Hahm et al., 2013). The vision and goals set by Ji-Song helped in two distinct ways. First, they helped the members of the newly merged organization come to terms with the new organizational structure and identify a direction and purpose for the organization. Second, they helped knit together the new organization and create a shared culture, in effect creating a single group from what had been two groups (Hahm et al., 2013). The use of visionary leadership and the development of a new vision was significantly and positively related to perceptions of managerial capital within the firm (along with perceptions of management skill in personnel and organizational management) (Hahm et al., 2013). Thus, by employing visionary leadership and creating a shared vision and set of goals for the organization, Ji-Song improved the group’s cohesion and ability to deal with its new direction, as well as cementing his own personal position. This serves as a valuable demonstration for the power of visionary leadership as well as the importance of the CEO in setting the vision and goals of the organization.

The type of visionary leadership required may vary depending on the firm. One example of this difference is found in a study of high-technology firms (Makri & Scandura, 2010). In this study, the authors used visionary leadership as one of the components in the construction of creative leadership, which they found to be particularly important in spurring innovation. Creative leadership implies that the
visions that need to be set by the CEO, at least for some firms, do not only extend to dry statements about financial position or market penetration. Instead, creative visionary leadership demands that the vision of the firm should include ideas about creativity, innovation, and development of ideas and people in order to be effective (Makri & Scandura, 2010). By expanding the definition of visionary leadership to integrate creativity and innovation into the firm’s definition, this study shows that it is important to not just consider the financial strategic goals of the firm, but also its nonfinancial strategic goals. This position is at the heart of many leadership norms, such as transformational leadership, which focus as much on internal development of the organization and its members as they do on financial development (Daft, 2008). However, it is also important to keep in mind that innovation and creativity are the key to financial effectiveness for high-technology firms (Makri & Scandura, 2010). Thus, while serving internal purposes by setting creative visions, the creative leader of the high-technology firm also serves the ownership interests by promoting activities that will improve financial outcomes.

It should be noted that CEOs do not set the vision and goals of the organization in a vacuum, but instead need to take into account other factors that influence their use. For example, the CEO has to work in conjunction with the rest of the management team, and in order to be most effective should have similar assessments of goal importance to make these partnerships effective (Colbert et al., 2008). Colbert et al. (2008) studied CEOs and Vice Presidents (VPs) in order to determine how goal importance congruence, or similar assessment of goal importance, influenced the ability of the CEO to use transformational leadership to achieve goals. They found that the more consistent assessment of goal importance was between the CEO and the VPs, the more effective leadership toward achieving these goals would be (Colbert et al., 2008). A second study that was conducted in hospitals also found that there were significant influences from the hospital board on strategic goal setting by the CEO (Ford-Eickhoff et al., 2011). The hospital board’s influence varied depending on the board’s makeup (including insider and outsider makeup as well as level of expertise), but it was clear that there was an influence of the board on identifying and prioritizing internal and external goals for the hospital (Ford-Eickhoff et al., 2011). CEOs may also need to deal with differing opinions regarding the strategic vision and goals of the organization within the management and employee groups of the organization, and can face considerable resistance in this area (Mullins, 2007). Thus, while one of the CEO’s roles is to set strategic goals, this is not something that can be done unilaterally. Ultimately, the Board of Directors is legally responsible in many countries for establishing or at least formally approving the major strategies that are to be adopted by the corporation.

The new CEO of Ford Motor Company, Alan Mulally, was recruited to transform Ford’s culture and return the company to profitability after years of accelerating decline and a severe economic downturn. Mulally was brought to Ford by the Board of Directors after the then CEO, Bill Ford, who was the great grandson of Henry Ford, concluded that an insider could no longer fix Ford. Bill Ford remained as Chairperson of the Board but Mulally was brought in as the new CEO to transform the company which at the time was losing from $3,000 to $5,000 on every car it sold. Mulally’s experience was at Boeing and did not include any experience in the automotive industry. Mulally has succeeded so far as leader in moving Ford’s more than 300,000 employees to change their culture so as to begin making cars again with a profit on every car sold. Ford turned down aid from the Federal Government in the United States to keep its independence even though major competitors General Motors and Chrysler received such aid to help their turnarounds. The turnaround at Ford has been successful under Mulally’s leadership and Ford has been operating at a profit recently. (Pearce and Robinson, 2013).

Passion is often an important virtue in a CEO today. When Steve Jobs returned to Apple as CEO after a twelve year absence, when the company was close to bankruptcy, he said, as quoted by Carmine Gallo, 2011):

“Marketing is about values. This is a very complicated world. It’s a very noisy world. We’re not going to get a chance for people to remember a lot about us. No company is. So we have to be really clear about what they want them to know about us. Our customers want to know what we stand for. What we’re about is not making
boxes for people to get their jobs done. Although we do that very well. Apple is about more than that. We believe that people with passion can change the world for the better. That’s what we believe.”

Jobs revitalized Apple and his leadership of the company made Apple one of the most important companies in providing innovative new products in the industries Apple served during the time of his leadership.

Trait theories are sometimes used to consider personal qualities and characteristics that differentiate leaders from nonleaders. For example, Indra Nooyi is the CEO and Chairperson of PepsiCo, one of the largest food and beverage firms in the world. She is described as funloving, sociable, agreeable, conscientious, emotionally stable and open to experiences. Trait theorists would claim that her personality traits have contributed to her job performance and career success. (Robbins and Judge, 2013, p.369). Some CEOs who have certain traits and who display the right behaviors may still fail as leaders. As important as traits and behaviors are to identifying effective or ineffective CEOs as leaders, they do not guarantee success. This paper has discussed the importance of the process in achieving success as a CEO. The context may matter also. (Robbins and Judge 2013, p.372).

In summary, one of the most important roles of the CEO is to act as a visionary leader and ordinarily recommend to the Board of Directors the vision and goals of the organization. This can be an important factor in the performance of the organization. However, these goals are not set in a vacuum, and the CEO must also take into account the positions of other managers and stakeholder groups including the need for formal approval of the goals and major strategies by the Board of Directors in order to motivate the group effectively. Essentially, the CEO needs to crystallize the goals of the group in order to allow for effective direction, rather than creating new goals, which may be considered to be inappropriate by the group (Forsyth, 2010).

EXECUTIVE MANAGEMENT

While visionary leadership is highly important for the CEO, it is not sufficient to direct the organization toward its goals. The CEO must also engage in executive management or strategic management in order to obtain these goals (Mullins, 2007). Strategic management can be defined as “a process, directed by top management, to determine the fundamental aims or goals of the organization, and to ensure a range of decisions which will allow for the achievement of these aims or goals in the long term, while providing for adaptive responses in the shorter term (Cole, 2003, p.162).” This definition of strategic management encompasses the previous discussion, which we have classified under visionary leadership. In this section, the processes of executive decision-making and adaptation of goals is discussed, as it comprises the second element of decision making that the CEO (and his or her immediate reporting managers at the executive level) are accountable for (Cole, 2003). Some of the associated tasks within this category include establishing decision-making and delegation mechanisms, environmental scanning and assessment (internal and external), setting and communicating objectives associated with goals, implementing strategy through management, managing change in the organization, and revising goals, objectives, and mechanisms when required in order to obtain effective results (Cole, 2003). It is this set of processes that we will term executive management, which is the second important role of the CEO. However, as with other areas there are conflicts and ambiguities about how the CEO should engage with these processes and how important their influence is.

A particularly important element of strategic management for the CEO is managing change (Choi et al., 2011). Choi et al. (2011) studied a major merger of two Swedish hospitals in order to demonstrate the role of the top management including the CEO in change management. However, their findings were not necessarily supportive of a traditional viewpoint on change within the organization. Traditional organizational change models typically assume that change management is top-down and directed, and that CEOs and other change agents can control the outcomes of change through rigorous assessment of organizational needs and other approaches (Leban & Stone, 2008). This traditional model gives the CEO
a substantial amount of responsibility for change, including setting the change agenda, ensuring that it is
executed, and correcting issues when they occur (Leban & Stone, 2008). However, Choi et al. (2011) did
not find that the role of the CEO and top management was that extensive. Instead, they found that there
were two key roles for the CEO, including initiating the change process (including setting goals) and “to
take the role of scapegoat due to inherent factors in the change process (Choi et al., 2011, p.11).” This
study suggests that while the CEO does play an important role in the change process, it is not as extensive
as previously thought, and particularly the CEO may have limited influence during the operational phase
of change.

As with setting strategic goals, strategic decision making and executive management is dependent on
external factors. One of these external factors is the need for strategic risk management, or control of the
extent and impact of potential unexpected negative outcomes on the firm’s operations (Fraser et al.,
2009). Strategic risks are those that impact on the firm’s ability to meet its strategic goals, as well as those
that are associated with the strategic goals themselves. As an example, Fraser et al. (2009) note that many
of the firms listed on NYSE suffered from the economic crisis in 2007-2008 because of inadequate risk
management in risky strategies. Thus, when undertaking the strategic decision making process associated
with the firm’s goals, the CEO of the firm needs to take into account the potential risks involved in these
strategic goals. These also need to be accounted for when forecasting the firm’s strategic outcomes in
order to prevent inappropriate projection of results (Fraser et al., 2009). While the CEO is not directly
responsible for all of this risk analysis (at least when there is an appropriate decision making framework
in place that delegates responsibility to parties with appropriate skills and experience (Cole, 2003)), it is a
factor that needs to be taken into account when undertaking executive management tasks.

Executive management is not just directed to the external performance indicators of the firm. Instead,
there are also internal concerns, like innovation and employee development, that need to be taken into
account in order to achieve organizational goals (Furrer, 2010). One example is the direction of
transformational leadership toward employees (Daft, 2008). Transformational leadership is directed in a
dyadic relationship between leaders and followers, and involves the development of intellectual
stimulation, individualized consideration, inspirational motivation, and idealized influence (Bass &
Riggio, 2012). Transformational leadership is directed to achieving organizational goals through long-
term development of people within the firm, as well as relationships between leaders and followers (Bass
& Riggio, 2012). This is also consistent with the importance of employee development in the model of
creative leadership, and with the development of innovation in high-technology firms (Makri & Scandura,
2010). Thus, the development of internal conditions, including culture and human resources, is also an
important aspect of executive management in the firm for the CEO.

Finally, executive management is key to the success of the firm because executive managers –
particularly, but not only, the CEO – are tasked with control of management and ultimate decision making
for large-scale decisions (England & Stewart, 2007). This means that the CEO and other top managers
have a direct role in determining what policies and practices are adapted within the firm and what
priorities are implemented. One example is the adoption of IT innovation in health services firms, which
is directly based on the prioritization of these innovations in the top management of the firm (England &
Stewart, 2007). Given that adoption of IT innovations are directly connected to the market effectiveness
of the firm (England & Stewart, 2007), it is clear that the CEO will have an influence on the effectiveness
of goal implementation of the firm.

In summary, the second role of the CEO is executive management, or identifying strategic objectives
and finding ways to execute them. This includes developing a strategic decision making strategy and
priorities and the development of prioritization practices as well as management of change. Use of
transformational leadership and focus on internal concerns like employee development is also part of this
practice. However, in this case as in others, there is some ambiguity about the extent of the CEO’s role
and how effective he or she can be in maintaining full control of the change process.
MANAGEMENT CONTROL AND ACCOUNTABILITY

The third key role of the CEO is establishing systems of management control and accountability in order to ensure that the firm’s goals and strategic objectives are accomplished. Management control is defined in a number of ways, but a loose definition is that it refers to the establishment and use of systems that can monitor the performance of the firm in terms of key objectives and adjust operations in order to better achieve these objectives (Macintosh & Quattrone, 2010). There are a number of different types of management controls that may be used in the organization. For example, the firm almost certainly uses accounting controls, or systems that determine what expenses are justified, how they are accounted for, and so on (Macintosh & Quattrone, 2010). Another form of management control that most firms use is performance management, or practices designed to control the performance of individuals, teams, and other units in order to achieve the maximum possible outcomes (Macintosh & Quattrone, 2010). Management control systems (MCS) may be used in order to assist managers with setting, tracking, and communicating the performance of the firm in terms of defined goals (Macintosh & Quattrone, 2010). However, while an IT system may be used to track and communicate management controls, the CEO still bears the ultimate responsibility for establishing control systems and monitoring performance of these goals.

There are various categories of influence of management control established within the academic literature that are helpful in outlining the role of the CEO in this area (Berry et al., 2009). One of the main points that are found in theoretical discussions and empirical studies is that control systems within the firm should be strategic in nature; that is, they should focus on the long-term strategic goals and vision of the firm (Berry et al., 2009). This means that the CEO’s role in establishing management control is dependent on the other two areas of responsibility that are identified (setting vision and goals and using management techniques to obtain them). Another implication of the literature is that management control is largely about risk and performance. Specifically, management control is focused on performance (of people, systems, and groups), as well as control of risk (avoidance of excessive loss through internal actions) (Berry et al., 2009). Of course, not all risk can be eliminated since some risk is systematic, or endemic to the market the firm is operating in (Clarke, 2007). A further consideration is that management controls have implication for the organization’s culture, or set of norms and practices that are accepted within the firm (Berry et al., 2009). This implies that the implementation of management controls is not just a process-based set of tools, but is part of the establishment of group norms and culture that the firm must deal with (Berry et al., 2009).

The consequences of failing to establish appropriate management controls can be devastating for the firm. For example, some of the highly publicized corporate scandals of the early 2000s, such as Enron and WorldCom, were partly attributable to the failure to establish and enforce appropriate systems of management control around accounting and performance (Raelin, 2011). However, it is not just the failure to establish controls at all that could be problematic in the firm’s performance – inappropriate controls could also be implicated in performance failures. For example, Enron’s human resources management controls were designed so that those employees falling into the lowest-performing band of employees were dismissed each year following performance reviews (Eichenwald, 2005). This provided a negative incentive that encouraged the use of inappropriate selling tactics in order to improve performance in the short term (Eichenwald, 2005). This is an example of the type of inappropriate economic incentives provided by the principal-agent problem discussed above, but on a smaller scale (with the employee acting as the agent and the firm as the principal). Thus, it is the CEO’s responsibility not just to implement some management controls, but instead to implement management controls that provide appropriate incentives for the desired behavior.

Ultimately, the implementation of management controls reflects on the CEO’s accountability for the performance of the firm. This has been intimated earlier, in studies of the CEO role in change management (Choi et al., 2011). However, it is also a direct consequence of the structure of corporate governance that is used in public corporations, where the CEO is ultimately the manager with the most formal power within the firm and with authority to set goals and direct operations to achieve them.
(Clarke, 2007). The CEO is often assigned both management and ownership interests through the use of compensation that emphasizes both areas of control (Hall, 2008). This means that there is a need for the CEO to appropriately take control of the firm and to direct it in order to achieve the group’s goals.

In summary, the establishment and enforcement of management controls within the firm is the final responsibility of the CEO, and the one that is most directly reflective of the CEO’s accountability for the actions of the firm. Management controls allow the CEO and other top managers to monitor and direct the firm toward its goals, as well as ensure appropriate actions are taken within the firm. Thus, this final responsibility of the CEO is perhaps the most important.

CONCLUSION

This analysis has shown that the CEO has a specific function in leading and organizing the group. This role begins with identifying the appropriate vision and mission for the organization, although sometimes this is set directly by the Board of Directors usually but not always with the participation of the CEO. It then extends to the executive management role, which involves managing and developing the organization in response to the vision and mission that has been set. Finally, the CEO has a vital role in control of the firm, directing it toward the appropriate direction. These tasks are not based on the personal interests of the CEO, but are instead based on the interests of the firm’s ownership. This holds whether the ownership of the firm is private or public. It is based on the principle of separation of economic ownership and management, and is intended to provide direction for what would otherwise be a self-directed and self-interested group. Of course, the CEO’s role does not always conform to the theoretical position, and there have been many cases where the CEO’s role in the firm has been self-interested rather than ownership-interested. It is also the case that the vision of the CEO does not always effectively motivate, organize, direct, and control the firm’s operations, which can lead to organizational tensions and even business failure. However, this does not mean that the theoretical role is not of interest. Instead, it merely suggests that the organizing and directing role of the CEO may not always be effective. This means that there is a strong argument for the use of stronger development of CEO skills training and more focus on the executive management role within the firm. The CEO function is likely to continue to be important as long as the current corporate structure is popular in corporate management.

REFERENCES


Anthropology of Leadership: An Integrative Approach to Intercultural Leadership in Armenia

Petros G. Malakyan
Indiana Wesleyan University

Cultural Anthropology provides a framework for delineating, understanding, and interpreting leadership behaviors across the great cultural divides. Since cultural variations endorse different leadership behaviors (House, 2004), attempts have been made to understand the contemporary Armenian leadership behavior, whether or not a co-relation exists between the Armenian cultural characteristics and leadership styles. To test this anthropological premise, first, I have studied current cultural characteristics and leadership styles and their relationships in the Armenian cultural context. Second, in light of the research findings, I have tried to predict leadership behaviors as a result of shifts of cultural characteristics and leadership styles for current Church, National, and Democratic leadership models in Armenia. Third, I made recommendations for culturally relevant and integrative approaches to intercultural leadership, known as interculturation, for the country to face the challenges of the 21st century globalized world.

INTRODUCTION

The anthropological knowledge is believed to be an important factor in understanding and interpreting leadership behaviors across cultures. To know how the culture affects one’s behavior would be constructive to all parties involved (House, 2004: 7). For this paper, the independent conceptual variables are (1) leadership styles (2) cultural characteristics and (3) leadership models to be observed and studied in the context of the Armenian culture in the Republic of Armenia.

Five historical and contemporary leadership models have been acknowledged in Armenia in the preceding research: Monarchic, Church, National, Communist, and Democratic Leadership models (Malakyan, 2012a). Since Armenian Monarchy and the Communist Leadership models have no place in today’s Armenian society, this paper will focus primarily on Church, National, and Democratic Leadership.

The Anthropological findings on current Armenian cultural characteristics have been studied with Lewin’s leadership styles in order (1) to understand and perhaps predict leadership behaviors for current Armenian Church, National, and Democratic leaders and (2) recommend an integrative and interculturally relevant leadership style for the 21st century Armenia.

Purpose

The purpose of this study is to understand and interpret the contemporary Armenian leadership behaviors in the context of the Armenian cultural characteristics and leadership styles and recommend contextually relevant intercultural leadership styles for the 21st century Armenia. The result of this study
may lay a ground for similar studies of cultures to understand, interpret, and perhaps be able to predict the leadership and followership behaviors and styles in a given cultural context. Thus, if the leadership behaviors are the byproduct of cultural characteristics and leadership styles, then by studying cultures one may be able to pre-determine leadership behaviors and be able to recommend culturally most relevant and effective leadership styles.

**Objectives**

The research objectives are four-fold:

1. **Anthropological**: To understand current Armenian leadership styles in light of eleven cultural characteristics and learn about current cultural changes in Armenia.
2. **Leadership Studies**: To assess the leadership behaviors of contemporary Armenian leaders in light of Lewin’s three leadership styles.
3. **Leadership Behavior**: First, to understand and interpret Armenian Leadership behaviors from the perspectives of cultural characteristics and leadership styles, whether or not contain cultural characteristics endorse certain leadership styles in Armenia. Second, compare and contrast the results of the historiographical, anthropological, and behavioral findings of the previous study (Malakyan, 2012b) with that of current ethnographic research for validation.
4. **Intercultural**: Based on current Armenian cultural characteristics and leadership models, recommend integrative and interculturally competent leadership styles for Armenia to face the challenges of the 21st century by applying acculturation, differentiation, and original synthesis known as interculturation (Clanet, 1990, p. 70; Berry, Segall & Kagitcibasi, 1997).

**Conceptual Frameworks**

For this paper, three independent variables are used as conceptual frameworks:

1. **Anthropological**: Common intercultural themes and cultural characteristics, observed among 60+ nations and ethnic groups, that distinguish one culture from another, are used as an anthropological conceptual framework (Doob, 1988; Hofstede, 2001, 2002, 2010; Lewis, 2006): individualism vs. collectivism, relationship vs. task behaviors, masculinity vs. femininity, high power vs. low power distance, long- vs. short-term orientation, high uncertainty avoidance vs. low uncertainty avoidance, self-determination vs. fatalism, and the concept of time.
2. **Leadership styles**: The University of Iowa Studies’ (Kurt Lewin, 1939) three major leadership styles are used (autocratic or directive, democratic or participative, and laissez-faire or delegative) to assess current leadership styles among Armenian leaders.
3. **Leadership models in Armenia**: Anthropological and historiographical findings from the previous studies entitled “Leadership Models in Armenia: Historical and Contemporary Perspectives” (Malakyan, 2012a) and “Anthropology of Leadership: An Armenian Perspective” (Malakyan, 2012b) on historical and contemporary leadership models in Armenia (Armenian Monarchy, Church, National, Communist, and Democratic Leadership) in the context of the Armenian culture are used to compare and contrast them with the findings of this study.
4. **Interculturation**: To be able to offer a culturally relevant and yet interculturally applicable integrative leadership style for the 21st century Armenia, the theory of interculturation is used in Recommendation (Clanet, 1990; Berry, Segall & Kagitcibasi, 1997).

**Research Questions**

One of the unanswered research questions posed by the GLOBE research project, will serve as an overarching research question for leadership in Armenia: “To what extent will leadership styles vary in accordance with culturally specific values and expectations?” (House, 2004: 9). To be able to answer the above question, the following sub-questions are raised for this study:

1. What are the current cultural characteristics of the Armenian culture in Armenia?
2. What are the current Armenian leadership styles in Armenia?
3. What are the relationships between Armenian cultural characteristics and leadership styles?
Can leadership behaviors be predicted as a result of shifts of cultural characteristics and leadership styles for current Church, National, and Democratic leadership in Armenia?

What are the most culturally relevant and intercultural applicable leadership styles in Armenia for the country to face the challenges of the 21st century globalized world?

Research Design and Method

The qualitative and quantitative data collection and analysis method is used to learn about Armenian cultural characteristics and current leadership styles. The anthropological method of ethnographic research is employed to distinguish Armenian cultural characteristics, by utilizing two approaches: emic and etic. With the emic approach, I tried to observe the Armenian cultural characteristics and leadership styles through my own thirty-five years of experience as a native Armenian, an insider to the Armenian culture. With the etic approach, I tried to understand and interpret the Armenian cultural characteristics and leadership styles as an expatriate, an outsider to the Armenian culture, through ongoing visits, interactions, participant observations, interviews, and survey questionnaire.

Sample

The sample size for the cultural context of the Republic of Armenia, for nearly three million populations, was 484 participants:
- 351 participants of online survey
- Eleven in-depth face-to-face interviews of positional leaders in Armenia
- Five focus group observations with total participation of 122.

Procedure

A) An online questionnaire has been distributed among Armenians born in Armenia, who either currently live or have lived in Armenia. 351 randomly selected volunteer individuals responded to the survey questionnaire ages from 18 to 60 or older.

B) 11 volunteer leaders, who occupy leadership positions in the government, public, and church, sectors.

C) By using the etic approach of participant observation, I have observed five different groups in different cultural contexts on how members interacted, communicated, discussed, made decisions, worked, studied, traveled, ate and socialized during the course of two hours up to three-day time observation time-frame: (a) recreation, travels, meals, and socializing (25 participants), (b) classroom (7 participants), (c) discussion groups (15 participants), (d) organizational board meetings (5 participants), and (e) formal gathering (70 participants) with total participation of 122.

Instrument

For the online survey, the questionnaire in Appendix I was used. The instrument, particularly the composed questions, follows Doob, Hofstede, and Lewis’ cultural construct and research categories for cultural differences as well as Lewin’s three classifications of leadership styles. In-depth interviews were conducted around the same themes of eleven cultural characteristics and three leadership styles used in the questionnaire. During the participant observation sessions with five focus groups, the same themes served as a mental guide for assessment of relationships and leadership and/or followership situations.

Method

To understand current Armenian cultural characteristics, I have employed three methods of data collection: quantitative, qualitative, and focus group observations. The etic perspective was used for gathering the data from all three methods, while emic approach served as an interpretation instrument for data analysis.

Quantitative data. By using the etic approach, I conducted a survey for the population in the Republic of Armenia. 351 participants took the online survey from May to July 2012. Participants who responded to the survey 75.8% were female and 24.2% male. More than half of the participants were ages between
18-29, and ages 30-40 were nearly 30%. Less than 10% were mid-age adults from ages 50-60. Only 5% respondents were ages 60 and above.

Qualitative data. Eleven positional leaders in Armenia participated in in-depth face-to-face interviews. 54.5% were female and 45.5% - male. More than half of the participants were ages between 50-60 and the remaining were ages 30-40s.

Focus group Observations. Out of 122 participants observed, more than 60% were ages 18-30. Nearly 30% were ages 30 and higher, while ages 50 and higher were not more than 10%. Nearly 60% participants were female. 1

By using the emic approach to data analysis and interpretation, I have compared and contrasted the current data with that of historiographical data observed in the previous study (Malakyan, 2012a).

Delimitation

This study is limited to the eleven cultural characteristics and three leadership styles presented above to observe the behaviors of current Armenian leaders. The studies are limited to Armenians living or have lived in the Republic of Armenia. The Diaspora Armenians are not included in the study. Furthermore, a thorough study of the Armenian culture, other cultural characteristics and leadership styles not listed above and yet identified in literature, is beyond the scope of this study.

EMPIRICAL FINDINGS

In this section, I report the results of my findings about the Armenian culture. I also summarize below the results of the previous studies on the leadership models and styles among historical and contemporary leaders in Armenia.

Current Armenian Cultural Characteristics

The data below under each cultural characteristic signifies the outcomes of quantitative, qualitative, and focus group observation methods.

Individualism vs. Collectivism

The quantitative data shows that 52.5% participants observe the Armenian culture to be collectivistic. 26.2% believe Armenians are individualistic, while 21.3% were not sure. The qualitative data shows that 81.8% participants consider the Armenian culture to be individualistic, while only 18.2% thought that Armenians were collectivistic. Through the focus group observations, I have observed the Armenians to be independent thinkers with strong family and kinship ties. They seemed more collectivistic in social activities while demonstrating strong individualistic tendencies in work and school settings. My observations seem to align with the findings of the quantitative data among young adults.

Relationship vs. Task Orientation

The quantitative data indicates that 36.9% participants perceive the Armenian cultural behavior to be relational, while 39.5% believe that Armenians are more task-oriented culture. On the other hand, 23.6% participants were not sure. The qualitative data shows that 63.6% vs. 36.4% believe that the Armenian culture is more relationship-oriented. Through the focus group observations, it seems convincing that the Armenian young adults are more task-oriented (quantitative data), while the older generation (ages 50 and higher) seem more relationship-oriented (qualitative data).

Masculinity vs. Femininity

The quantitative data reports that the Armenian culture is predominately masculine (54.2% vs. 26.8%). Only 19% were not sure. The qualitative data reports similar results. Majority believes that the Armenian culture is masculine (81.8% vs. 18.2%). From the focus group observations, I have witnessed clear distinctions and separations between male and female roles in the society in teacher-students.
interactions, leader-follower relationships, during socialization processes such as female preparing the food, while male taking upon themselves more physically hard tasks.

High Power vs. Low Power Distance

According to both quantitative and qualitative data findings, the survey participants with 52.4% along with 72.7% interviewees agree that the Armenian culture is a high power distance. 25.4% survey participants chose low power distance and 22.2% were undecided. On the other hand, only 18% interviewees thought that they were low power distance culture. Less than 1% participants were undecided. Moreover, during my focus group interactions, I have observed high power distance behavior nearly in all sectors of the society.

Long- vs. Short-Term Orientation

The quantitative data shows that 38.7% participants consider the Armenian culture a long-term oriented (LTO), while 36.3 believe they are short-term oriented (STO) culture. The 25% of participants are not sure. On the other hand, according to the qualitative data, Armenians are less LTO (27.3%) and more STO (36.6%). Interestingly enough, those who believed that they are both LTO and STO were 36.1%. As for the focus group observation results, from my numerous conversations and interactions, it was evident that both the younger and older generations seemed quite balanced in their approach to life between STO (immediate gratifications, consumption, and social spending) and LTO (valuing cultural virtues such as respecting the tradition, and loving education, and being persistent in life goals or career pursuits).

High Uncertainty Avoidance vs. Low Uncertainty Avoidance

The quantitative and qualitative data are in agreement that the Armenian culture is more low uncertainty avoidance culture (HUA). For instance, 42.3% vs. 35.2% survey participants indicate people’s inclinations toward HUA behavior. The undecided participants were 21.6%. Moreover, the qualitative data showed that 85% vs. 15% participants confirm their inclinations toward HUA. However, my focus group observations revealed quite conflicting data as opposed to the above quantitative and qualitative findings. I have learned that the everyday life tends to be more low uncertainty avoidance (LUA) in Armenia (e.g. lack of preventive measures toward illness, accidents, and natural disasters), which is the characteristics of cultures with LUA behavior.

Self-Determination vs. Fatalism

According to the quantitative data, 59.4% participants believe that Armenians are self-deterministic. Only 19.5% see themselves as fatalistic, while 21.1% are not sure. Along with the above findings, the qualitative data reports similar results. 55% participants see themselves self-deterministic, while 45% - fatalistic. As for focus group observations, although Armenians use many fatalistic expressions and seem to acknowledge fate as a part of their history and everyday life, the culture, for the most part continues to remain self-deterministic. The latter shows evidence in people’s decision-making patterns and response to socio-political and economic issues and their constant struggle for personal success.

Concept of Time

The quantitative data indicates that 62% participants consider themselves linear, 38.8% - multi-active, 60.5% cyclic, and 52% back to the future time oriented. Contrary to the above in most counts, the qualitative data indicates that participants perceive themselves as more multi-active (54%) and very less linear (9%). Back to the future view reached to 37%. From the perspective of the focus group observations, I have observed a shift from multi-active to linear time concept among young adults. The latter seem more task-oriented, as seen above, than their previous generations.
Current Armenian Leadership Models

This section represents the summary of findings on the existing Armenian leadership models and styles from the previous studies (Malakyan, 2012a, 2012b). The first historiographical study showed that “Monarchic and Communist continue to exist invisibly in the memories as well as in the behaviors of Armenian leaders today” (Malakyan, 2012a: 27). It also reveals the following:

- The Armenian Church Leadership has been medium individualistic, highly collectivistic, masculine, high power distance.
- The National Leadership has been highly individualistic, masculine, high power distance.
- The Democratic Leadership has been highly individualistic, masculine and somewhat feminine, high power distance.

Current Armenian Leadership Styles

Table 1 below shows the dominant leadership styles observed in three contemporary leadership models in Armenia.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Armenian leadership models</th>
<th>Autocratic leadership style</th>
<th>Democratic leadership style</th>
<th>Willing laissez-faire leadership style</th>
<th>Unwilling laissez-faire leadership style</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Armenian Church Leadership</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Leadership</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democratic Leadership</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is evident that the autocratic leadership style is the dominant style in current models of Armenian leadership, including the most recent model of Democratic Leadership (Libaridian, 1999). Moreover, democratic leadership style has been observed only in the Armenian Church and Democratic Leadership models. The willing laissez-faire leadership style has not been recognized among all three leadership models, while the unwilling laissez-faire leadership style is seen in Armenian National and Democratic Leadership models.

DISCUSSION

This section represents (a) the historical findings of cultural characteristics of the Armenian culture (see Malakyan, 2012b: pp. 13-18), (b) literature on the relationships between cultural constructs and leadership behaviors, and (c) the empirical findings of this research on cultural shifts observed in Armenia, which may result shifts in leadership styles.

Individualism and Collectivism

The historical findings indicate that the Armenian cultural identity is rather complex, since it is a mixture of collectivistic and individualistic mindsets. Nonetheless, the culture seems to have inclination toward individualism when it comes to one’s choice of job or education. In social settings, on the other hand, they demonstrate strong collectivistic tendencies. The empirical research findings show that young adults tend to view themselves as more collectivist, while the older generation believes that they are individualistic. Both research results indicate that individualistic and collectivistic cultural traits are present in the Armenian culture. Thus, it can be concluded that the Armenian culture is shifting from individualistic to collectivistic mindset.
The literature indicates that collectivism is associated with team-oriented, charismatic/value-based, and humane-oriented leadership (House, 2004: 503). Despite the fact that the Armenian culture is both collectivistic (family structure and group loyalty) and individualistic (strong “I” identity and independent thinking), the younger generation is slightly collectivistic in organizational settings. Subsequently, it can be expected that the future Armenian leaders may become less autocratic and more democratic in organizational contexts.

**Relationship and Task Orientations**

The historical findings indicate that the Armenian culture is slightly more relational than tasks. Nonetheless, both relational and task behaviors are present in the Armenian culture. The current research findings, on the other hand, indicate that the Armenian young adults are more task-oriented, while the previous generation showed more relationship-oriented behavior. Thus, it can be concluded that the Armenian culture is shifting from relationship to task behavior.

The literature indicates that in paternalistic cultures, such as Armenia, relationship or humane oriented leaders act as patrons and the society tends to grant higher influence and allows leaders to exercise power and task orientation at work. Furthermore, the research also shows that in relationship-oriented societies leaders’ generosity, compassion, and concern for followers are valued as opposed to self-protective leadership behavior (House, 2004: 596-597). Subsequently, team-oriented, charismatic/value-based leadership behaviors are welcomed. Thus, due to the cultural shift from relationship to task orientation in organizational level among the younger generation, it is expected that the Armenian leadership style may be less humane-oriented and impersonal.

**Masculinity and Femininity**

The historical findings indicate that the Armenian culture, for the most part, has been masculine, despite the fact that feminine traits were introduced and implemented during the Communist era. The current research findings (the quantitative, qualitative, as well as focus group observations) indicate the same outcome, that the Armenian culture has been and continues to be predominately masculine. However, feminine signs are emerging and a minor shift from masculine to feminine behavior has been detected. Thus, it can be concluded that despite the fact that no significant cultural shift is detected in this area, women are becoming more active in today’s social and political life of Armenia than previous generations.

The Armenian social structures and roles of male and female have been shaped and influenced by the masculine theology and ecclesiology of the Armenian Church (e.g. the fatherhood of God, Trinitarian subordination between the Father and the Son, and male priesthood with no exception). In such instances, according to the GLOBE research project, societies manifest gender egalitarianism and develop certain attitude toward social roles of women and men (House, 2004: 386). In case of Armenia, as shown in the historical findings, the culture has been predominately masculine, while the contemporary empirical findings indicate a slight cultural shift from masculinity to femininity. Thus, it can be foreseen more and more overlap and less distinctions between male and female social gender roles. Also, more female leaders are emerging among the future autocratic leaders, which may also lead to a shift from autocratic to more laissez-faire leadership style (House, 2004: 387-388).

**High and Low Power Distances**

The historical findings indicate that, although the Armenian culture went through significant changes during the last two centuries, power distance has been observed nearly in all segments of society beginning Monarchic to Democratic era. The current research findings indicate too that power distance is present nearly in all sectors of the society today. Thus, it can be concluded that no considerable cultural shift can be detected or witnessed in this area.

The Armenian culture is known as a high power distance (HPD) culture for centuries. Both historical and empirical data indicates that the Armenian culture continues to remain HPD culture and no cultural shift is expected. The literature indicates that this dimension is relevant to both Western and Easter
societies. In Western societies, where the Protestantism is more influential than Catholicism, are more low power distance (LPD), while in organizational level the latter continues to be HPD. Moreover, the literature also affirms that societies with male dominations are more HPD and thus positively correlated with self-protective/humane as opposed to charismatic/value-based and participative leadership (House, 2004: 559). Therefore, it can be said that no significant shift from autocratic to democratic or laissez-faire leadership style is anticipated in Armenia in the near future.

Long- and Short-Term Orientations

The historical findings indicate that the Armenian culture historically has been more long-term (LTO) than short-term oriented (STO). However, the Armenian culture went through changes and became more STO in the last 150 years. The current research findings, on the other hand, shows evidence in slight preference toward LTO behavior among young adults as well as a strong tendency to balance LTO and STO behaviors among older generation. Thus, it can be concluded that the Armenian culture shows signs of shift from STO to LTO behavior.

The GLOBE research, on the other hand, asserts that low-income countries with their emerging economies, which show little evidence for Future Orientation practices, have stronger aspiration for Future Orientation due to their consciousness for the need for long-term societal solution (House, 2004: 332). Thus, the empirical evidence for a slight shift from STO to LTO behavior in the Armenian culture may provide reasons or a need for change from autocrat-oligarchic to more autocrat-democratic style of leadership among the future generation of Armenian leaders as being most effective leadership style. Moreover, due to the Armenian Church’s long lasting legacy of being LTO orientated, it is more likely that the church leadership will become more active and more influential in the Armenian society, especially among the younger generation.

High and Low Uncertainty Avoidances

The historical findings indicate that Armenians tend to be more low uncertainty avoidance (LUA) for centuries, which made them less crisis-oriented and unprepared to face political, social, and economic challenges. However, certain institutions, such as the Armenian Church and some social structures during the Communist era, have been high uncertainty avoidance (HUA). The current research findings, however, report quite conflicting data. On the one hand, the quantitative and qualitative data shows that both the younger and older generation see themselves mostly as HUA, while the results of the focus group observations clearly point out LUA tendencies in everyday life of the Armenian society (e.g. lack of preventive measures toward illness, accidents, and natural disasters). Moreover, the younger generation see themselves more LUA than the older generation (35.2% vs. 15%) Thus, it can be concluded that, although both traits have been and are present in the Armenian culture, the influence of Western HUA cultural values seems evident in the Armenian culture.

It has been observed by the GLOBE research program that HUA cultures (e.g. China, Singapore, German-speaking and Scandinavian countries) tend to be more formal and orderly, who formalize processes and procedure, turn the verbal communication into writing. They like to plan and strategize in order to minimize risks. Latin American cultures, on the other hand, demonstrate LUA cultural behavior and have a tendency to be informal and enter into contractual agreements based on the word of trust. They are less concerned for formalized policies or rules (House, 2004: 6). The Armenian culture as indicated earlier contains both elements within different leadership models. Interestingly enough, neither of these cultural behaviors suggests that the leadership style of the above cultures will be democratic. There seem to be no correlation between the high and low uncertainty avoidance and Lewin’s leadership styles. Nevertheless, it is also evident that all three leadership styles can be present or developed among HUA and LUA cultures. Since the Armenian culture is experiencing a cultural shift from LUA to HUA, there seem to be a possibility of developing laissez-faire in combination with autocratic leadership style. For instance, societies who are involved in entrepreneurship and free enterprise are less autocratic or controlling. Instead, they seem to operate from decentralized or laissez-faire leadership style (House, 2004: 645). Thus, it can be said that the laissez-faire style has a potential to be developed and used by the
younger generation of Armenians, who are more HUA than the previous generations. Additionally, due to the Armenian Church’s HUA orientation, the younger generation may lean more toward Church leadership than Democratic leadership. The former possesses more moral authority and respect among followers, than the latter.

**Self-Determination and Fatalism**

The historical findings indicate that, unlike cultures with Hindu fatalistic worldviews, Armenians are more self-determined due to their strive for better life and hope for the future. However, Armenians also show signs of fatalism in socio-political as well as personal life due to dramatic experienced the nation went through in the last two centuries (e.g. Ottoman and Russian dominations, the 1915 Genocide, and the totalitarian Soviet regime). The current research findings, however, indicate that Armenians today, both younger and older generation, continue to remain self-deterministic. Thus, it can be concluded that no substantial cultural shift has been reported or is anticipated in the future in this area.

**The Concept of Time**

The historical findings indicate that Armenians, among the four concepts of time: linear, multi-active, cyclic, and “back to the future,” mostly identify themselves with multi-active and “back to the future” time concept. The current research findings, however, indicate a significant change in the culture. For instance, the data shows a shift from multi-active among older generation (54%) to linear (62%), cyclic (60.5%), and “back to the future” (52%) time concept among young adults. Thus, it can be concluded that the Armenian culture is experiencing a significant shift from multi-active to linear, cyclic, and ‘back to the future.” Armenia’s geographical location in Eurasia seems to make the culture balanced between Western and Eastern worldviews and cultural behaviors.

According the adopted definition of multi-active time, cultures with this orientation tend to be more relationship-oriented as opposed to task and result orientation. People are also highly family and tradition oriented with less time conscious and punctuality (Lewis, 2006: 30, 55; House, 2004: 276). The empirical data for the Armenian culture shows that the multi-actives are less than 40% among the research participants. Thus, due to the cultural shift from multi-active to linear and cyclical time orientation, the relationship-oriented leaders in Armenia may shrink in the future.

According the adopted definition of linear time, cultures with this orientation tend to be more task than relationship-oriented. It is evident from the data that the Armenian culture is shifting from multi-active to linear time orientation. The 62% respondents of the quantitative survey view themselves linear oriented. Thus, a leadership behavioral change is expected among Armenian leader, who demonstrate task oriented behaviors such as valuing education, emphasizing results, taking initiatives, and somewhat less loyal to tradition and seniority (House, 2004: 276). Moreover, according to the GLOBE research project, cultures that are performance oriented may endorse charismatic or value-based and participatory leadership (House, 2004: 278). In other words, by using Lewin’s language of leadership styles, it is expected that the Armenian leaders in the future may continue endorse autocratic leadership style with a strong emphasis on democratic or participatory style of leadership.

Cyclic cultures tend to produce high uncertainty avoidance (HUA) leaders, who view task and relationships in a cyclical paradigm with abundant time for making decisions and taking actions. People with cyclical time orientation are more considerate, and according to the adopted definition, hold a philosophical worldview that revolves around a cyclical concept of life (Lewis, 2006: 57-58). Since the Armenian culture is experiencing a significant shift toward cyclic time orientation (Asian cultural patterns), it can be assumed that future leaders in Armenia may be interculturally more competent than current leaders in their 50s and 60s.

“Back to the future” cultures tend to produce leaders with a sense of past and present with no consideration of future for planning and strategizing. Leaders in those cultures tend to demonstrate fatalistic tendencies, and according to the adopted definition, they may be passive in taking initiative and making decisions (Lewis, 2006: 60-61). Since the empirical data shows that 52% of respondents indicate “back to the future” time orientation, which shows no significant cultural shift, it can be assumed that
future leaders among young adults may continue to demonstrate passive and fatalistic behaviors. At the same time, they may well fit in multicultural contexts of linear, cyclic, and “back to the future” orientations.

Summary
From the historical and contemporary empirical data above, it is evident that (1) the culture is shifting from individualism to collectivism and (2) from relationship to task behaviors, (3) although the culture is predominately masculine, feminine elements are emerging as a sign of a slow move from masculine to feminine behavior, (4) power distance continues to remain high across leadership models, (5) the culture seems shifting from short-term to long-term orientation, and (6) from low LUA to high uncertainty avoidance (HUA), (7) self-determinism continues to remain dominant mindset for Armenians, (8) the culture is less multi-active today than in the past, (9) there seem to be a shift from multi-active to linear time conscience, (10) the cyclical time concept is emerging among Armenians, and finally (11) the culture continues exhibit “back to the future” behavior.

Table 2 below provides a plausibility scale of cultural shift (high, medium, low, yes, no) observed from historical (Malakyan, 2012a) and contemporary empirical findings in light of eleven cultural constructs in the context of contemporary leadership models in Armenia.

| Table 2 | A Plausibility Scale of Cultural Shift in Armenia |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Plausibility for Cultural Shifts: High, Medium, Low, Yes, No, Less, More</th>
<th>Armenian Church Leadership</th>
<th>National Leadership</th>
<th>Democratic Leadership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Individualism/collectivism (I/C)</td>
<td>*H: C CS: from I to C</td>
<td>H: I CS: from I to C</td>
<td>H: I CS: from I to C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Relationship/Task behaviors (R/T)</td>
<td>H: R-T CS: from R to T</td>
<td>H: R-T CS: from R to T</td>
<td>H: R-T CS: from R to T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Long-/short-term orientation (LTO/STO)</td>
<td>H: LTO CS: from STO to LTO</td>
<td>H: STO CS: from STO to LTO</td>
<td>H: STO CS: from STO to LTO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8. Time: multi-active (MA)  
H: yes  
CS: from MA to L  
H: yes  
CS: from MA to L  
H: yes  
CS: from MA to L  

9. Time: linear (L)  
H: less  
CS: more  
H: less  
CS: more  
H: less  
CS: more  

10. Time: cyclic (C)  
H: no  
CS: from MA to C  
H: no  
CS: from MA to C  
H: no  
CS: from MA to C  

11. Time: back to the future (BTF)  
H: yes  
CS: no shift  
H: yes  
CS: no shift  
H: yes  
CS: no shift  

Table 3 below provides a plausibility scale of leadership style shift (high, medium, low, yes, no) between autocratic, democratic, willing laissez-faire and unwilling laissez-faire leadership styles among leaders in Armenia as a result of cultural shifts:

1. Since the Armenian culture is shifting from individualistic to collectivistic mindset, it is highly plausible that the autocratic leadership style may shift to democratic and laissez-faire leadership styles.
2. Since the Armenian culture is shifting from relational to task behavior, it is highly plausible that the autocratic leadership style may shift to democratic and democratic to laissez-faire leadership style.
3. Although the Armenian culture continues to be masculine, feminine elements are emerging in the culture. Thus, it is plausible that the autocratic leadership style may gradually shift to democratic leadership style by tolerating more role shifts between men and women from masculine to feminine.
4. Since power distance continues to remain high across leadership models in Armenia, no leadership style shifts are expected. The autocratic style of leadership most likely will prevail among current generation.
5. Due to cultural shift from short- to log-term orientation (STO to LTO behavior), it is highly plausible that leadership style shift between autocratic and democratic leadership styles, while the laissez-faire leadership style may go through insignificant changes. The Church Leadership, that is the embodiment of LTO behavior, may take a leading role in society.
6. Due to cultural shift from low to high uncertainty avoidance (LUA to HUA behavior), it is highly plausible that leadership styles shift between autocratic, democratic, and laissez-faire to enhance strategic planning, and national developmental plan.
7. Since self-determinism continues to remain dominant mindset for Armenians, no substantial shifts of leadership styles are expected. The self-deterministic mindset will most likely thrive among current generation leaders by fostering the democratization process in Armenia.
8. Due to a significant shifting from multi-active to linear, cyclic, and “back to the future” time concept, it is highly plausible that that leadership styles shift between autocratic, democratic, and laissez-faire to embrace intercultural dialogue, global exchange and multiculturalism.
### TABLE 3
A PLausibility Scale of Leadership Style Shift in Armenia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Plausibility Leadership Style Shifts as a result of the cultural shift: High, Medium, Low, Yes, No, Less, More</th>
<th>Armenian autocratic leadership</th>
<th>Armenian democratic leadership</th>
<th>Armenian willing laissez-faire leadership</th>
<th>Armenian unwilling laissez-faire leadership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Individualism/collectivism (I/C)</td>
<td>CS: from I to C</td>
<td>LSS: high</td>
<td>CS: from I to C</td>
<td>LSS: high</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Relationship/Task behaviors (R/T)</td>
<td>CS: from R to T</td>
<td>*LSS: high</td>
<td>CS: from R to T</td>
<td>LSS: high</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Masculinity/femininity (M/F)</td>
<td>CS: slow from M to F</td>
<td>LSS: low</td>
<td>CS: slow from M to F</td>
<td>LSS: medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Long-/short-term orientation (LTO/STO)</td>
<td>CS: from STO to LTO</td>
<td>LSS: high</td>
<td>CS: from STO to LTO</td>
<td>LSS: high</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. High uncertainty/low uncertainty avoidance (HUA/LUA)</td>
<td>CS: from LUA to HUA</td>
<td>LSS: high</td>
<td>CS: from LUA to HUA</td>
<td>LSS: high</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Time: multi-active (MA)</td>
<td>CS: from MA to L</td>
<td>LSS: high</td>
<td>CS: from MA to L</td>
<td>LSS: high</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Time: cyclic (C)</td>
<td>CS: from MA to C</td>
<td>LSS: yes</td>
<td>CS: from MA to C</td>
<td>LSS: yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*CS – Cultural shift
*LSS – Leadership style shift

Table 4 below provides a summary for the Armenian leadership styles from high to low within the existing Armenian leadership models as a result of historical research findings (Malakyan, 2012b):
1. The leadership style of Armenian Church leadership historically has shown high autocratic, medium democratic, no willing laissez-faire, and high unwilling laissez-faire leadership styles.

2. The leadership style of National leadership has shown predominately high autocratic, medium-low democratic, no willing laissez-faire, and high unwilling laissez-faire leadership styles.

3. The leadership style of Democratic leadership has been high autocratic medium democratic, no willing laissez-faire, and high unwilling laissez-faire.

In conclusion, it is evident that the autocratic leadership style has been dominant in all leadership models in Armenia. The average of democratic leadership style in Armenia has been medium-low. The willing laissez-faire leadership style has been lacking in all leadership styles in Armenia. The unwilling laissez-faire leadership style has been primarily high in all three contemporary leadership styles in Armenia.

**TABLE 4**

**HISTORICAL LEADERSHIP STYLES WITHIN CURRENT LEADERSHIP MODELS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Historical Leadership Styles: High, Medium, Low, Yes, No</th>
<th>Autocratic leadership style</th>
<th>Democratic leadership style</th>
<th>Willing laissez-faire leadership style</th>
<th>Unwilling laissez-faire leadership style</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Armenian Church Leadership</td>
<td>*H: high</td>
<td>H: medium</td>
<td>H: no</td>
<td>H: high</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Leadership</td>
<td>H: high</td>
<td>H: medium-low</td>
<td>H: no</td>
<td>H: high</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democratic Leadership</td>
<td>H: high</td>
<td>H: medium</td>
<td>H: no</td>
<td>H: high</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*H – Historical findings from previous research (Malakyan, 2012b)

**CONCLUSION**

In this paper, attempts have been made to identify and report about the relationships between current cultural characteristics and leadership styles in Armenia. The literature and the result of this research clearly indicates that culture influences leadership behavior in various ways (House, 2004: 711; Harris, 2004: 21). Moreover, the empirical data of this research showed cultural shift in certain areas of the Armenian culture, and as a result, shifts of leadership styles were forecasted for current Church, National, and Democratic leadership in Armenia. It is evident that culture counts, which affects the behaviors of leaders (Harriss, 2004: 3).

**Armenian Church Leadership**

Historically, the Armenian Church has been primarily collectivistic, both relationship and task oriented, masculine, high power distance, long-term oriented, high uncertainty avoidance, predominately self-deterministic, multi-active and “back to the future” time oriented. In terms of leadership style, it has been autocratic, medium democratic, no willing laissez-faire, and high unwilling laissez-faire throughout history. Although the Armenian culture is shifting from individualism to collectivism, from masculinity to femininity, from STO to LTO, from LUA to HUA, from multi-active to linear and cyclic time, while maintaining strong “back to the future” time orientation, it is unlikely that the leadership style of the Armenian Church will experience a significant shift from autocratic to laissez-faire as a result of the cultural shift. However, the cultural shift, specifically a move toward femininity, may cause a slight shift from autocratic to democratic style of leadership among Armenian Church leaders. Thus, due to the cultural shift, it is more likely that the Armenian Church Leadership will demonstrate the following leadership behaviors:
• Collectivism: Hierarchical and less participatory behavior with nearly no delegative empowerment approach.
• Task orientation: Mostly demanding submissiveness and less results oriented behavior. Followers are not trusted to be more self-directive.
• Masculinity: mostly patronizing and assertive behaviors with minimum common achievements.
• High power distance: Superiority, more one-way and less two-way influence. Self-regulating lone-rangers are rear.
• Long-term orientation: Demanding respect for experience but fewer advocacies for long-term benefits. Creative strategizing behaviors are not valued.
• High uncertainty avoidance: Confidence in wisdom and experience, but less effective in minimizing social anxiety. Free and independent prevention behavior is not encouraged.
• Self-determinism: Charismatic leadership and yet lacks advocacy for collective free initiatives. Liberal thinking is somewhat suppressed.
• Time orientation: Dogmatic, organized and structured, playing by rules, and somewhat impractical and fatalistic with less contribution through reflection. Potential for multiculturalism and yet not fully utilized.

Armenian National Leadership
Historically, the Armenian National leadership has been primarily individualistic, both relationship and task oriented, masculine, high power distance, short-term oriented, low uncertainty avoidance, self-deterministic, multi-active, less linear, and “back to the future” time oriented. In terms of leadership style, it has been autocratic, medium-low democratic, no willing laissez-faire, and high unwilling laissez-faire. Since the Armenian culture is shifting from individualism to collectivism, from masculinity to femininity, from STO to LTO, from LUA to HUA, from multi-active to linear and cyclic time, while maintaining strong “back to the future” time orientation, it is more likely that the leadership style of the Armenian National Leadership will experience a significant shift from autocratic to democratic and laissez-faire leadership styles. Thus, due to the cultural shift, it is more likely that the Armenian National Leadership will demonstrate the following leadership behaviors:
• Collectivism: More tribal chieftaincy and less participatory approach to leadership with nearly no delegative and empowerment approach.
• Task orientation: Commanding subordinates and less results oriented behavior for common good. An unwillingness to share tasks and responsibilities. Followers are not trusted to be more self-directive.
• Masculinity: Discriminatory toward women and assertive behaviors with minimum common achievements.
• High power distance: Elitism and show off behavior with less mutuality in influence and relationships. Self-regulating lone-ranger are thread to the status quo.
• Long-term orientation: Totalitarian idealism with advocacy for short-term as opposed to long-term benefits. Creative strategizing behavior is an entitled privilege for the elite.
• High uncertainty avoidance: Pragmatic and yet less effective in minimizing social anxiety. Free and independent prevention behavior is an individual rather than collective phenomena.
• Self-determinism: Prideful directive with somewhat intimidating leadership behavior. Lacking advocacy for collective free enterprises. Liberal thinking is somewhat suppressed.
• Time orientation: Imposing ideas and structures, walking and dancing around the pool, impractical and fatalistic with less contribution through reflection and playing by rules. Potential for multiculturalism and yet not fully utilized.

Armenian Democratic Leadership
Historically, the Armenian National leadership has been primarily individualistic, both relationship and task oriented, primarily masculine, high power distance, short-term oriented, low uncertainty avoidance, self-deterministic and yet somewhat fatalistic, and being more multi-active and “back to the
future” time oriented. In terms of leadership style, it has been medium autocratic, medium democratic, no willing laissez-faire, and high unwilling laissez-faire.

Since the Armenian culture is shifting from individualism to collectivism, from masculinity to femininity, from STO to LTO, from LUA to HUA, from multi-active to linear and cyclic time, while maintaining strong “back to the future” time orientation, it is more likely that the leadership style of the Armenian Democratic Leadership will experience a significant shift from autocratic to democratic and laissez-faire leadership styles. Thus, due to the cultural shift, it is more likely that the Armenian Democratic Leadership will demonstrate the following leadership behaviors:

- Collectivism: More oligarchic and less participatory approach to leadership with hardly delegative or empowerment approach.
- Task orientation: Authoritarian executive with less results oriented behavior for common good. An unwillingness to allow followers be more self-directive.
- Masculinity: Authoritarian assertiveness as opposed to mutual collaboration across genders with minimum common achievements.
- High power distance: Top-down influence with less mutuality in influence and relationships. Self-regulating lone-ranger are thread to the established oligarchy.
- Long-term orientation: Pragmatic totalitarian with no concern for long-term benefits. Creative strategizing behavior is an oligarchic privilege.
- High uncertainty avoidance: Lone-ranger strategist and yet less effective in minimizing social anxiety. Free and independent prevention behavior is an individual rather than collective phenomena.
- Self-determinism: Self-imposed popularity with somewhat indifference toward public opinion. Lacking advocacy for collective free enterprises. Liberal thinking is somewhat ignored.
- Time orientation: Bureaucratic, imposed structures, walking and dancing around the pool, impractical and fatalistic with less contribution through reflection and playing by rules. Potential for multiculturalism and yet not fully utilized.

Table 5 below provides a predictability scale for leadership behavior among contemporary Armenian Church, National, and Democratic leaders in light of eight cultural themes. It is evident that (a) the autocratic leadership style is the dominant style among all three leadership models, (b) the democratic leadership style falls under medium-low range, (c) while the laissez-faire leadership style is non-existence.
### TABLE 5
LEADERSHIP BEHAVIOR PREDICTABILITY SCALE FOR ARMENIAN CHURCH, NATIONAL, AND DEMOCRATIC LEADERSHIP MODELS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Predictable leadership behavior for Church, National, and Democratic Leadership</th>
<th>Autocratic leadership style</th>
<th>Democratic leadership style</th>
<th>Laissez-faire leadership style NON-EXISTENCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Collectivistic** | *C: Hierarchical*  
*N: Tribal chieftaincy*  
*D: Oligarchic* | Participatory | Delegative empowerment |
| **Task orientation** | C: Demanding obedience  
N: Commanding subordinates  
D: Authoritarian executive | Result oriented for common good | Self-directive |
| **Masculinity** | C: Patronizing  
N: Discriminatory  
D: Authoritarian assertive | Mutual collaboration | Common achievements |
| **High power distance** | C: Superiority  
N: Elitism  
D: Top-down influence | Two-way influence | Self-regulating lone-ranger |
| **Long-term orientation** | C: Demanding respect  
N: Totalitarian idealism  
D: Pragmatic totalitarian | Advocating for long-term benefits | Creative strategizing |
| **High uncertainty avoidance** | C: Confident wisdom  
N: Pragmatic  
D: Lone-ranger strategist | Minimizing social anxiety | Free and independent prevention |
| **Self-determinism** | C: Charismatic leadership  
N: Proudful directive  
D: Self-imposed popularity | Advocating for collective free initiatives | Liberal thinking |
| **Time orientation:** linear, cyclical, & back to the future | C: Dogmatic  
- L - organized and structured  
- B to F - Impractical fatalist  
N: Imposing  
- L - organized and structured  
- C - Dancing politician  
- B to F - Impractical fatalist  
D: Bureaucratic  
- L - organized and structured  
- C - Dancing politician  
- B to F - Impractical fatalist | Linear: playing by rules  
Cyclic: Holistic thinking  
Back to the future: contributing through reflection | Existing multicultural skills |

*C – Church Leadership behavior  
*N – National Leadership behavior  
*D – Democratic Leadership behavior
RECOMMENDATION

This paper has addressed historical and contemporary cultural characteristics, and leadership styles among current leadership models in Armenia. Attempts have been made to assess and interpret the relationships between Armenian cultural characteristics and leadership styles and how the latter has been influenced and shaped by the former. Furthermore, the Armenian leadership behavior was predicted on the basis of the empirical finding of this study and how the cultural shifts may influence and cause shifts in leadership styles in the future. The remaining question to be addressed is: “What are the most culturally relevant and intercultural applicable leadership styles for Armenia to face the challenges of the 21st century globalized world?” To be able to answer this question, let us turn to the theory of interculturation as an integrative approach to intercultural leadership in Armenia.

The theory of interculturation entails three processes: (1) acculturation or assimilation of values other than one’s own, (2) differentiation through the recognition of one’s unique specificities, and (3) original synthesis, which assumes creation of a new and encompassing reality (Sam & Berry, 2006: 360). In other words, interculturation in all three levels deals with identity orientation, in this case, Armenian identity orientation. As most minority groups, Armenians seem most concerned for identity loss or total assimilation under the influence of westernization, often referred to globalization. Interculturation, however, addresses that concern by operating from both identity inclusive and identity security perspective. Both inclusivity and security of one’s identity provides greater capacity to engage in cooperative intercultural relationships (Deardorff, 2009: 58-59). In other words, the theory of interculturation provides a theoretical framework for leaders in the Armenian culture to be more inclusive and engaging with the world without a fear of assimilation due to its strong and secure cultural identity. The outcome of such relationship should be new integrative realities for both Armenians and the world.

Acculturation

As much as the Armenian culture is experiencing change and cultural shifts from individualism to collectivist, from relationship to task orientation, from STO to LTO, from LUA to HUA, from multi-active to linear and cyclic time, while maintaining strong “back to the future” time orientation, so do the Armenian leadership styles. They are shaped and influenced by the culture and change is inevitable. Thus, leaders must learn to adapt to new leadership styles practiced and utilized by other cultures and countries. In other words, Armenian leaders must learn how to be acculturated into global culture and the demands of the 21st century globalization economically through the exchange of information, experience, and ideas “to become more alike through trade” (Sam & Berry, 2006: 20) for the benefit of the Armenian people and the prosperity of the country. Such acculturation, according to the interculturation theory, does not assume a full assimilation to foreign cultural values or a way of life and the denial of ones’ own cultural identity and values.

Differentiation

Differentiation anticipates that Armenians maintain their unique cultural specificities and its effective leadership tradition by (1) sustaining what has been working and useful in the past for generations that preserved Armenia and its national identity, and (2) utilizing its potential to face future challenges. In other words, Armenian leaders in Armenia must preserve their national and cultural identity without becoming fully “westernized” often referred to “cultural homogenization of the world” (Schultz & Lavenda, 2012: 381) at the expense of their own ethnic, cultural, religious, and national identity.

Original Synthesis

As stated earlier, instead of completely rejecting what is non-Armenian way of life and becoming an isolated nation, Armenian leaders must absorb global challenges in political, religious, economic, and social levels. Nor do they need to fully be assimilated with what is completely foreign or non-Armenian. Rather, by embracing what is non-Armenian for the benefit of the Armenian people and by keeping what is Armenian for the benefit of the Armenian people, to form a new culture (Sam & Berry, 2006: 19) and
create new and encompassing realities that are culturally relevant and interculturally applicable approaches for mutual dialog and co-existence (Harris, 2004: 26). Within this paradoxical dynamic, where, in one hand, transformation takes place in the system due to the interaction between Armenian and global cultures, on the other hand, both systems maintain their own identities. As a result, interculturation provides transformation and coexistence while both sides go through the processes of acculturation, differentiation, and original synthesis (Sam & Berry, 2006: 360). Below, I offer specific integrative approaches to intercultural leadership Armenian by employing the theory of interculturation.

**Integrative Approach to Intercultural Leadership in Armenia**

Since Armenian leadership, as seen above, has been autocratic from pre-historic times to the present, it would be premature to expect a Western-type democracy to flourish and prosper in Armenia. First, the Western democracy cannot be exported in of itself, without a conscious acculturation and adaptation of its values by the Armenian people. Historically, the latter has not been a part of people’s worldview, understanding, and experience. Second, Armenians, as one of the ancient civilizations, has had its own democratic principles and practices that must be acknowledged and preserved even today as a part of their cultural heritage (Libaridian, 1999: 126). For instance, the Armenian Apostolic Orthodox Church, one of the oldest hierarchical religious institutions in the world, has had a centuries-long tradition for democratic election of their Supreme Patriarch, the Catholicos, by two-third of laity and one-third of clergy votes (Ormanian, 1955, pp. 136-137). Thus, Armenia must create its own version of democracy (original synthesis) by integrating its traditional autocratic democracy and cultural values with Western democratic values that encourages human creativity, unleashes human potential, and gives equal opportunities to the members of society to participate in democratic processes. As Hofstede puts it: “Structure should follow culture” (1997: 229).

As seen above, all three leadership models, Armenian Church, National, and Democratic, demonstrate autocratic leadership style and lack lassez-faire style. As a result, new oligarchs, a handful of businessmen-politicians (oxymoron in of itself) have emerged in Armenia during the post-Soviet era, who keep Armenia’s economy hostage today. As a result, the gap between wealthy and poor is most high since the country’s independence. 4 Ironically, Armenians outside Armenia live relatively prosperous life (e.g. Europe, Middle East, America, Russia), but most Armenians in Armenia are poor. The leaders of Armenia have been unable to pull the country out of poverty and reduce the brain drain.

Therefore, current Armenian leaders must make a conscious decision to unleash the creative and entrepreneur spirit of the ordinary citizens by integrating the traditional autocratic with lassez-faire leadership style, or adapt to more deligative style of leadership. Since the Armenian people is capable and willing to engage in the democratization processes, according to the situational leadership (Hersey & Blanchard, 1996: 208), they must be delegated and released for building their own and the country’s destiny. The Democratic Leadership is as autocratic and non-lassez-faire as Church and National leadership. Hence, the traditional models of democratic leadership may be integrated with lassez-faire style to enhance individual freedom and hands-off self-actualization. Thus, the government leaders of Armenia today must be less controlling and more delegating by allowing their citizens to act, produce, invent, and innovate for the common good of the Armenian society (Crosby & Bryson, 2005: 187-192).

**RECOMMENDATION FOR FUTURE RESEARCH**

This research indicates that the Armenian culture influences leadership behavior and the cultural shift in certain areas of the Armenian culture causes shifts of leadership styles. If leaders’ behaviors are contingent upon the cultural characteristics and leadership styles, as seen in the case of Armenia, then by studying cultural characteristics and leadership styles one may predict leadership behaviors. If the above hypothesis is true for the Armenian culture, it may also be true for other cultures. Thus, further research is needed to detect leadership behavioral patterns in other cultures and whether or not leadership behaviors may be predicted across cultures.
ENDNOTES


2. The GLOBE research project findings affirm that in countries where leaders are more autocratic and less visionary (e.g. Middle East, France) the autocratic leadership style is more effective (House, 2004: 334). Thus, the Armenian leadership style being characterized predominately as autocratic in all leadership models for centuries, will most likely prevail and continue being viewed as a dominant and effective leadership style, much like in Middle East.

3. Young Yun Kim, in “The Identity Factor in Intercultural Competence” argues for inclusive and security identity orientation as two facets of intercultural competence:
   Theorem 1: The more inclusive an individual’s identity orientation, the greater his or her capacity to engage in cooperative intercultural relationships.
   Theorem 2: The more secure an individual’s identity orientation of an individual, the greater his or her capacity to engage in cooperative intercultural relationships.

4. See the following links:

REFERENCES


APPENDIX: SURVEY QUESTIONNAIRE
ANTHROPOLOGY OF LEADERSHIP: A CASE STUDY IN ARMENIA

1. What is more important cultural value for you? □ Values of the individual; □ Values of the group or community; □ Both

2. I am concerned with the needs, goals, and interests of □ individuals, □ groups, □ both

Questions 3-72, likened scale: Strongly agree / Agree / Not sure / Disagree / Strongly disagree

3 (C). The individuals' opinion is not as important as the society’s. Therefore, leaders in the Armenian culture tend to focus more on the needs of the society than the individuals’.

4 (C). Leaders in the Armenian culture tend to make group decisions. Therefore, they usually respect the opinions of their followers.

5 (C). I believe leaders must be more altruistic (selfless) than narcissistic (selfish), because my culture teaches us to be less selfish.

6 (I). I make independent decisions in life and at work and the opinions of other do not matter much to me.

7 (I). I believe the society should serve the needs of the individual instead of the individual serving the needs of the society.

8 (I). Individual values are higher priority for me. Therefore I advocate more for individual rights than group.

9 (C). I am ready to sacrifice anything for my siblings, friends, and family, because they are part of my life. Therefore, I take care of my family and friends first before I do anything for myself.

10 (C). Values such as respecting elders, patronage loyalty, and belongingness are a part of my cultural identity. Therefore, I follow the advice of those who are older and more experienced than me.

11 (I). In my culture, the privacy of the individual is respected and protected.

12. The relationships are more important than tasks in my culture. Therefore, I tend to maintain good relationships with people than get more things done.

13. When my friend suddenly shows up at work, I gladly put aside my tasks or work-plans and spend time with my friend.

14. At work, I get irritated when people interrupt me in the middle of a task. Therefore, I do not allow people, even my friends, get in the way between my work and me.

15. In my culture, people tend to be more task-oriented. Therefore we prefer to get more things done at work than socializing with people.

16. I like to set concrete goals and deadlines for myself and for people who work for me or with me.

17. At work, people are a high priority for me than business transactions. Therefore, in my culture, it may seem disrespectful to ‘talk business’ upon first arrival.

18. For me, efficiency and excellence at work are high priorities. Therefore, I do not sacrifice my work for the sake of relationships.

19. In my culture, material success is more valued than healthy lifestyle (e.g. exercise, healthy diet). Therefore, I tend to spend more time on making money than exercising.

20. Men and women have very distinct roles in our culture. Therefore, I do not do certain tasks due to my gender.

21. Social gender roles are not strictly distinguished in my culture. Therefore both men and women may engage in similar activities such as doing laundry, house cleaning, baby-sitting, etc.

22. In general, there are certain roles, such as leadership, that women would not pursue in my culture.

23. Men in my culture do not expose to vulnerability, such as admitting or showing their weaknesses or emotions.

24. In my culture, females are expected to be modest and tender, while men should demonstrate toughness and assertiveness.
25. Most females in my culture tend to choose to follow a strong man rather than being a strong female leader.
26. The distance between leadership and followership roles in my society is big.
27. Leaders are approachable in my culture.
28. In my culture, both leadership and followership are equally valuable human functions.
29. Leadership in my culture is associated with power, while followership – powerlessness.
30. In my culture, I observe power distances between men and women.
31. In my culture, I observe power distances between husband and wife.
32. In my culture, I observe power distances between parents and children.
33. In my culture, I observe power distances between teachers and students.
34. In my culture, I observe power distances between leaders and followers.
35. In my culture, I observe power distances between clergymen and laity.
36. In my culture, I observe power distances between economically Rich and Poor.
37. In my culture, I observe power distances between those who hold university diplomas and those who have secondary education.
38. In my culture, I observe power distances between younger and older generations.
39. If “A” is true then “non-A” (the opposite of A) must be false. For instance, in my culture, we operate from true-false, right-wrong, and good-bad mindset.
40. If “A’ is true then “non-A” may also be true and together they may produce superior wisdom. For instance, in my culture, we operate from relativistic mindset that values all aspects of reality to be virtuous.
41. In my culture, people tend to seek immediate gratifications, consumption, spending, and enjoyment of life. For instance, I prefer to spend what I have today than save things for tomorrow.
42. I value planning, persistence, perseverance, and saving. Therefore, I live with a sense of delayed gratification and anticipations what the future might unfold.
43. I tend to show hospitality and generosity to people by spending more than I have, because I feel socially obligated.
44. In my cultural tradition, people tend to focuses on their immediate needs without having long-term plans. For instance, families share with others what they have to preserve ‘face” and fulfill family and kinship responsibilities.
45. People in my culture tend to strategize the future and seem to know what their plans are for the next three or five years.
46. I defend myself against life uncertainties by being proactive and preventive.
47. I accept uncertainties as a reality of life, because there is not much I can do to prevent things from happening. Therefore, I do not feel anxious or threatened by unknown situations.
48. I consciously avoid all possible uncertainties that the future might bring in various circumstances.
49. I deal with problems as they arrive, because the future is uncertain and events cannot be predicted.
50. I tend to go to the doctor whenever I have pain.
51. When something is uncertain or do not understand I tend to get anxious.
52. I usually deal with the past and present realities and tend not to worry about the future.
53. I am confident that I can have control over my life and determine my own future with my own plans and actions.
54. It is not fate but personal choices that determine one’s destiny. Therefore, I tend to act out of free will with an understanding that my future is in my hands.
55. The personal freedom is an illusion. It is fate that governs people’s destinies.
56. Human free will cannot change anything in life, because past, present, and future events have already been determined.
57. An effort to prevent something from happening or changing one’s future is useless.
58. I agree with the status quo and accept life as a fate that cannot be changed.
59. Social class and status are not static realities, but subject for change if one is determined to change them.
60. I cannot change anything in life, because it has already been predetermined.
61. Life is a lineal progression through the past, present, and the future (linear). Therefore, I believe in human progression.
62. I focus on one thing at a time and do things one at a time. For instance, I do not jump from one conversation or task to the next. Rather, I tend to complete one conversation or task before moving to the next.
63. People in my culture tend to be punctual and time conscious. Therefore, we like to work under fixed hours.
64. I do many things at the same time and not interested in schedules and punctuality. Therefore, I like working under flexible hours.
65. For me, people matter more than tasks. Therefore I tend to be less organized person at work.
66. My relational personality makes me more people pleasing and less organized person in working environments.
67. There is nothing new under the sun. Each day rises and sets with the sun. Therefore, life is a cycle.
68. The past determines the present, and the present projects the future in a cyclical rather than lineal fashion. Therefore, life is like a wheel that rotates constantly.
69. It is not easy for me to make quick decisions, because I must have enough time to assess, reflect, and evaluate.
70. The future is unknowable, the present is uncertain or vaguely understood, but the past is visible and influential.
71. In my culture, buses leave when it is full and shelves or gas-tanks are re-filled when they become empty.
72. I tend to talk more about the past than about the future.
Management Journals and the Celebrity Researcher Effect on Tiers

Reginald L. Bell
Prairie View A & M University

I used two-way analysis of variance, with a 4 x 3 factorial design, to compare the means of 420 articles published in 21 reputable management journals—20 articles per journal. The independent variables were a corroborated list of 1st, 2nd, 3rd, and 4th tier management journals and three publication periods were 1989 and before, 1990 to 1999 and 2000 and after. The dependent variable was the 617,299 citations of articles found in a Google Scholar citations search. I ascertained means differed on the main effects of tier (p< .001) and publication period (p< .05). The measure of the magnitude of decreases in citations among journal tiers did not differ across the three publication periods, with a non-significant interaction effect of p = .794. Super-cited articles published in 1st tier management journals give them a competitive advantage over lower tier journals when journals are ranked by counting citations. This celebrity researcher effect, however, is negated over time.

INTRODUCTION

In an early study that solicited expert opinion, Durand (1974, p. 580) ranked the Administrative Science Quarterly, Management Science, The Harvard Business Review, The Academy of Management Journal, and Journal of Business as 1st, 2nd, 3rd, 4th and 5th respectively, in a study where journals were “ranked as influential to management theory and management practice by academic respondents.” Comparing journals by citation counts and ranking them is not a new approach (Baird & Oppenheim, 1994; Oppenheim, 1996). Journal rankings and journal citations studies continue to intrigue faculties at the various schools of business around the globe. And journals continue to publish the results of these studies. Opinions of experts are important indicators of journal rankings, internationally too (Caligiuri, 1999; DuBois, & Reeb, 2000; Mingers & Harzig, 2007; Thongpapanl, 2012). Leung (2007) showed through a citation analysis that East Asian researchers are following the trend of Western researchers rather than establishing their own path. Researchers in the specialty fields of management, such as strategic management, operations management, technology and innovation management and even management accounting have joined in on the perpetual search (or continual re-affirmation) for the top journals in their fields.

For example, researchers have ranked strategic management journals based on the articles that are cited by other journals over a period between 1991 to 2006, looking for the per article impact of an article to affirm a journal’s rank among journals (Azar & Brock, 2008). Researchers have examined 186 articles published in a single journal, The Journal of Management Accounting Research, from 1989 to 2008, and discovered there is a group of “most-cited authors” in that journal (Lindquist & Smith, 2009). Chong and Bell (2012) found differences in the relative frequency of published articles, whereby, highly regarded accounting journals favored the articles of Carnegie classified research extensive and foreign institutions...
over the Carnegie classified master level and liberal arts schools. Another group of researchers used three different methods: the overall score, the normalized method, and the weighted-score method and ascertained that six innovation and technology management journals continue to appear as the top journals (Cheng, Kumar, Motwani, Reisman, Madan, & Manu, 1999). Another study found that based on total citations, citations per article, and citations per words published, for the period between 1992 and 1994, the most important operations management journals were Management Science, Decisions Sciences and Operations Research (Vokurka, 1996). There is a variety of research methods on citations analysis of management journals.

Podsakoff, Mackenzie, Bachrach, and Podsakoff (2005) found seven journals accounted for 61 percent of the citations of 28 leading business journals over two decades, and in the past 20 years the most influential journals were the Academy of Management Journal, the Academy of Management Review, and the Strategic Management Journal. Li and Parker (2013) used Thomson Reuters’ Journal Citation Reports database to derive three basic relationships that influence theory building: the numbers of articles citing a journal, articles cited by a journal, and a journal’s self-citation rate. Stochastic models have been used to show the obsolescence and decline in the rate of citations of an article over time (Mingers & Burrell, 2006). Raut, Sahu, and Ganguly (2008) found the top ranked journals in strategic management were Strategic Management Journal, Academy of Management Journal and Administrative Science Quarterly, which combined represented 32% of literature coverage; moreover, authors they examined cited journals more frequently than books, magazines, newspapers, and other information sources. The key driver of citations in management journals is the journal itself, and other factors are length of the paper, the number of references, number of coauthors, Carnegie Classification and the status of the first author’s institution (Bell, 2010; Bell & Chong, 2010; Mingers & Xu, 2010).

The majority of citations in management journals continue to be concentrated with a handful of journals; Geary, Marriott, and Liz (2004) found that 126 journals out of 562 journals accounted for 50% of the total citations of all 562 journals they examined. Linton and Thongpapanl (2004) found that based on ranking journals by the number of citations the top 10 technology and innovation management journals out of 50 were Journal of Product Innovation Management, Research Policy, Research-Technology Management, Harvard Business Review, Strategic Management Journal, Management Science, Administrative Science Quarterly, R&D Management, IEEE Transactions on Engineering Management, and Academy of Management Review. Bell (2012, p. 29) referred to any article that has been cited more than 2,429 times, that spawns a generation of research, as a “super-cited” article. A super-cited article can create citations momentum for the journal in which it is published, taking on a life of its own. Authors of such papers become celebrity researchers. A paper that is cited often will likely be cited even more often in the literature (Baird & Oppenheim, 1994; Oppenheim, 1996).

Harris (2008) in an article entitled “Ranking the Management Journals” developed a list of journals that would aid researchers in the selection of a management journal appropriate for publishing their research results. Harris found results consistent with other researchers’ findings in terms of deciding what management journals are top tier management journals. Yuyuenyongwatana and Carraher (2008) also found a consensus in 50 management journals they ranked by means. They also argue that institutions are reasonable in using such rankings as a basis for evaluating the quality of a faculty member’s research. Conversely, the notion of journal quality is not without controversy.

**Journal Quality, the Elusive Concept**

Empirical research has shown evidence there is bias in the relative frequency of Carnegie classified research extensive institutions over lesser institutions being published in the top business journals (Bell, 2010; Bell & Chong, 2010). Editors’ perceptions of the submitting author’s institution, editorial gate keeping, and other types of bias can determine who gets published in what types of journals. Brand named institutions crowd out other institutions; a lesser known researcher from a lesser known institution submitting his or her work to a highly regarded journal will be lucky to have it read by a staff editor, and the manuscript might never be sent out for peer review (Macdoanld & Kam, 2008).
It is hard to construe a journal’s true quality from the hodgepodge of published research findings that deal specifically with journal quality question. A journal, when scientifically tested, is not a proxy for the quality of its articles and articles are not a proxy for the quality of the journal in which they are published (Chow, Haddad, Singh & Wu, 2007; Smith, 2004). Mediocre research is often granted the endorsement of high visibility when published in top journals but might also impede the development of knowledge (Starbuck, 2005). Journal quality is still a vague and elusive concept.

Most arguments of journal quality are circular; moreover, the indicator of quality has become the target for performance. In other words, the belief in quality of a journal has negated its being substantiated with objective evidence needed for universal acceptance of a “journal quality” definition. The notion of management journal quality appears to benefit members of the club merely because they are club members. Macdonald and Kam (2008, p. 596) wrote the following:

Academics are notoriously poor at identifying quality journals not known to be quality journals. They tend to be very familiar with very few journals, and very ignorant of the vast majority...Once a journal is on one list of quality journals, it is fairly likely to appear on other lists of quality journals. It is a quality journal because it is on a list of quality journals. Conversely, journals not on the lists are likely to remain excluded...One characteristic of quality journals in Management Studies is that authors from top business schools publish in them, but then, which are top business schools is often determined by publication in quality journals.

Therefore, I am not arguing in this study that just because a management journal has a huge number of citations that this in turn is an indicator of that journal’s quality. Top journals, on the other hand, do have influence when people cite the articles they publish. Bell (2012, p. 26) found a list of 61 management journals, listed by tiers, posted on the Bauer College of Business website:

Scholars at the University of Houston’s Bauer College of Business (a U.S. News & World Report “Top 50” Business School) created a list of 61 management journals in 2009 and ranked them by tiers from 1 to 4, with 1 being highest...The Bauer list adheres to the consensus of what management professors perceive to be top management journals that has been substantiated in the literature.

Research Purpose

Albeit the quality argument is still unresolved, there is some inconsistency in the methods used to determine a management journals’ influence because most studies focus on a single sub area (Podsakoff, Mackenzie, Bachrach, & Podsakoff, 2005). Nonetheless, the literature suggests that the more an article is cited the greater is its influence on theory building (Li & Parker, 2013); therefore, 1st and 2nd tier management journals should be more influential in knowledge development than 3rd and 4th tier management journals and time should not negate this influence. Moreover, since super-cited articles have a momentum producing characteristic, the publication period should not diminish the established management journal hierarchy. Some journals decline in popularity while top journals maintain or even accelerate in popularity (Johnson, & Podsakoff, 1994). The journals believed to be most influential should produce heavily cited articles consistently. That is to say, regardless of the publication period, citations for top tier journals should be significantly higher than those from lower tier journals. The magnitude of the interaction effect should be significant. Even if citations for all tiers increase or decrease, 1st tier journals should increase significantly more than 2nd, 3rd, and 4th tiers or decrease significantly less than 2nd, 3rd, and 4th tiers.

My research purpose is to test three hypotheses related to pre-established lists of management journal tiers corroborated in the literature and the citations of articles published in those journals to ascertain if differences exist over time. My purpose is furthered by conducting this study to test whether a list of 21 management journals corroborated to be highly regarded management journals differ by tier regarding
citations (main effect), whether there is a difference in publication periods regarding citations (main effect), and if the magnitude of citations increases or decreases across publication periods is different for 1st, 2nd, 3rd and 4th tier journals (the interaction effect).

**METHODOLOGY**

Despite the mixture of meaning on recent researchers’ attempts to demonstrate an acceptable framework for what exactly is management journal “quality,” institutions continue to create lists of management journals they deem influential. Many of these lists use citations as the main criterion, and based on the magnitudes of citations increases journals produce over time journal hierarchies are determined. The same journals seem to keep showing up on lists of top management journals decade after decade. Citations are construed as a journal’s influence on theory building (Tahai & Meyer, 1999). It is hard to argue against citations influencing the work researchers do. Journal articles I cited in this paper, for example, certainly influenced my data collection methods as well as how I interpreted my results, especially using Google Scholar as a resource for evaluating management journals’ impact (Bell, 2012; Harzing, & van der Wal, 2009). Table 1 illustrates two management journal lists from two independent studies, both published in 2008, where authors’ ranked journals by means or classified them into categories of “A” “B” or “C” based on expert opinion and citations counts.

**TABLE 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Two Independent Lists of Top Management Journals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>50 Management journals they ranked by means</em></td>
<td><em>Management journals she ranked as A, B, or C</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Academy of Management Journal</td>
<td>Academy of Management Journal*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Journal of Applied Psychology</td>
<td>Academy of Management Review*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Academy of Management Review</td>
<td>Administrative Science Quarterly*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Management Science</td>
<td>Strategic Management Journal*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Administrative Science Quarterly</td>
<td>Academy of Management Perspectives/Executive*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Organization Science</td>
<td>British Journal of Industrial Relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Journal of Management History</td>
<td>Industrial &amp; Labor Relations Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. AOM Perspectives</td>
<td>International Journal of Human Resource Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Public Administration Quarterly</td>
<td>Journal of Management*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Journal of International Business and Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>European Journal of Industrial Relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. Organizational Dynamics</td>
<td>International Review of Administrative Sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. Management Decision</td>
<td>Journal of Leisure Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. Baltic Journal of Management</td>
<td>Research in Organizational Behavior</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2 shows the original Bauer School of Business (2009) list of 61 management journals by tier with a cross-comparison of the two other lists of top management journals from Yuyuenyongwatana and Carrather (2008) and Harris (2008). This cross-comparison lends face validity that scholarly researchers in the field of management perceive these as top journals. Therefore, several of the management journals appeared on two of the three lists; some appeared on all three lists. I considered the three lists of journals, therefore, corroborated on their face value as top journals. I selected 21 management journals for comparison purposes and used the Bauer list to place them into respective tiers. The only exception was the *Journal of Business Strategies*, not on the original Bauer list, but I assigned it to the tier 4 group.

**TABLE 2**

**A CROSS-COMPARISON OF THREE INDEPENDENT LISTS OF TOP MANAGEMENT JOURNALS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>List A</strong></th>
<th><strong>Bauer Tiers</strong></th>
<th><strong>List B</strong></th>
<th><strong>List C</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Academy of Management Journal*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Academy of Management Review*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Administrative Science Quarterly*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Strategic Management Journal*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Journal of International Business Studies#</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Journal of Management*</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Journal of Management Studies*</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Leadership Quarterly#</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Personnel Psychology</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Academy of Management Perspectives*</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>y</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Corporate Governance</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Human Relations</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. IEEE Transactions on Engineering Management#</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Journal of Occupational and Organizational Psychology</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Denotes that journal is on both lists.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Journal of Managerial Issues</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>y</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Journal of Organizational Behavior</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Organizational Dynamics</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Academy of Management Learning and Education</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Advances in Strategic Management</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Asia Pacific Journal of Management</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>British Journal of Management</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Business and Society</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>California Management Review*</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Decision Sciences Journal of Innovative Education</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Group and Organization Studies</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Human Performance</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Human Resources Management#</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Human Resource Management Review</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>International Business Review</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>International Journal of Innovation and Technology Management</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>International Journal of Innovation Management</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>International Journal of Management Reviews#</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Journal of Applied Behavioral Science</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Journal of Applied Social Psychology</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Journal of Behavioral Decision Making</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Journal of Business Ethics</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Journal of Business Strategy (different than Journal of Business Strategies)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Journal of Business Venturing</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Journal of Conflict Resolution</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Journal of Education for Business</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Journal of Engineering &amp; Technology Management</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Journal of High Technology Management Research</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Journal of International Management</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Journal of Management Education</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>Journal of Small Business Management</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>Journal of Vocational Behavior</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>Journal of World Business</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>Law and Human Behavior</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>Long Range Planning</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>Management and Organization Review</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>Management International Review</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>Management Learning</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>Organization Studies#</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>Public Personnel Management*</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>Research Policy</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>Research-Technology Management</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>Sex Roles</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>Thunderbird International Business Review</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td>World at Work Journal</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


*Denotes a journal that appears in all three lists; #Denotes a journal that appears on two lists.

Google Scholar allows for a citation search simply by typing in the journal title in the search engine. I collected all the data on May 26, 2013 from a Google Scholar citation search, and recorded the information from the first two pages of the search results of each journal in an Excel spread sheet. I coded for publication date, period of publication, number of citations of an article, tier, and number of authors. I recorded the first 20 articles that appeared in the first two pages of the Google Scholar citations search results for each of the 21 management journals. It took a couple of days to input the coded data into an
Excel file. I later exported the file with 420 rows of data to SPSS 18.0 for statistical analysis. The frequency and percent of independent variables (publication period, tier, and number of authors) are shown in Table 3.

**TABLE 3**

FREQUENCY AND PERCENTS OF DEMOGRAPHIC VARIABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Journal Tiers</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1&lt;sup&gt;st&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>19.0</td>
<td>19.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2&lt;sup&gt;nd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>19.0</td>
<td>38.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3&lt;sup&gt;rd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>66.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>420</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Publication Period</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989 and before</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>18.3</td>
<td>18.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990 to 1999</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>39.3</td>
<td>57.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000 and after</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>420</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Authors</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>37.4</td>
<td>37.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>42.9</td>
<td>80.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three or more</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>19.8</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>420</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The publication period was determined based on an article being published 1989 and before, 1990 to 1999, and 2000 and after. Figure 1 shows a histogram of the pattern of the actual publication dates for all 420 articles, ranging from 1960 to 2012. The actual publication dates for the 420 articles appears to be a pretty good normal distribution of data. This gives me confidence in the randomness of the data. There were a very small number of articles that were published in 1960’s and 1970’s that I combined into the 1989 and before group to ensure there were adequate cell sizes for data analysis purposes.

**Research Hypotheses**

To further investigate the differences in independent variables and differences in the dependent variable, the following three null hypotheses were written and tested.

**H<sub>1</sub>:** Means for citations do not differ among the publication periods of 1989 and before, 1990 to 1999, and 2000 and after.

**H<sub>2</sub>:** Means for citations do not differ among the management journal tiers of 1<sup>st</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup>, 3<sup>rd</sup>, and 4<sup>th</sup>.

**H<sub>3</sub>:** Means for the magnitude of citations increases or decreases do not differ among management journal tiers of 1<sup>st</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup>, 3<sup>rd</sup>, and 4<sup>th</sup> regardless of the publication periods of 1989 and before, 1990 to 1999, and 2000 and after.
TWO-WAY ANOVA RESULTS

I used a two-way analysis of variance with a 4 x 3 factorial design to compare the means of 420 articles that were published in 21 reputable management journals—20 articles per journal. The independent variables were 1st, 2nd, 3rd, and 4th tier management journals and the three publication periods of 1989 and before, 1990 to 1999 and 2000 and after. The dependent variable was the number of citations for each of the 420 articles. There were 617,299 total citations. I tested for main effects and interaction effects. The means and standards deviations for the three publication periods, the four tiers and the Test of Between-Subjects Effects are shown in Table 4. Estimated Marginal Means for Period, Tier, and Period * Tier are presented in Tables A, B and C in the Appendix.

I rejected Hypothesis 1: Means for citations differ among the publication periods of 1989 and before, 1990 to 1999, and 2000 and after, with F(2, 408), 3.637, p= .027. The LSD Post-Hoc tests show a negative mean difference of -943.128 between publication periods 2000 and after and 1989 and before (P= .009); it shows a negative mean difference of -629.298 between periods 2000 and after and 1990-1999 (p= .041). Partial Eta Squared accounted for a small effect size, meaning publication period accounted for only 1.8 percent of the variance in citations. Clearly technology is the best explanation for the fact that more articles were published for the more recent publication periods. Personal computers, statistical software packages, subscriptions to library databases that include PDF full-text research articles have all contributed to this difference. The speed in which researchers can publish their articles has increased exponentially because of computing technologies. It does not explain why more citations occur in the period when fewer articles were published.

I rejected Hypothesis 2: Means for citations differ among the management journal tiers of 1st, 2nd, 3rd, and 4th, with F(3, 408), 37.812, p= .000. Given that tiers are already pre-established, based on citation differences this finding is not unexpected. The LSD Post-Hoc test reveals all the mean differences are significant, with a p= .000 on all comparisons of tiers 2, 3, and 4 to tier 1 which shows a continual decline in citations as journals decline in tiers. Mean differences were -2823.626, -3834.438, and -3994.422.
respectively. Partial Eta Squared accounted for a large effect size, meaning tier accounted for 21.8 percent of the variance in citations when using the Cohen (1988) rule that .01 ~ small, .06 ~ medium and .14 ~ large. This finding substantiates the literature in this regard; the lower the journal tier significantly fewer is the citations.

I did not reject Hypothesis; Means for the magnitude of citations decreases do not differ among management journal tiers of 1st, 2nd, 3rd, and 4th regardless of the publication periods of 1989 and before, 1990 to 1999, and 2000 and after, with F(6, 408), 0.519, p=.794. This is surprising given the fact 1st tier management journals have published the most super-cited articles. Although, 1st tier journals have higher means across the three publication periods they are not statistically different across the three publication periods. The magnitude of the interaction effect was non-significant. The 1st tier journals’ citations did not increase significantly more than 2nd, 3rd, and 4th tiers nor did citations decrease significantly less than 2nd, 3rd, and 4th tiers. In fact, all four tiers decreased in citations over the three publication periods.

**TABLE 4**

**UNIVARIATE ANALYSIS OF VARIANCE WITH MEANS AND STD. DEVIATIONS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Tier</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Articles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1989 and before</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5123.88</td>
<td>4208.125</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2176.77</td>
<td>1752.328</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1081.71</td>
<td>1007.655</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>493.82</td>
<td>318.689</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2501.69</td>
<td>3229.211</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990 to 1999</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4561.67</td>
<td>3336.540</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1885.13</td>
<td>4466.102</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>603.58</td>
<td>449.814</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>570.50</td>
<td>524.729</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2056.48</td>
<td>3302.824</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000 and after</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3704.00</td>
<td>1562.518</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>856.78</td>
<td>475.000</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>200.94</td>
<td>271.564</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>341.96</td>
<td>348.852</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>479.51</td>
<td>771.030</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4680.06</td>
<td>3539.386</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1585.45</td>
<td>3266.796</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>459.09</td>
<td>612.462</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>435.49</td>
<td>422.687</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1469.76</td>
<td>2675.843</td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Dependent Variable: Citations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Type III Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Partial Eta Squared</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corrected Model</td>
<td>1.147E9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1.043E8</td>
<td>22.950</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>8.437E8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8.437E8</td>
<td>185.727</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Period</td>
<td>3.304E7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.652E7</td>
<td>3.637</td>
<td>.027</td>
<td>.018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tier</td>
<td>5.153E8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.718E8</td>
<td>37.812</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Period * Tier</td>
<td>1.414E7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2356259.282</td>
<td>.519</td>
<td>.794</td>
<td>.008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Error</td>
<td>1.853E9</td>
<td>408</td>
<td>4542490.204</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>3.907E9</td>
<td>420</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corrected Total</td>
<td>3.000E9</td>
<td>419</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Denotes p<.05; ***Denotes p<.001.
DISCUSSION AND SUMMARY

What is the most logical explanation for the fact that fewer articles were published in the period of 1989 and before (77 articles, citations mean= 2219), compared to 1990-1999 (165 articles, citations mean= 1905) and 2000 and after (178 articles, citations mean= 1276) but there were more citations in the earlier period? Why is the citations trend downward for all four of the management journals tiers across the three publication periods? The most logical explanation is that there were more super-cited articles published in the earlier period than in the more recent periods. I will refer to this phenomenon hereafter as the Celebrity Researcher Effect.

The literature review revealed that various studies have been conducted regarding journal rankings, journal quality and citations of articles published by journals included on lists of top management journals. This study’s contribution to the literature is derived from a random, and pretty good representative sample of 21 management journals citations compared against pre-established tiers and three publication periods for 420 articles. The plot shown in Figure 2 is the best way to understand the dynamics of my findings; the 4x3 factorial design is plotted by tier (1= first, 2= second, 3= third, and 4= fourth) and publication period (8= 1989 and before, 9= 1990 to 1999, and 10= 2000 and after) and makes it clear as to why the interaction effect was non-significant, with a p = .794. There is a downward trend in the citations patterns for all four tiers across the three publication periods. None of the tiers pull significantly in the opposite direction of any of the other journal tiers. This is telling.

I surmise that the Celebrity Researcher Effect is negated over time. Thus, super-cited articles have no significant effect in the interaction because they decline in popularity and utility in theory building as knowledge develops. Moreover, celebrity researchers producing articles of this quality decline over time as they retire. And even though older articles have more time to be cited than newer articles, super-cited articles eventually exhaust their applicability to modern approaches. Popularity of the super-cited articles fade, even when there is perfunctory citations of such articles, because of knowledge development. My findings support the conclusion that articles become obsolete and decline in the rate of citations of an article over time (Mingers & Burrell, 2006).

FIGURE 2
PROFILE PLOTS FOR TIER * PUBLICATION PERIOD

![Profile plots for tier * publication period](image-url)
Table 5 shows the 21 management journals that I ranked by citations means. Table 5 also includes the original Bauer School of Business (2009) management journals tiers. Even though the Levene’s Test of Equality of Error Variance was significant (p = .000), I am not concerned about a Type I error, because the p-value for tier was significant well below p < .000 on tiers. Also, the sampling frame for publication dates of the 420 articles is fixed; fewer articles were published in the period of 1989 and before than in the periods of 1990-1999 and 2000 and after, but more citations occurred in the earlier period.

Despite this fact, my findings appear to show a non-significant downward trend of the magnitude of decreases in citations of all four tiers of management journals across three publication periods. This is why tiers are not reflective of the citation means that I ascertained in this study. For example, Organization studies has a mean of 899.75 citations, and is ranked 10th by me but has a Bauer rating of 4th tier, and is 33/50 on List B³. California Management Review has a mean of 651.45 citations, and is ranked 12th by me, but has a Bauer rating of 4th tier; Harris (2008) gave it a “B” rating. Each of these journals’ means is well above the means for 3rd and 4th tier as seen in Table 5. Also, super-cited articles seem to inflate the means for some journals, especially when journal comparisons don’t account for publication period.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management Journal List by Ranked by Means</th>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Means</th>
<th>Articles</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academy of Management Review</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5876.75</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3917.882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic Management Journal</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5468.85</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3848.251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative Science Quarterly</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4920.85</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3754.938</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Management</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3143.90</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>6199.954</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy of Management Journal</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2453.80</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>622.994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of International Business Studies</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1351.70</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1402.160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Organizational Behavior</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1018.10</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>754.756</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Management Studies</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>980.75</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>365.125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizational Dynamics</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>971.05</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>756.540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization Studies</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>899.75</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>558.134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership Quarterly</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>865.45</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>537.925</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California Management Review</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>651.45</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>504.782</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IEEE Transactions on Engineering Management</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>461.75</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>414.122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resources Management</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>452.00</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>284.321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy of Management Learning and Education</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>352.25</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>400.083</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Management Reviews</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>348.30</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>182.195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management Learning</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>254.90</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>88.926</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academy of Management Perspectives</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>167.70</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>69.744</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Human Resource Management</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>134.15</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>74.213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Business Strategies</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>89.80</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>84.041</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Managerial Issues</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2.931</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>1469.76</strong></td>
<td><strong>420</strong></td>
<td><strong>2675.843</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tiers</th>
<th>Means</th>
<th>Articles</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1st</td>
<td>4680.06</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>3539.386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd</td>
<td>1585.45</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>3266.796</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd</td>
<td>459.09</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>612.462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4th</td>
<td>435.49</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>422.687</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>1469.76</strong></td>
<td><strong>420</strong></td>
<td><strong>2675.843</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most of the super-cited articles appeared as first article on the first page of the Google Scholar search. I can argue a normal distribution of the sample and the fact that I used the first 20 articles in a Google Scholar search for each of the 21 management journals is a fair comparison. The 420 articles were normally distributed in the results pages (See Figure 1). Table 6 shows 15 of these super-cited seminal
articles, written by celebrity researchers, and they are a competitive advantage for these journals when citations are the measure of influence. I also found that few authors accounted for the bulk of citations in this study which is consistent with Lindquist and Smith (2009). Several of the celebrity researchers’ citations in this study are many times above the population mean of 1469.

Celebrity researcher articles represent an enormous advantage for 1st tier journals, especially in the earlier period, which creates an overwhelming disadvantage for the lower tier management journals to overcome. Table 6 shows Kathleen M. Eisenhardt appears six times and has a total of 41,592 citations and four of her articles are published in Bauer 1st tier journals. Kathleen M. Eisenhardt is currently Professor of Strategy and Organization at Stanford University. Therefore, celebrity researchers’ articles are extremely important in citation counts because citations of the celebrity researcher articles can become perfunctory in nature. Authors sometime cite an article for its popularity and not necessarily because the article makes any real or germane addition to an author’s research. When an article is cited often it is likely to be cited more often (MacDonald & Kam, 2008; Baird & Oppenheim, 1994; Oppenheim, 1996). When citations are the measure of a management journal’s influence on theory building 1st tier journals have an enormous advantage. The citations momentum 1st tier management journals have over lower tier journals creates an overwhelming disadvantage for the lower tier journals hoping to someday be classified as 1st tier journals, judged by their citations count. Table 6 shows a search of the 420 articles used in this study revealed that 15 articles written by celebrity researchers (3.57%) accounted for 18.96% of the total citations. Most of these are two or three standard deviations above the mean citations for their respective tiers, and many times larger than the population mean. The citations mean for these 15 super-cited articles was 7802. Recall the population citations mean for 420 articles was 1469. The citations mean for the 405 articles without the super-cited articles was 1235.

Management journal tiers are statistically the same across the three publication periods. And time diminishes the magnitude of the Celebrity Researcher Effect. Differences across the four management journal tiers diminish over time. The large standard deviations for some of the management journals reveal that there are a lot of super-cited articles among some journals and explains why tiers differed at such a high level of significance. Based on the examination of the Google Scholar citations search results for 20 articles each from 21 management journals, popularity of super-cited articles appears to decline over time. It does, however, make sense that older articles are cited more often than newer articles. Nevertheless, publication period diminishes the influence of The Celebrity Researcher Effect across the four tiers. It is my opinion that when time is accounted for it makes no sense to place the 21 management journals into tiers because they are statistically equal in terms of the magnitude of decreases in citations of the articles they have published. Citations decline in the same pattern for all the tiers and no tier is pulling in the opposite direction (increasing while others decrease, vice versa) of any of the others.
### TABLE 6

table of celebrity researchers' total citations as a percent of all citations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Celebrity Researchers’ Total Citations</th>
<th>117025</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Celebrity Researchers’ Percent of All Citations</td>
<td>117025/617299 * 100 = 18.96%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Celebrity Researchers’ Percent of All Papers</td>
<td>15/420 papers * 100 = 3.57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Celebrity Researchers’ Citations Mean</td>
<td>117025/15 = 7802</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Building theories from case study research | Social capital, intellectual capital, and the organizational advantage | Absorptive capacity: a new perspective on learning and innovation |
| Cited by 21269 | Cited by 8297 | Cited by 19420 |

| Agency theory: An assessment and review | Social capital and value creation: The role of intrafirm networks | The art of continuous change: Linking complexity theory and time-paced evolution in relentlessly shifting organizations |
| Cited by 5950 | Cited by 3091 | Cited by 2752 |

| Theory building from cases: Opportunities and challenges. | Bad Management Theories Are Destroying Good Management Practices. | The internationalization of the firm—four swedish cases |
| Cited by 2666 | Cited by 1724 | Cited by 2252 |

| Making fast strategic decisions in high-velocity environments | The resource-based view of the firm: Ten years after 1991 | The myopia of learning |
| Cited by 2539 | Cited by 1304 | Cited by 4091 |

| Dynamic capabilities: what are they? | Firm resources and sustained competitive advantage | The internationalization process of the firm-a model of knowledge development and increasing foreign market commitments |
| Cited by 6443 | Cited by 29140 | Cited by 6114 |

| KM Eisenhardt = 41592 or 41592/617299 * 100 = 6.74% | Ghoshal = 13112 or 13112/617299 * 100 = 2.12% | J Johanson = 8366 or 8366/617299 * 100 = 1.36% |
| J. Barney = 30444 or 30444/617299 * 100 = 4.93% | DA Levinthal = 23511 or 23511/617299 * 100 = 3.81% |

### REFERENCES


APPENDIX

Estimated Marginal Means

Table A: Period

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lower Bound</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>2219.048</td>
<td>250.954</td>
<td>1725.723</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>1905.218</td>
<td>168.352</td>
<td>1574.272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>1275.920</td>
<td>256.310</td>
<td>772.067</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pairwise Comparisons

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(I) Period</th>
<th>(J) Period</th>
<th>Mean Difference (I-J)</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Sig. a</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval for Difference a</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lower Bound</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>dimension2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>313.830</td>
<td>.300</td>
<td>-280.219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dimension1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>943.128*</td>
<td>358.710</td>
<td>.009</td>
<td>237.978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>dimension2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>-313.830</td>
<td>.300</td>
<td>-907.879</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dimension1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>629.298*</td>
<td>306.655</td>
<td>.041</td>
<td>26.477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>dimension2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>-943.128*</td>
<td>.009</td>
<td>-1648.278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>-629.298*</td>
<td>306.655</td>
<td>.041</td>
<td>-1232.119</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on estimated marginal means

a. Adjustment for multiple comparisons: Least Significant Difference (equivalent to no adjustments).

* The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

Note: 8= 1989 and before, 9= 1990 to 1999, and 10= 2000 and after.

Univariate Tests

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contrast</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Partial Eta Squared</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Error</td>
<td>3.304E7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.652E7</td>
<td>3.637</td>
<td>.027</td>
<td>.018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.853E9</td>
<td>408</td>
<td>4542490.204</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The F tests the effect of Period. This test is based on the linearly independent pairwise comparisons among the estimated marginal means.
### Table B: Tier

#### Estimates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tier</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval Lower Bound</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval Upper Bound</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1&lt;sup&gt;st&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>4463.184</td>
<td>337.709</td>
<td>3799.316</td>
<td>5127.051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2&lt;sup&gt;nd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>1639.557</td>
<td>264.832</td>
<td>1118.951</td>
<td>2160.163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3&lt;sup&gt;rd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>628.745</td>
<td>218.490</td>
<td>199.238</td>
<td>1058.253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>468.762</td>
<td>217.294</td>
<td>41.607</td>
<td>895.916</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Pairwise Comparisons

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(I) Tier</th>
<th>(J) Tier</th>
<th>Mean Difference (I-J)</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Sig.&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval for Difference&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt; Lower Bound</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval for Difference&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt; Upper Bound</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>dimension1</td>
<td>1&lt;sup&gt;st&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>2&lt;sup&gt;nd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>2823.626</td>
<td>429.166</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1979.973</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dimension1</td>
<td>2&lt;sup&gt;nd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3&lt;sup&gt;rd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3834.438</td>
<td>402.226</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>3043.745</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dimension1</td>
<td>2&lt;sup&gt;nd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>4&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3994.422</td>
<td>401.577</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>3205.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dimension1</td>
<td>3&lt;sup&gt;rd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>1&lt;sup&gt;st&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>-2823.626</td>
<td>429.166</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>-3667.279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dimension1</td>
<td>3&lt;sup&gt;rd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>2&lt;sup&gt;nd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>1010.812</td>
<td>343.328</td>
<td>.003</td>
<td>335.899</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dimension1</td>
<td>3&lt;sup&gt;rd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>4&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>1170.796</td>
<td>342.568</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>497.378</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dimension1</td>
<td>4&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>1&lt;sup&gt;st&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>-3834.438</td>
<td>402.226</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>-4625.132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dimension1</td>
<td>4&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>2&lt;sup&gt;nd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>-1010.812</td>
<td>343.328</td>
<td>.003</td>
<td>-1685.725</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dimension1</td>
<td>4&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3&lt;sup&gt;rd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>-159.984</td>
<td>308.147</td>
<td>.604</td>
<td>-765.738</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on estimated marginal means

* The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

a. Adjustment for multiple comparisons: Least Significant Difference (equivalent to no adjustments).

#### Univariate Tests

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Partial Eta Squared</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contrast</td>
<td>5.153E8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.718E8</td>
<td>37.812</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Error</td>
<td>1.853E9</td>
<td>408</td>
<td>4542490.204</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The F tests the effect of Tier. This test is based on the linearly independent pairwise comparisons among the estimated marginal means.
### Table C: Period * Tier

**Dependent Variable:** Citations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Tier</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval</th>
<th>Lower Bound</th>
<th>Upper Bound</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>5123.885</td>
<td>417.985</td>
<td>4302.212</td>
<td>5945.557</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2176.769</td>
<td>591.120</td>
<td>1014.749</td>
<td>3338.789</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>1081.714</td>
<td>465.090</td>
<td>167.442</td>
<td>1995.987</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>493.824</td>
<td>516.919</td>
<td>-522.334</td>
<td>1509.981</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4561.667</td>
<td>307.628</td>
<td>3956.932</td>
<td>5166.401</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1885.125</td>
<td>336.990</td>
<td>1222.672</td>
<td>2547.578</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>603.581</td>
<td>382.795</td>
<td>-148.916</td>
<td>1356.077</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>570.500</td>
<td>314.245</td>
<td>-47.241</td>
<td>1188.241</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3704.000</td>
<td>870.104</td>
<td>1993.553</td>
<td>5414.447</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>856.778</td>
<td>410.171</td>
<td>50.465</td>
<td>1663.090</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>200.941</td>
<td>258.460</td>
<td>-307.137</td>
<td>709.020</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>341.961</td>
<td>242.886</td>
<td>-135.502</td>
<td>819.424</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Post Hoc Tests

**Period**

Citations

**Multiple Comparisons**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(I) Period</th>
<th>(J) Period</th>
<th>Mean Difference (I-J)</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval</th>
<th>Lower Bound</th>
<th>Upper Bound</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>dimension3</td>
<td>-445.21</td>
<td>294.149</td>
<td>.131</td>
<td>-133.03</td>
<td>1023.45</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2022.18*</td>
<td>290.711</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1450.70</td>
<td>2593.66</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>dimension3</td>
<td>-445.21</td>
<td>294.149</td>
<td>.131</td>
<td>-1023.45</td>
<td>133.03</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1576.97*</td>
<td>230.326</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1124.20</td>
<td>2029.75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>dimension3</td>
<td>-2022.18*</td>
<td>290.711</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>-2593.66</td>
<td>-1450.70</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>-1576.97*</td>
<td>230.326</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>-2029.75</td>
<td>-1124.20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on observed means.

The error term is Mean Square(Error) = 4542490.204.

* The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

Note: 8 = 1989 and before, 9 = 1990 to 1999, and 10 = 2000 and after.
### Multiple Comparisons

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(I) Tier</th>
<th>(J) Tier</th>
<th>Mean Difference (I-J)</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval Lower Bound</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval Upper Bound</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3094.61</td>
<td>336.990</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>2432.16</td>
<td>3757.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>dimension3</td>
<td>3094.61</td>
<td>336.990</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>-3757.07</td>
<td>-2432.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4220.97</td>
<td>307.628</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>3616.24</td>
<td>4825.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>dimension3</td>
<td>1126.36</td>
<td>307.628</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>521.62</td>
<td>1731.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1149.96</td>
<td>298.710</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>562.75</td>
<td>1737.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-3094.61</td>
<td>336.990</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>-3757.07</td>
<td>-2432.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>dimension3</td>
<td>-1126.36</td>
<td>307.628</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>-1731.09</td>
<td>-521.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1149.96</td>
<td>298.710</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>562.75</td>
<td>1737.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-4220.97</td>
<td>307.628</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>-4825.71</td>
<td>-3616.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>dimension3</td>
<td>-1149.96</td>
<td>298.710</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>-1737.16</td>
<td>-562.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-4244.57</td>
<td>298.710</td>
<td>.092</td>
<td>-497.62</td>
<td>344.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>dimension3</td>
<td>-23.60</td>
<td>265.142</td>
<td>.929</td>
<td>-544.81</td>
<td>497.62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on observed means.  
The error term is Mean Square(Error) = 4542490.204.  
* The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.
An Exploration of Institutional Climate and Supports Enabling Career Growth for Female Leaders at Utah Valley University

Susan Seymour
City University of Seattle

Anne Wairepo
Utah Valley University

This study investigates the underrepresentation of female leaders at Utah institutions compared to peer institutions and national averages. Using one Utah institution as a case study, this research considers existing female leadership dynamics in relationship to institutional support and climate factors. It also considers opportunities for developing an executive female leadership pipeline despite challenging contextual factors such as a conservative religious culture, an institutional climate that is challenged by perceptions of diversity and fairness, and few female role models.

INTRODUCTION

Utah, containing the headquarters of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (LDS) and heavily populated by members of this conservative Christian church, provides a unique environment to study women’s leadership issues. Due to the Church’s religious doctrine that emphasizes a patriarchal family structure (Walker, 1990), the divine role of motherhood (Miles, 2008), and a cultural tendency to marry young and have large families (Dodwell, 2013), there are unique contextual factors affecting women who choose careers, let alone those who wish to ascend into executive leadership positions. These contextual factors stem from LDS cultural expectations and result in unique work/life tensions. For example, LDS teachings promote the belief that “women are dependent upon men and upon marriage for exaltation in the afterlife and are subordinate to men on this earth within the family” (Miles, 2008, p.1). While this passage seems to subjugate women, Mormon interpretation would see this as recognition of the distinct and separate roles that men and women fill in relationship to each other, aka. traditional gender roles. Although this distinction in roles would appear inequitable, the Church has always promoted a belief in the equality of women with men – different but equal. Furthermore, while the Church is a staunch champion of traditional family roles and values, it has made doctrinal adjustments over the last several decades to accommodate working women (Miles, 2008).

Today, the number of LDS women in the workplace is approaching the national norm of 50% (Fletcher Stack, 1991), but more are working part-time rather than full-time (Miles, 2008). This lack of focus on career is because the role of work, and even education, is “understood as supporting and subordinate to women’s primary roles as mother and wives” (Mihelich & Storrs, 2003, p. 407). This decline in the value of education was highlighted by the Utah Women and Education Project (UWEP, January, 2010) which investigated why Utah women’s participation in higher education was in recession.
for several decades. Research findings from the project showed that only 49% of higher education students in Utah are women, whereas the national average of female higher education students is 57%. In fact, “when compared to all other states, Utah is last in terms of the percentage of female students enrolled in postsecondary institutions” (UWEP, May, 2010).

Amidst this cultural backdrop, Utah institutions of higher education are trying to positively affect the educational futures of Utah women. However, the unique cultural dynamics in the state contribute to an under representation of female leaders at Utah System of Higher Education Institutions as compared to IPEDS peer institutions (see Table 1). As Table 1 shows, most Utah System of Higher Education (USHE) institutions, with the exception of the University of Utah and Salt Lake Community College have a representation of female executive, administrative and managerial staff of less than 40%. Given that women comprise just over half the general population, it would be expected that women’s representation in leadership positions in USHE institutions would be roughly 50% if gender equity was present.

### TABLE 1

A COMPARISON BETWEEN UTAH SYSTEM OF HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS AND PEER INSTITUTIONS OF FEMALE EXECUTIVE, ADMINISTRATIVE AND MANAGERIAL STAFF AS REPORTED IN IPEDS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Compare Type</th>
<th>Institution Name</th>
<th>2011 Females</th>
<th>2010 Females</th>
<th>2009 Females</th>
<th>2008 Females</th>
<th>2007 Females</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peer</td>
<td>Metropolitan State College of Denver</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer</td>
<td>California State University-Northridge</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer</td>
<td>Boise State University</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer</td>
<td>Northern Kentucky University</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer</td>
<td>Youngstown State University</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USHE</td>
<td>University of Utah</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer</td>
<td>Kennesaw State University</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USHE</td>
<td>Salt Lake Community College</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer</td>
<td>Ferris State University</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer</td>
<td>University of Alaska Anchorage</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USHE</td>
<td>Utah Valley University</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer</td>
<td>Indiana University-Purdue-Fort Wayne</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USHE</td>
<td>Dixie State College of Utah</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USHE</td>
<td>Utah State University</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USHE</td>
<td>Southern Utah University</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USHE</td>
<td>Weber State University</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USHE</td>
<td>Snow College</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To understand the dynamics surrounding female leadership and advancement at one institution of higher education in Utah, the President of Utah Valley University commissioned a task force to investigate challenges related to female recruitment, retention and promotion and make recommendations to the executive cabinet. In order to assist the task force, this research was conducted to understand female leaders’ desire to advance and to explore the institutional climate and supports that may or may not contribute to their advancement. In addition to assisting the institution’s task force, through this study, we add to leadership literature by exploring culturally relevant understandings of women’s desires to advance in academia within an environment heavily influenced by conservative religious mores.

The total percentage of women leaders at an institution does not paint a full picture of female leadership. Research indicates that although women are well represented in the lower rungs of
management (White House Project, 2011), there is “strong evidence of gender disparity among positions with higher salaries and greater powers” (Monroe, Ozyurt, Wrigley, & Alexander, 2008, p. 216). This trend is mirrored in the leadership distribution at Utah Valley University (Table 2).

### TABLE 2
PERCENT OF FEMALES IN LEADERSHIP POSITIONS AT UTAH VALLEY UNIVERSITY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Females</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Director</td>
<td>52.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Director</td>
<td>50.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Director</td>
<td>36.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Director</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department Chair</td>
<td>22.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Deans</td>
<td>80.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Dean</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dean</td>
<td>14.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant VP</td>
<td>25.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate VP</td>
<td>23.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFO (1 person)</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VP</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When an organization values women and men equally, there should be gender balance at the entry, middle, and senior levels. When institutions exclude women from senior leadership positions, they lose out on the benefits diversity brings such as increased creativity and problem solving, improved productivity, and the ability to attract and retain talent. Today, women account for only 18% of top level leaders across all business sectors and make 78.7 cents to every dollar earned by men – a wage gap that increases with age (The White House Project, 2011). Furthermore, although women comprise the majority of college students (57% nationally) and receive the majority of college degrees, they make up only 26% of full professors and 23 percent of university presents (14% of presidents at doctoral granting institutions). Lack of progress breaking the glass ceiling is illustrated by the fact that the number of female presidents at colleges and universities has not changed in ten years. Additionally, women have regressed in closing the wage gap. In 1972, female faculty made 83% of what males made, today they make 82% (The White House Project, 2011).

### BENEFITS OF FEMALE LEADERSHIP

Organizations benefit in myriad ways when female leaders are developed and promoted. Females contribute to diversity, and diverse workplaces reduce employee turnover, utilize a diverse talent pool, and contribute creativity, innovation and entrepreneurialism to the workforce. Furthermore, diverse groups are high performing groups; a report by Ernst & Young showed that even if a homogenous group is more capable, a diverse group will almost always outperform a group of ‘the best’ by a substantial margin (2009).

Women who are visible leaders also serve as powerful role models to young women and normalize women’s leadership for both men and women. Moreover, women have many characteristics endemic of strong leadership. In a 2008 Pew Research Center study, the public rated women above men in five of eight character traits they value highly in their leaders (honesty, intelligence, creativity, outgoingness, compassion) and equal to men in two other characteristics (hardworking and ambitious). Men rated higher in only one characteristic, decisiveness, but they did so by a margin of ten percent.

Although the Pew study ranked men higher in decisiveness, benefits of female leadership include ‘risk smart’ leadership that approaches decision making from a decidedly different perspective (Catalyst,
Women’s approach to leadership diminishes risk because they “tend to include diverse viewpoints in decision making, have a broader conception of public policy, and are also more likely to work through differences to form coalitions, complete objectives, and bring disenfranchised communities to the table” (Catalyst, 2004, p.6).

Diversity in leadership not only promotes fairness but has distinct financial advantages. Fortune 500 companies with more women on their boards outperformed their competitors with 42% higher return in sales, 53% higher return on equity, and 66% higher return on investment capital (Catalyst, 2007).

Despite substantial and compelling evidence of the financial advantages when women sit on corporate boards, women hold only 14% of board seats at companies on the S&P Composite 1500 Index (Credit Suisse Research Institute, 2012). To rectify gender gap imbalances at executive levels and to have a positive influence on economic growth and corporate responsibility, companies and nations are taking action. Norway has mandated a 40% quota for female board participation and Finland has required companies with no or low numbers of women on their boards to disclose the reasons in their annual reports (Noble, 2013). Moreover, in 2012 the European Union approved a plan that calls on publically listed companies to sign a voluntary commitment to increase women’s presence on their boards to 40% by 2020 (European Commission, 2012).

EXISTING DATA ON INSTITUTIONAL CLIMATE

In 2012, the Chronicle Great Colleges to Work for Survey was distributed to Utah Valley University employees. Overall, 83% of employees had pride in the institution and 71% of employees had positive evaluations of their work environment. But despite these and other strong positive ratings across many indicators assessing the institution’s climate, five measures registered a disparity of 9% or more between male and female employees. These measures are presented in Table 3 and the two most prominent differences are that women feel promotions are not based on a person’s ability and they do not feel they can challenge a traditional way of doing something without fear of harming their careers. Furthermore, the item that received the lowest score in the Great Colleges to Work For Survey was ‘Fairness’ with only 60% of UVU’s employees giving favorable scores on the institution’s climate of fairness.

**TABLE 3**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Promotions in my department are based on a person's ability.</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can speak up or challenge a traditional way of doing something without fear of harming my career.</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am regularly recognized for my contributions.</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes that affect me are discussed prior to being implemented.</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am paid fairly for my work.</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data from the Higher Education Research Institution (HERI) survey, delivered in the 2010-2011 academic year, also contained statements related to gender equity. Because women are often judged by the same career measures as men, it is helpful to show that many women experience different types of stresses than men, indicating the playing field for career advancement is not level. For example, in the past two years, Utah Valley University female faculty have experienced twice the stress than their male colleagues in managing household responsibilities, child care, elder care, discrimination, dealing with
children’s problems, and being part of a dual career couple. Furthermore, these measures were higher for Utah women in all categories and lower for Utah men, with the exception of elder care and children’s problems, when measured against their male and female counterparts at comparable institutions. This data (Table 4) suggests UVU females experience greater non-career related stress than females at other institutions, males at other institutions and males at their own institution.

TABLE 4
HIGHER EDUCATION RESEARCH INSTITUTION QUESTIONS PERTAINING TO GENDER SPECIFIC STRESS, 2010-2011

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Utah Valley</th>
<th>Comp. Inst.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Managing household</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>responsibilities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extensive</td>
<td>12.6%</td>
<td>15.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat</td>
<td>55.2%</td>
<td>58.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not at all</td>
<td>32.2%</td>
<td>26.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child care</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extensive</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
<td>13.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat</td>
<td>35.4%</td>
<td>35.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not at all</td>
<td>63.1%</td>
<td>51.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care of elderly parent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extensive</td>
<td>3.4%</td>
<td>9.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat</td>
<td>49.2%</td>
<td>32.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not at all</td>
<td>47.5%</td>
<td>58.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtle discrimination</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e.g., prejudice, racism, sexism)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extensive</td>
<td>4.9%</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat</td>
<td>13.4%</td>
<td>18.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not at all</td>
<td>81.7%</td>
<td>77.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children’s problems</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extensive</td>
<td>7.6%</td>
<td>7.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat</td>
<td>36.4%</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not at all</td>
<td>56.1%</td>
<td>59.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being part of a dual</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>career couple</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extensive</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
<td>6.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat</td>
<td>29.9%</td>
<td>35.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not at all</td>
<td>67.2%</td>
<td>57.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Another interesting finding from the HERI was the disparity in the way men and women felt women were being treated at Utah Valley University. In response to the question, “Women faculty are treated fairly here”, 57.5% of men strongly agreed with this statement compared to 30.8% of women who strongly agreed they were treated fairly. Conversely, the percentage of men disagreeing with this statement was 6.8%, whereas 19.2% (1/5 of the female faculty population) somewhat or strongly disagreed that “women faculty are treated fairly”.

Data from both the HERI and the Great Colleges to Work for Survey shaped the development of survey questions for this research. The intent was to build on existing institutional data to gain a greater
awareness of climate issues related to or limiting career growth for women at UVU and to improve an understanding of the supports necessary to facilitate advancement. The survey was designed to collect data on past exposure to and success with leadership programs as well as the desire for future programming. The survey also considered the desire to advance and assessed the institutional climate factors related to leadership for both men and women. The research questions were:

1. What is the current representation of female leaders in senior executive positions at Utah Valley University and how many mid-level leaders aspire to these positions?
2. What institutional supports could contribute to female leader advancement at Utah Valley University?
3. What institutional climate dynamics present obstacles to female leader advancement at Utah Valley University?

**METHOD**

The sample was comprised of institutional leaders determined with a data set provided by the Human Resources Department. From the administrative side of the institution, all leaders with the title of director (whether Assistant Director, Associate Director, Director, Senior Director) or above (Assistant Vice President, Associate Vice President, Vice President, or member of the executive cabinet) were included in the sample. From the academic side of the institution, all Department Chairs, Assistant Deans, Associate Deans and Deans were surveyed.

One limitation of this study was the inability to include past department chairs or faculty leaders with interim posts in the sample. The fixed nature of the data sample did not enable a larger consideration of leadership within academics which presents a diminished understanding of the institution’s faculty leadership pipeline.

Two hundred and seventy-seven institutional leaders were sent an online survey which was open for eighteen days; 169 surveys were completed (61% response rate). The distribution of respondents across job category is as follows: Assistant Director (20), Associate Director (12), Director (71), Senior Director (10), Department Chair (24), Assistant Dean, Associate Dean, Dean (14), and Assistant V.P., Associate V.P., V.P., or other member of the Executive Cabinet (18). Thirty-six percent of the respondents were female and 64% were male.

**DATA, ANALYSIS & FINDINGS**

**Support for Leadership Development**

Utah Valley University offers a formal leadership development program. The formal leadership development program is an eleven month program that seeks to give forum participants the opportunity to participate in and learn about senior leadership in a university setting. The forum is comprised of twelve fellows, both faculty and staff, selected from a pool of applicants across campus. Fellows participate in a retreat, forum seminars, enrichment experiences and mentorship by an executive cabinet member or senior leader at the institution.

The Human Resource Department offers a development program designed to help UVU’s current and future supervisory employees become engaged leaders. The program is offered three times a year, and focuses on the development of successful people management skills. The Human Resource Department also offers monthly one day workshops on topical subjects related to interpersonal skills which are designed to provide opportunities for employees to learn to be better leaders.

As presented in Table 5, both male and female leaders have participated in and benefited from the formal leadership training program offered at Utah Valley and non-Utah Valley leader programs in relatively equal numbers, but females attended and benefited from HR trainings at a significantly higher rate than their male colleagues. Also, females expressed a belief that future participation in leadership development would benefit them at higher rates than their male counterparts across all four measures.
Men expressed high levels of interest in these leadership development programs, but questioned the degree it would benefit their careers.

Approximately half of leaders surveyed have been mentored in the past by senior leaders and benefited from the experience. Mentorship is also the leadership development opportunity from which participants believe they would most benefit in the future. If leaders stated they would like to participate in and felt they would benefit from mentorship in the future, they were asked a follow-up question regarding which characteristics they wished to share with their mentor. More than half of women chose gender (56.3%) as a characteristic they felt would be beneficial in the mentor relationship – the only mentor characteristic that was statistically significant when chosen by men or women.

### TABLE 5

**PAST AND FUTURE LEADERSHIP PREPARATION ACTIVITIES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Past Participation</th>
<th>Future Participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>not aware</td>
<td>no participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>participated &amp; no</td>
<td>participated &amp; no</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>benefit</td>
<td>benefit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UVU leader training</td>
<td>F 16.1%</td>
<td>43.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6.5%</td>
<td>33.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M 17.3%</td>
<td>44.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.9%</td>
<td>36.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10.9%</td>
<td>30.4%*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>58.7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR Training</td>
<td>F 11.3%</td>
<td>25.8%*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9.7%</td>
<td>53.2%*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M 23.1%</td>
<td>43.3%*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6.7%</td>
<td>26.9%*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8.7%</td>
<td>47.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>43.5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-UVU leader programs</td>
<td>F 24.2%</td>
<td>24.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.2%</td>
<td>48.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M 18.3%</td>
<td>32.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.9%</td>
<td>47.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7.5%</td>
<td>31.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>61.2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentorship with</td>
<td>F 22.6%</td>
<td>19.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>senior leaders</td>
<td>8.1%*</td>
<td>50.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M 22.1%</td>
<td>28.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.0%*</td>
<td>48.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.0%</td>
<td>31.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>65.7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Leadership Advancement**

Both female (77.0%) and male (67.0%) leaders surveyed revealed they aspire to higher levels of leadership than they currently hold. Participants that do not aspire to higher levels of leadership cited contentment with current position as the most common reason not to advance. Those who stated they wanted to advance their career where then asked about challenges related to advancement.

As shown in Table 6, men and women were similarly confident about their qualifications for advancement, opportunities at the institution, and the appeal of positions to which they aspire. However, women stated that advancement would make it difficult to fulfill family or childcare responsibilities at twice the rate of their male colleagues (31.1% vs. 15.3%). Additionally, more women (46.7%) than men (33.9%) agreed that advancement would be disruptive to their work/life balance.

Women indicated less of a willingness to pursue additional education necessary for advancement. Of those surveyed, 35.5% have doctorate degrees, 37.9% have master’s degrees, 16.0% have bachelor degrees, and 10.7% have associate degrees or less. Of the doctorate degree holders, only 25% belong to women. Master’s degrees are more equally distributed across gender with 46.9% of master’s degrees held by female leaders at Utah Valley University.
### TABLE 6
CHALLENGES RELATED TO ADVANCEMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>n/a</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I believe I am qualified to advance beyond my current position.</td>
<td>F 35.6%</td>
<td>53.3%</td>
<td>8.9%</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M 33.8%</td>
<td>60.0%</td>
<td>4.6%</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I believe there are opportunities that will enable me to advance.</td>
<td>F 11.1%</td>
<td>40.0%</td>
<td>24.4%</td>
<td>22.2%</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M 9.2%</td>
<td>38.5%</td>
<td>33.8%</td>
<td>18.5%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The experience of leaders in positions to which I might advance appears appealing.</td>
<td>F 8.9%</td>
<td>64.4%</td>
<td>13.3%</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M 13.8%</td>
<td>64.6%</td>
<td>16.9%</td>
<td>3.1%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advancement will make it difficult to fulfill family or childcare responsibilities.</td>
<td>F 6.7%</td>
<td>24.4%</td>
<td>8.9%</td>
<td>31.3%</td>
<td>24.4%</td>
<td>4.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M 1.5%</td>
<td>13.8%</td>
<td>21.5%</td>
<td>36.9%</td>
<td>23.1%</td>
<td>3.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am concerned advancement will be disruptive to my work/life balance.</td>
<td>F 11.1%</td>
<td>35.6%</td>
<td>24.4%</td>
<td>24.4%</td>
<td>4.4%*</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M 7.7%</td>
<td>26.2%</td>
<td>15.4%</td>
<td>33.8%</td>
<td>16.9%*</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am willing to pursue additional education necessary for advancement.</td>
<td>F 26.7%</td>
<td>28.9%</td>
<td>24.4%</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
<td>8.9%*</td>
<td>8.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M 30.8%</td>
<td>38.5%</td>
<td>18.5%</td>
<td>7.7%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

With regards to past motivation to advance, roughly one-third of both male and female leaders stated they had no explicit communication from senior leaders to advance, but indicated this would have a great effect on their motivation to advance in the future (see Table 7). Encouragement to maintain work/life balance has had modest effect on past motivation to advance, with both female and male leaders indicating it would moderately or greatly affect future motivation (80% and 78.5% respectively). Female role models have had a significant effect in past motivation for advancement and a significant number of women (31.1%) suggest it will greatly affect their future motivation to advance as well.

### TABLE 7
PAST AND FUTURE MOTIVATION TO ADVANCE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Past Motivation to Advance</th>
<th>Future Motivation to Advance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No Experience</td>
<td>No Affect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explicit communication from senior leadership to advance.</td>
<td>F 32.8%</td>
<td>4.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M 3.0%</td>
<td>35.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encouragement from supervisors to maintain work/life balance.</td>
<td>F 37.7%</td>
<td>16.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M 35.0%</td>
<td>22.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role models of similar gender or ethnicity.</td>
<td>F 24.6%</td>
<td>24.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M 24.0%</td>
<td>39.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As discussed earlier, existing institutional data pointed to discrepancies between men and women in their views related to a climate of equity and diversity at the institution; findings from this survey support this observation (see Table 8). For example, fewer women (42.6%) than men (68.0%) agreed with the statement “Diversity is important at this institution”, and twice the number women (37.7%) than men (19.0%) disagreed that Utah Valley is effectively practicing diversity in career advancement. Additionally, men agreed 10.4% more often than women that the institution is effectively implementing its core theme of inclusion.

Women experience a significant difference from men in the strength of their ability to express their beliefs and personalities in the workplace. The difference between men and women in their combined agreement scores is 9.1%, which is slightly lower than the 2012 Great Colleges to Work for Survey data.
that showed a 10% difference between men and women regarding the statement, “I can speak up or challenge a traditional way of doing something without harming my career”.

The Great Colleges to Work for Survey also revealed a 13% difference in agreement between men and women regarding the statement, “Promotions in my department are based on a person’s ability”. Similarly, in this survey, females expressed 10.1% less agreement than males with the assertion that their qualifications would be the most important factor considered for promotion. Women also expressed 9.6% less agreement that there are opportunities for advancement, and 9.1% less agreement that their pay is comparable to others of the same rank and service time. Despite the disparity between men and women on these climate issues, women and men had similar agreement related to their ideas being considered (68.8% to 65% respectively) and equal agreement on being recognized for contributions (56.0%).

**TABLE 8**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CLIMATE DYNAMICS RELATED TO DIVERSITY AND GENDER EQUITY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Diversity is important at this institution.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>UVU is effectively implementing its core theme of inclusion.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>UVU effectively practices diversity in career advancement.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>I can express my personality and beliefs in the workplace.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Qualifications are the most important factor for promotions.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>I have the opportunity for advancement within this institution.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>When I offer an idea, I believe it will be considered.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>I am appropriately recognized for my contributions.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>My pay is comparable to others of the same rank.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Findings from this study suggest that while both male and female leaders have benefited from past leadership development efforts, they desire additional support for career advancement. In open ended comments, both men and women cite personal goals, a desire to improve the University, and the appeal of increased responsibility and pay as motivations to advance. However, themes indicative of leader complaints were the lack of “clear and honest communication” regarding advancement, lack of leadership training opportunities, the belief that “loyal Utah Valley employees” should be promoted rather than hiring external candidates, and suspicion that “outside influences impact hiring decisions”.

Women attempting to ascend leadership ladders perceive the climate as less supportive than their male counterparts. Comments such as “knowing the glass ceiling is a mile thick is not encouraging”, “explicit statements from senior administrators to include more women and minorities in leadership positions”, “the vast majority of key Utah Valley positions are white males, seeing someone like me is important”, “if this institutions advertises diversity, it needs to embrace it in hiring and promotion practices”, and “Utah Valley would greatly benefit from the promotion of greater numbers of qualified women and minorities” represent gender equity concerns from some of the institution’s female leaders.
Although altering institutional climate is challenging, recommendations for Utah Valley University women as well as department and institutional suggestions are presented below. The degree to which these recommendations are considered, promoted and adapted by UVU will ultimately be decided by the Women and Leadership Task Force, senior leaders at the University, and women within the institutional community themselves.

INSIGHTS & RECOMMENDATIONS

Diversity Goals

As a federal subcontractor, Utah Valley University is required to maintain an affirmative action plan that explains how they recruit and advance qualified minorities, women, persons with disabilities, and covered veterans (Department of Labor, 2013). Furthermore, an institutional policy exists which charges Human Resources with the responsibility to write, implement, monitor, and update the University’s affirmative action program in compliance with the law and to provide an annual program report of activities to President’s Council.

Affirmative Actions include training programs, outreach efforts, and other positive steps designed to ensure equal employment opportunity. Affirmative Action programs analyze and audit the composition of the institutional workforce and compare it to the composition of relevant labor pools. If women and minorities are not being employed at a rate to be expected, given their availability in the relevant labor pool, the affirmative action program defines specific steps to address this underutilization. Affirmative Action programs do not create a quota system, create preferences, or discriminate against non-minorities (MIT, Human Resource Department, 2013).

Seeing that policies and practices already exist to document and monitor progress towards Affirmative Action measures, it is recommended that these practices be made as transparent as possible and that the institution advertise its diversity goals. Given the climate concerns regarding fairness and gender equity that emerged in this and previous institutional surveys, communication regarding the steps the institution is taking to rectify the gender gap in leadership as well as other areas of the workforce seems advisable. A diversity initiative requires the oversight and accountability of senior leadership as well as a climate of transparency and trust in order for it to be championed towards determined outcomes.

Campus Dialogues

One of the interesting artifacts from this study was the large number of participants who wished to engage in campus dialogues regarding leadership development. Seventy-seven research participants (71.1% of the female and 69.2% of the male research participants) indicated a desire to join in campus dialogues regarding leadership development. To accommodate this interest, it is recommended that campus dialogues be scheduled to gain feedback from the campus community regarding their leadership needs, inclusion concerns and to disseminate information regarding equity initiatives.

Although the research questions focused on the development of female leaders, it is recommended that two additional dynamics influence the tenor of the dialogues. First of all, men need an opportunity to voice their feelings and concerns about their own leadership needs. Second, the campus dialogues should be used as an occasion to strengthen male advocacy for diversity initiatives. Gender equity programs that focus solely on developing women have limited success (Catalyst, 2009). Institutions must enlist both men and women to work together to change organizational cultures that perpetuate gender inequities. UVU wishes to be seen as an inclusive campus, it should make efforts to help men recognize that gender bias exists and understand the dynamics that perpetuate its existence.

One of the qualitative findings from this study was frustration over lack of communication and clear expectations surrounding career opportunities, advancement, and hiring practices. It is recommended that these campus dialogues be used to foster open dialogue as an opportunity to disseminate information from this research, existing institutional policies and practices, and recommendations from the Women’s Leadership Task Force. It would also be helpful to have representatives from senior leadership and
Human Resources present to hear the opinions of Utah Valley leaders regarding diversity and career advancement.

**Utah Women as Root Bound Leaders**

Many leaders at Utah Valley University maintain long tenures in their positions. At the senior executive level, the average length of service time reported is 20.37 years for women and 14.42 years for men. The average service time for Senior Directors is 14.05 years for women and 13.6 years for men; Directors service time is 11.44 years and 10.58 years for women and men respectively. Faculty have greater movement within their careers because department chair postings are for two years, but service time at the institution is still lengthy at 9.28 years for women and 10.28 years for men. Deans have the shortest average service time at 2.9 years for women and 8.39 years for men. With such long service times, executive leadership positions are far and few between. Thus, competition for these positions will be fierce and women must plan to compete with external candidates who may bring a wide variety of experiences to the table.

Women seeking to ascend the career ladder often compete for positions against men who have a greater diversity of experience due to their mobility. A study by Catalyst (2012) found men more willing to relocate than women (56% to 39% respectively). The willingness to relocate for career advancement and opportunity may be compounded for some Utah women because in the LDS culture, work is understood as supporting and subordinate to her primary role as mother and wife (Mihelich & Storrs, 2003). Even if a woman has risen through the ranks of an institution, she may be conflicted about uprooting her family in order to expand and diversify her own career goals. Although she may have fostered deep and rich experiences within her own back yard, these experiences may not compare to other candidates who have experiences across a wide variety of institutions and states. The unwillingness or inability of some Utah women to leave the state automatically creates a disadvantage in the hiring process because women’s encumbered choices leave her local experience at a comparative disadvantage.

Given the dynamics that make women less mobile than their male counterparts, it would be helpful if a larger understanding of these issues is considered and represented in hiring decisions. That said, Utah Valley University is driven by its mission and has a responsibility to its students, community and stakeholders to be a serious institution. It cannot afford to hire women simply to meet diversity goals - it must strive to hire the most qualified and talented individuals. Therefore, it is recommended that ‘root bound’ female leaders figure out ways to mimic a diverse set of career experiences in order to compete with men who are more mobile. This may prove to be a difficult and uncharted path, but as the institution pushes towards diversity, so too should female leaders consider diversity within their own resumes.

**Doctorate Degrees for Female Leaders**

As a serious institution, Utah Valley fosters a culture of academic rigor and professional excellence. One measure of professional excellence is the number of doctorate degrees held by full time faculty, which is 59% at the time of this writing. Within the Academic Affairs Division there is increasing pressure for executive leaders to hold doctorate degrees because they will be negotiating and working with faculty with this level of degree. Despite the need for executive leaders in key positions to have a doctorate degree, this research revealed that a modest 35.5% of the leaders surveyed have doctorate degrees; of those only 25% were earned by women.

Utah cultural dynamics may minimize the importance of this level of education for women. In a survey conducted by the Utah Women and Education Project, Utahns indicated that men should have more education than women. Forty-nine percent of those sampled stated that the minimum level of education a male should receive is four-years or higher, but only 39% believed females need this same level of education (UWEP, January, 2010). In addition to cultural pressures, many women delay or deny pursuing a doctorate degree due to childrearing or marital responsibilities, which may disadvantaged them when they seek promotions.

In other institutional divisions (Student Affairs, University Relations, Administration, etc.) the importance of the doctorate degree related to hiring and advancement is less clear. For women at Utah
Valley, it would be beneficial to know expectations related to degree achievement so they could pursue career opportunities that align with their professional goals. However, even with this kind of alignment, a woman must recognize that without a doctorate degree, her chances of advancement will become increasingly strained the higher she climbs in academia. Thus, it is recommended that women who seek to advance their careers at Utah Valley pursue higher education. That said, academic leaders must recognize the extra burden this places on women who are in their childbearing years or who are the sole providers for their families. For women who are financially able to attend graduate school, either through a distance program or through one of the three local universities that provide offerings, the verbal support and appropriate time-off to pursue studies would be advantageous. For Utah Valley women who demonstrate financial need, it is recommended that a scholarship be considered for women seeking to advance their careers by pursuing a doctorate degree.

**Recruiting and Retaining Diversity**

Utah Valley University’s Human Resource Department has the potential to play a vital role in championing diversity initiatives. Currently, there is no formal diversity training offered for staff that could strengthen an awareness of Affirmative Action initiatives and the benefits of a diverse workforce. The Human Resource Department does offer a Safe Hire training that describes the lawful treatment of protected classes, but resources for hiring committees and departments on the recruitment and retention of underutilized classes have not yet been developed. Diversity training and hiring resources would be helpful in promoting more equitable recruitment and hiring practices, and it is recommended that Utah Valley communicate its plans for these types of initiatives in order to maximize transparency and fairness while minimizing distrust of hiring procedures.

Utah Valley University has another challenge it should consider if it aims to hire increasingly diverse and highly qualified faculty and staff. Qualified candidates from outside the state may be leery about relocating their career to an area so highly influenced by a dominant religious culture that is foreign to them. Thus, it is recommended that resources are created that assist prospective hires, new hires, and hiring committees to address issues of culture shock and assimilation. Other institutions in Utah have addressed gaps of understanding between individuals new to Utah and Utah/Mormon culture in ways that cultivate curiosity and respect (Westminster, 2010). However, when these issues are not addressed, the lack of dialogue could easily turn to confusion and contempt if a new hire is experiencing culture shock and left to their own devices to recognize and resolve their sense of displacement. Resources that promote understanding and respect for cultural differences, as well as an awareness of the stages of cultural adaptation, may have a positive effect in the recruitment and retention of female leaders from outside the state.

**Female Leadership Program**

Findings from this study indicate that the University needs to develop more women for leadership in higher education (e.g., increase aspirations, develop skills and competencies, obtain mentors and coaches). Because leadership development programs are a critical element in teaching and supporting women in higher education to prepare for, attain, and maintain positions of influence within their institutions (Madsen, 2012), it is recommended that a female leadership program be developed at Utah Valley University. As Baltodano states, given “the currently stalled progress in moving more qualified and deserving women into positions of leadership, combined with the critical need for creative and innovative leadership in higher education, the call for women’s leadership development programs for women faculty, administrators, and staff in higher education is imperative” (2012, p.65).

Institutions across the globe are working to design programs that will effectively develop the leadership skills of female faculty, staff, and administrators (Airini Collings, Conner, McPherson, Mids & Wilson, 2011; Madsen, Longman, & Daniels, 2012). Successful initiatives at other universities have combined efforts from different areas on campus (Bonebright, Cottle, & Lonqu, 2012; Horsnby, Morrow-Jones, & Ballam, 2012), but it appears that a collaboration between the Human Resources Department and the Women’s Success Center would be most effective. The Women’s Success Center has
experience designing programs and targeted strategies for helping Utah Valley women achieve success. Therefore, their expertise has the potential to “bring exponential benefits not only by expanding the pool of gifted individuals to meet today’s current leadership challenges but also by providing role models for future generations of leadership” (Longman and Lafreniere, 2012, p 58). In this way a female leadership development program not only benefits faculty and staff, but also gives female students an understanding of supports helpful to prepare and successfully compete in university leadership advancement.

SUMMARY

Utah Valley University is a dynamic and growing institution with a rich history of innovation and adaptation. Furthermore, the University is situated in a state with conservative religious mores that has promoted traditional roles for women. These traditional female roles create unique tensions for women attempting to ascend into leadership positions within academia and Utah institutions are lagging behind in equitable representation of female leaders. As Utah Valley confronts these realities, there will be a tension between the way things have been done for years and new ways of considering the future. This research and the contemplation of Utah Valley’s commitment to gender equity and diversity initiatives is one step towards considering, confronting and resolving this tension. If Utah Valley is willing and able to champion equity across all levels of the institution, it will remain a place people love to work and a vital and innovative hub of learning, but gain the potential of being a model for inclusive environments of excellence.

POSTSCRIPT

Within a few months of this research being presented to the Executive Cabinet, the Vice President of Student Affairs accepted a presidency position in another state. The President of UVU took this opportunity to conduct an administrative reorganization of his cabinet and promoted two long-term female leaders within the institution: the CFO who had served 33 years and the Associate Vice President of Enrollment Management who had served for 17 years. This changed the representation of women in the vice presidency from 0% to 33% overnight. The president communicated these changes in a letter to the institution in which he stated, “The appointment of [these women] first and foremost reflects their individual competence as institutional leaders. But, importantly, it also reflects my personal commitment to increasing representation of women in leadership positions at every level of the institution, starting with the senior-most level.” The women across campus cheered.

REFERENCES


Making a Difference: Role of Women Religious in Bridging Democratic Leadership in Africa

Jane Wakahiu
Marywood University

Women religious play a colossal role in bridging democratic leadership gap thorough programs that address needs for the underprivileged. Using 22 women participants of a three-year Hilton Foundation funded Sisters Leadership Development Initiative; this study examines the impetus for Catholic Sisters starting development programs in Africa, and implications of ethics of care in their practice of leadership. Data were collected through a Survey Monkey and face-to-face interviews. Findings indicate the overarching goal of their programs is to alleviate poverty for the underserved, to improve life and to increase opportunities for self-reliance. Also, capacity building programs increase effectiveness in service delivery.

INTRODUCTION

Under-representation of women in positions of leadership within the church, government, corporate and non-profit sector around the globe is common (Ngunjiri & Gramby-Sobukwe, 2012; Wakahiu & Salvaterra, 2012; Madimbo, 2012). Although the landscape is changing with more women in Africa taking on leadership roles in governments, corporate and not-for-profit, by and large fewer females hold top management positions. For example, there are very few women who have held positions as president or vice-president in Africa. Some of the celebrated heroines are Presidents Ellen Johnson-Sirleaf of Liberia and Joyce Banda of Malawi and Vice Presidents Marina Barampana of Burundi and Phumzile Mlambo-Ngcuka of South Africa. These women are a source of inspiration to other women; they tell a story that women have a capacity to lead.

In the same vein, in sub-Sahara Africa, far fewer females than males have the opportunity to acquire higher education, a prerequisite for taking on high profile leadership roles. Women in SSA continue to struggle to break the glass ceiling phenomenon as well as to redefine leadership and power in their own terms and cultural context. According to Wirth (2001), glass ceiling refers to the invisible barriers created by attitudinal prejudices to block women from taking on senior executive positions. These barriers may be invisible; (Ngunjiri, 2010; Bjork, 2006), nevertheless they limit women from holding top-management positions. Some of these barriers are culturally mediated and some are because of lack of job-relevant skills, education or experience (Powell 2000; Wakahiu & Salvaterra, 2012; Bjork, 2006; Madibo, 2012). Moreover, the credibility of women in leadership has not been fully accepted even when they have all the qualifications needed to assume a leadership position (Ngunjiri, 2006; Maathai, 2006). Madimbo (2012) argues that the entire social structure makes it difficult for women to penetrate through and be accepted as leaders. In some cases, women have to work harder to prove their capability. Wangari Maathai, in the Unbowed, explicitly shows the struggle she had to go through for male political counterparts to accept
that she can play the roles of both mother and a political career. Furthermore, in *Women’s spiritual leadership in Africa: Tempered radicals and critical servant leaders*, Ngunjiri (2010) explicates stories of ten women who suffered immensely to be recognized in Kenya as role models, educators, leaders and advocates of human rights. The struggle of women and lack of inclusion in management of corporations, and organizations suggests denial of their democratic rights and thwarting their own development.

The focal point of this study is propelled by various questions: what is the role of women religious in bridging democratic leadership in Africa? How can the underprivileged persons be engaged to become active in community participation? Can leadership development programs teach participants to become community leaders?

Individuals cannot fully participate in democratic process without an understanding that their opinions count. In this study, democracy is characterized by advocacy and is based upon the principles of social equality to sweeping requirements for social-economic equality (Kimanthi, 2010). Democracy implies the ability of the people to have equal say in the decisions that affect their lives. However, the vast majority of the underprivileged persons in developing nations may not be fully participating in the decisions that affect their lives. More often than not women are considered as an underprivileged lot. Lack of relevant knowledge and engagement may be a reason for their lack of active participation. Glass ceiling obstacles that include, cultural barriers, gender inequality, low access to loans and investment opportunities continue to hinder women’s development. According to Maslow and Lowery (1998) if deficiency needs are not met, individuals cannot yearn for higher level needs such as aesthetic, self-actualizations, and self-transcendence. Norwood (1999) adds that individuals at the lowest level seek coping information in order to meet the basic needs. In this view, enabling underserved individuals by providing knowledge, skills and providing basic social services may be a strategy to rebuilding their confidence and their ability to participate in a democratic process. Moreover, eliminating barriers that discriminate underserved persons and enabling them access opportunities that build their talents will not only allow them to generate income to support their families but also improve their income level and reliance on government subsidies.

A 2008 study by Cecilia De Mellow established that “women leaders readily fill the gap in their communities left by the absence of the state, effectively work across development sectors, and at individual, community and international levels” (De Mello e Souza, p.482). Women religious in Africa work as social workers, and engage in improving life for their people through myriad activities including job training, home visitors, HIV/Aids care, schools, community health workers, microfinance programs, and rehabilitation for street children. Their programs focus on youth, children, ailing and primarily areas where government services are limited. This study uses cases of women religious from four African nations. Studying these women and their ministries will provide an understanding of their impetus to initiate programs for the underprivileged, and how they bridge democratic leadership in Africa.

This research studies 22 women religious, a portion of over 600 women religious drawn from four sub-Saharan nations of Kenya, Uganda, Ghana and Nigeria. These women are alumnae of a three-year Conrad N. Hilton Foundation funded - Sisters Leadership Development Initiative (SLDI) program. They have achieved top or middle level management status in organizations established to serve underprivileged persons in sub-Saharan Africa. According to a 2011/2012 survey conducted to over 480 congregations of women religious in Ghana, Nigeria, Kenya, Uganda, Tanzania, Zambia, there are over 34,000 women religious serving in these countries (ASEC, 2012). They run projects that include, but not limited to, schools, hospitals, HIV/AIDS, unwed mothers, orphanages and programs for the elderly. Also, they start and serve in educational and healthcare institutions with a goal to provide quality services and promotion of values while alleviating human suffering.

**RESEARCH CONTEXT**

One focus of this study is to establish the voices of women religious in Africa because their voices are missing in leadership literature. Since 1850s European and American missionaries penetrated the African continent with a goal to evangelize and civilize Africa. At the onset, missionaries established schools,
healthcare units and taught catechesis (Obiakor, 2004; Liking, 2000). With time, many African girls joined the missionaries to become women religious (nuns, Catholic sisters) – adopting western religious values. As was the norm, the new entrant negated African norms of marriage and bringing forth families of their own. Their family became the community which they so willingly served and continue to serve. On becoming women religious, they too continued with similar missionary activity (Liking, 2000). To date, Catholic Sisters in sub-Saharan Africa are renowned for their dedication and servant leadership in education, healthcare, social and pastoral services. According to Greenleaf (1998) the desire to be a servant leader begins with a natural feeling in an individual to want to serve, then, a conscious choice to aspire to lead. These women make a conscious choice; spend a time in training and discernment after which they are consecrated through the profession of the evangelical counsels. Their consecration inspires a way of living that has eloquent social impact on the African society – their life and works fundamentally communicate a life of fidelity and authenticity to their vocation in service to their people.

Wakahiu and Salvaterra, (2012) postulates that women religious engage in leadership and management of humanitarian programs at grassroots levels, in community mobilization and in promoting welfare of the underprivileged persons. These women are social constructionist: they are motivated to contribute in eradicating social and economic challenges. They build, launch, and operate projects that tackle social needs that are inadequately addressed by existing institutions. However, no research about their leadership styles, leadership experiences, impacts of the programs they initiate and manage in Africa. Although these women contribute to the development of Africa and its peoples, not many studies reveal their motivation to establish their programs, or what other benefits have been fostered because of their initial efforts. Do these activities engage the underprivileged to take on democratic actions in their localities? Lessons drawn from these women's stories and leadership experiences can inform organizational leaders on ethical and democratic leadership practices in Africa.

A scan of the more than 500 projects operated by the SLDI alumnae reveals that more than half of these projects are located in remote rural regions in Africa and in the slum areas of large cities such as Nairobi and Lagos. These ministries – enable women religious to provide education, alleviate healthcare concerns, empower staff with leadership skills and create jobs leading to social and economic empowerment of the people, a prerequisite for democratic actions. Using a sample of 22 women selected from four African countries, this study examines the underlying motivations that lead Catholic Sisters to initiate these ministries in their locations, performance of these projects despite the low income status of the people being served and the impacts and practices adopted by these women after engaging in the SLDI Program. In addition, this study applies ethics of care to substantiate the work and leadership approach of these women in Africa.

AFRICAN WOMEN’S LEADERSHIP APPROACH AND ETHICAL LENS

Sub-Saharan Africa is characterized by a diverse ethnic composition and heritage. Characteristics include multitude of languages, cultures, structures, and an array of ethnically allied lifestyles (Gyekye, 2002; Wakahiu, 2011). Demarcation of Africa ignored existing ethnic and historical boundaries and local sociopolitical dynamics (Wakahiu, 2011). Despite the diversity, Africa is similar in many respects that define the “African-ness” of the peoples. In this light, Mangaliso (2001) argues that women in SSA manifest characteristic of social connection, they share cultural and historical similarities in the region. Because of the similarities that exist within the region, this study treats the regions as a single entity particularly as it pertains to women religious because their way of life springs from Christianity as brought to the region by missionaries. Although their leadership approaches may differ, there are similarities being that 98% of women religious in Africa live a life that is defined by the teachings of the Catholic Church. In their programs, these women are at the forefront in living out the message of life and love by responding to the perennial and innumerable needs of their people.

Following Africa’s cultural tradition, women’s roles included that of farming, homemakers and subsistence production for the family. Women endeavored to nurture and ensure family stability and community sustainability. The spirit of ubuntu is innate in African women because they are the mothers of
a community. *Ubuntu* refers to “the essence of being human being” illustrated as a person is a person through other persons” (Tutu, 2000, p.31). An individual with *Ubuntu* is open and available to others. Propelled by the spirit of *ubuntu*, it can be argued those women religious respond to their vocation through the spirit of *ubuntu* - to help other people, to create a world where people are cared, nurtured, and where humanity is called to be more conscious in the support of the underprivileged persons.

The leadership styles of these women suggest components of participation, team spirit, collaboration, nurturing and caring. Women religious define their core values as to serve the poor, needy, orphans, and the elderly and to create positive influence for change in the society where they serve through education, nursing and social-welfare programs. According to Lowe (2011) women in Africa have a tendency to promote the welfare of others and not their own welfare. Bass (2010) contends that women are generally more democratic in their approaches to leadership and tend to be more collaborative. The goal of a collaborative leader is to motivate others to follow in ways that are personally and professionally beneficial. Members feel engaged and taking part in the decisions for the growth of their organization. Women are prone to adopt transformational, democratic and collaborative leadership approaches because they are more interested in transforming workplaces into what works best for the organization (Wakahiu & Salvaterra, 2012; Bass, 2010; Ngunjiri, 2010). Lowe (2011) posits that women encourage subordinate to share in the power and participation structures rather than being self-serving. Collaborative leadership is positively correlated with organizational success and employees’ satisfaction (Yukl, 2002; Liking, 2000). Bass (1990) adds that subordinate perceive transformational leaders as more effective within the organization as well as contributing more positively to the company than transactional leaders who work for goals, objectives and justice issues. In addition, Northhouse (2010) posits that the ability of women to collaborate and seek consensus is sometimes realized at personal costs. Therefore, institutions that promote female leadership may stand a good chance for growth and success. On the other hand, too much of listening and soliciting ideas may hinder prompt decision making by women.

Ethical leadership is a requirement for all leaders in corporate, government and not-for-profit organizations. This part examines woman’s leadership with an eye for ethics of care. Ethics of care arose from the scholarly work of feminist appreciation of the importance of care and caring. It is credited to Sara Ruddick, Carol Gilligan and Nel Noddings (Shapiro & Stefkovich, 2005; Held, 2005; Gilligan, 1995; Beckner, 2004). Gilligan (1982) argues that women approach ethics and morality from a relational model and males tend to pursue justice based on rules and rights orientation. Ethics of care is a moral concept that is pertinent in women’s approach to leadership approaches. Majority of women take a leading role in caring and nurturing life, and they use similar approaches in their leadership. For example, Catholic sisters in Africa insinuate their vocation as called to be the light and hope for underprivileged in a society characterized by political instability, rampant conflicts and wars, sickness, and other social concerns – they take lead in initiating projects that address these ills- hence ethics of care. The attributes engrained in the spirit of *ubuntu* are pertinent in ethics of care. *Ubuntu* encourages being human and practicing relational aspects for community or organizational growth.

Held (2005) posits that ethics of care is concerned with transforming the structures within which practices of care take place. In addition, ethics of care is focused to attending the needs of others for whom we have responsibility for. It recognizes that humans are interdependent (Held, 2006; Shapiro & Stefkovich, 2005). For women, care begins with self, home and to the community and society. In addition, ethics of care offers a fruitful way to rethinking about women in leadership particularly in Africa where patriarchal norms continue to inhibit women’s leadership development and the role of care and nurturing that is propagated by women in their communities. For effective leadership, practice of multiple ethical paradigms to make leadership decisions is essential. For this study, ethics of care is applied to facilitate an understanding of the underlying reasons women religious in Africa initiate and run ministries for the underprivileged persons, their preferred leadership practices in their organizations. Studies imply that women tend to view their power and authority from another-centered notion and ways to enable the other (Ngunjiri, 2006; Bass, 1990). These perceptions propel women to want to bring relief and support other persons including colleagues at workplaces. Women listen to their staff more than males.
do. In SSA, the nurturing roles attributed to women learned via cultural socializations easily lead them to want to care for others.

In leading others, women are more sensitive to interpersonal relationships and building community (Lowe, 2011). In their ministries, women religious undertake the responsibility to administer programs that facilitate to transform and encourage living the gospel virtues that perpetuate works of mercy – to feed the hungry, to give drink to the thirsty, to cloth the naked, to harbor the homeless, to visit the sick, to ransom the captive and to instruct the ignorant (Matthew 25: 31-46). To enable the underprivileged persons take on active participation in their communities and to create desired transformations in perception and attitudes providing good environment for empowerment is essential. The underserved feel left out and cannot participate in democracy effectively if their basic needs are not met. Women religious in Africa, take on the tasks to care, to educate, to support and to encourage the underprivileged to grow and reclaim self-confidence and their ability to earn a positive living. It is only then, they can participate effectively in democratic actions.

It can be argued that these women’s leadership is engrained in ethics of care and justice in that they engage the poor by providing them with basic tools to stand for themselves. Caring is a virtue and a caring person is compelled to act that way by a greater power within the self (Held, 2005; Beckner, 2004; Campbell, 2004; Johnson, 2012) and to reach out to others in a responsive way. A caring individual is guided by the need to care, empathy, and trust and is sensitive to alleviating the needs of others. Caring brings inner peace, relief and transformation in another person’s life.

PURPOSE

The purpose of this study is threefold: to examine the underlying motivations of women religious in initiating programs that serve the underserved populations in Africa, to describe the impacts in their ministries after engaging in a planned leadership development program, and to explore the implications of ethics of care as practiced by these women in their organizations. This study responds to the following research questions: a) What are the impetus of women religious in initiating development programs in Africa b) What leadership practices do they consider important and how they apply in their organizations? d) What are the implications of ethics of care in the practice of leadership? e) How does planned leadership development program influence women in the practice of effective leadership?

PROGRAM DESCRIPTION

The SLDI program was envisioned in 2006 by Steven M. Hilton, and operationalized in 2007 through a 2- million dollar grant by the Conrad N. Hilton Foundation to the African Sisters Education Collaborative (ASEC) and Marywood University. The program was designed in a cycle of theory-practice-theory, where participants congregate for four-week workforce development training and return to their ministries to implement the action plans and the knowledge and skills acquired. This competency based program is geared towards imparting the following skills: basic project management, participatory leadership, strategic planning, financial management, human resource management, written and oral communication, fund-raising, project cycle, program evaluation, information/communications systems such as computer tools and software applications for management. At the completion of the program, participants acquire the following skills; personal leadership skills in communications, teamwork, creative problem solving, interpersonal relationships, self-direction flexibility, professionalism, resource management and computer literacy skills. The SLDI objectives are stipulated: a) ability to transfer the skills and knowledge needed for effective project and financial management; b) encouragement of creative and effective leadership; c) increase in abilities to identify and mobilize resources; d) expanded knowledge of development issues that impact the socio-economic and political life of individuals and communities; e) enhancement of skills in human relations; f) development of a strategic plan and plans to ensure sustainability of the projects (SLDI Program, Handbook, 2007).
THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVE

This study applies diffusion of innovation theoretical perspective to conceptualize knowledge and skills gained by women religious and how they disseminate these skills to transform their ministries and communities they serve. Roger (2003) diffusion of innovation model is essential to understanding skills transfer to workplaces. The model propagates adoption of leadership behaviors permeated through leadership development to workplaces by a consideration of the innovation, style of communication, steps in decision making and practice. As such, democratic action is possible for the underprivileged if they are effectively engaged.

FIGURE 1
ROGER’S (2003) DIFFUSION OF INNOVATION MODEL

METHODOLOGY

A narrative inquiry approach is applied to study 22 women participants of a three-year Hilton-Funded Sisters Leadership Development Initiative (SLDI) program. Data were collected in the spring-summer, 2012. A Survey Monkey was sent to a sample of 30 SLDI participants in Kenya, Uganda, Ghana, and Nigeria. In addition, the researcher spent time to interact with the participants in their ministries and collected data via engaging participants to share their success stories and life experiences and observed the skills practice. Twelve women were interviewed; a follow-up was done via telephone calls. Criteria of selection were that participants must have graduated from the SLDI program and had been in leadership position for a minimum of three years.

Interviews with each participant took approximately 30 to 45 minutes. During the interviews, the interviewer becomes the main instrument because that individual directs the interview process (Kvale & Brinkman, 2009). So, keenness is essential in crafting the interview questions, to ascertain credibility and dependability of the items. Because of the distance of travel within the cities in these countries, telephone interviews were conducted to some of the participants and a follow-up via email to clarify responses. Face to face interviews were audio recorded. The interviewer transcribed the recordings and developed themes that responded to the research questions. The researcher visited with some of the participant in their ministries to observe their skills practice. Notes taken during the site visit helped to clarify ideas and ascertain credibility and dependability of the transcripts.

FINDINGS

Participants in this study were SLDI alumnae a representation of each track in figure 2.
FIGURE 2
PARTICIPANTS BY TRACK ENROLLED

Participants by Track Enrolled

- Financial Management 35%
- Administrative Leadership 30%
- Project Management 35%

FIGURE 3
PARTICIPANTS BY COUNTRY OF RESIDENCE

Participants by Country of Residence

- Uganda 17%
- Ghana 13%
- Kenya 35%
- Nigeria 35%
In addition, they hold variety of positions in their ministries as shown in the pie chart,
Three major themes emerged. a) Underlying Motivation to initiate projects and programs; b) Impacts on the programs, projects and organizations; c) strategies for improving community leadership and engagement

Underlying Motivations to Initiate Projects for Underprivileged

Whereas organizations initiate programs with a goal for profits, findings from this study established that women religious establish projects, and programs with a goal to reach to the underprivileged and underserved population by and helping them to break poverty barriers that inhibit their own development. Interviewees expressed a deep desire for service to humanity and transformation of people’s lives. They expressed their deep connection with the people they serve and a need to change their lives for the better. More than 94% of the respondents indicated that they established the projects to help the needy; 92% said to provide quality and holistic education; 90% to support healthcare needs of the communities they serve. Interviewees narrated their motivations to initiate programs in the following description: Maria is a headmistress of a school with a population of 1,340 children. The school is located in an informal settlement along the margins of Nairobi city. Majority of the residents in the slum area are jobless. Illicit alcohol, drug abuse, frequent fights, and other social evils are mundane, affecting most of the children social and emotional development. The school is a haven where children feel safe. As a result, Maria introduced programs to support these children. The school has a feeding program, children are provided with a hot meal each day, in most cases, the only meal they will have for that day. Also, there is a small infirmary to care for ailing children and a social worker to attend to the needs of the traumatized children. Maria expressed the motivation of her community to initiate the school:

“to be able to reach out to the needy who otherwise would not have an education at all … our projects are geared towards, providing education, healthcare and social services to the communities we serve… these projects are for supporting the most vulnerable.” She added “our hope is that we can bring a change in their lifestyle now and in future.”

Susan affirmed the same notion, that the motivation to initiate the project she runs: “to help the youths in Kaduna area in Ghana … these people are very much impoverished by the collapse of the textile factories… my desire to uplift and support the youths in the area led to initiating the training institute where the youths can train in apprenticeship.” In addition, Lucy’s perception and motivation to initiate the healthcare unit was: “to provide healthcare services to the rural community in order to improve nutrition, treatment, pre-natal and post-natal care, and, laboratory services, child welfare, and support and treatment of HIV/AIDS patients and related ailments, as well as providing voluntary counseling and testing.” Other statements that indicate motivations for initiating programs suggest intrinsic values to nurture, to care and to provide for the underserved populations. Marietta expressed:

“this hospital was started with a goal to provide healthcare to women who suffer from fistula and child bearing related problems… we serve women who otherwise would have lost their children and their lives through medical problems that can be readily addressed.”

Theopista added that the goal for her community to initiate the school was to “provide standard education to the poor and marginalized children in Gulu, Uganda by enabling rural women to become self-reliant and to be able to cater for their family needs … provide for education of their children.” A variety of responses on the motivation elucidated desire to address greater needs for the community as expressed in these terms - empowering children with disabilities by training and giving them opportunities to bring out their talents and live independently; providing children with disabilities with medical rehabilitation, appliances, school fees, upkeep and resettlement packages.”

Over 90% of the respondents indicated that the ministries they manage are located in semi-urban, rural and slum areas because these are the areas where most underprivileged live. In examining the
suitability of the location of the projects, interviewees revealed that projects are located in these areas to provide the much needed services that address community needs. Teresia a healthcare provider described:

“it is important to have the hospital, social welfare program and a school at this place because we have a high number of youths from this locality… most are joblessness, this makes them desperate… they are prone to engage in premarital sex … teenage pregnancy is high, unplanned parenthood, sexually transmitted diseases are common and other ailments … the number of orphans is growing, we felt the need to establish these programs to provide education, healthcare services, counseling support groups, creating jobs for them … we have seen positive behavior change and ability to communicate and developing new perspective in these youths… some have become advocates of responsible living.

Majority 94% of the participants’ echoed similar statements. The underlying reason to initiate the projects in these locations is to provide services at proximal points where the beneficiaries do not have to spend money travelling for the services. With availability of services and educational opportunities close to the underprivileged residential locations it has enabled some of them to break the cycle of poverty by acquiring relevant skills such as computer literacy, tailoring and dressmaking, carpentry, masonry and cookery. As a result, they create jobs in within localities, “we provide them with small grants to initiate self-help initiatives.” This is transforming their living and engagement in social and economic sustainability. These finding correlate with De Mello (2008) that “women are moved to solve problems of their communities and disturbed by extreme poverty and injustice … absence of government initiatives and the need for basic services” (p. 26).

Impacts of the Programs and Projects Initiated

Participants were very positive and pleased with the achievements they had made in impacting the communities they serve. They told touching stories of the changes that had resulted in their clients and attitude change towards community participation, behavior change, increased school attendance and parents taking part in supporting their children. Majority of the participants 92% explained that through the SLDI program they learnt strategies to engage staff and community in helpful ways to make informed decision about their lives and planning for their future. Clear impacts of the program resulted from effective transfer of knowledge and skills to their ministries. Restetituta, a program director in a congregation that serves within East Arica narrated about her responsibilities that revolve around planning and implementing programs including increasing agricultural productivity to provide for the school run by her congregation, planning for food programs for underserved children and overall planning and executing plans for the welfare of all congregational projects that include schools, hospitals, and microfinance programs. Since graduating from the SLDI program, Susan has created large impacts as described;

I have written grants to help transform lives for the people we serve. I wrote and received a grant in the amount of $6,578 … for water tanks and gutters, for the purpose of harvesting rain water which was destroying the building of our school… another $8274.72 for sinking a borehole to provide clean water in Kibiko, Kenya for local community and the sisters… $15,000; for the purpose of construction of nursery school in Zinga Bagamoyo, Tanzania; 18,000 Euros, to sink a borehole in Kikuletwa, Arusha, Tanzania for the local community; 13,000 Euros for the support of ongoing formation for the sisters; 6,700 Canadian dollars for education of two sisters studying.

Restetituta explained that her leadership skills were not only transformed but her way of planning and executing plans is completely changed with more engagement, delegation, teambuilding and documentation of the activities. She added,
“I have mentored eight staff members and facilitated workshops to sixty employees in east Africa...I wish I had the knowledge and skills I have now when I was starting in this position.”

Furthermore, participants described that on completion of the SLDI training; they engaged their workforce in meaningful ways and made efforts to reach out to transform their communities. The SLDI program intensified their need to involve the community in activities of their ministries. Ephraim participated in Web Design workshop that endowed her with skills in web design and editing. As soon as she returned to her ministry she developed a site for her congregation and ministry. She explained:

“After being involved in the Web Design track ... I designed a website for my congregation ... I am currently working to improve the site ... I am able to update the happenings in our ministries ... I wrote a grant to help improve the site and equip our new hospital... it was like a dream to receive funding... I have trained two boys who have been under our care as orphans, they too are excited about internet and web development... they are helping me in managing the site.”

Participants described capacity building skills as relevant for them as individuals, for their ministries and for empowering others in their communities. The skills helped them to advance their potential to implement new skills and reinvigorate their ministries. Mary observed:
“Capacity building seminars helped me to initiate and support training for the rural people in the villages and also in credit management... some of our clients started small scale farms such as fish pond vegetable farms through the funds that I provided through a grant that I wrote to the Hilton Fund for Sisters.”

In addition, Juliana a director of a social welfare program described how she initiated a newsletter to inform the community about the program: “I have initiated a newsletter to disseminate information on our programs .... I have seen people donating food stuff and financial support ... I attribute these donations to people understanding what we do and their help was needed to improve the lives of the poor children and women.” Another participant, Sophia added
“I was engaged in four projects... piggery, vegetable growing, and vocational training. I have found the skills I gained to be very useful ... grant writing, planning and resource management skills... these skills are not for personal benefits but to be used for services... I am using the skills to bring change in the training center.”

On leadership skills acquired in the program Mariana from Nigeria reported:
“Team building has really helped me to be able to work with different people without having many problems because I am more aware of the different behaviors that exist in a group. With this knowledge I have been able to carry those I am working with along and there has been great progress.”

Another, Stella in Uganda observed:
“Leadership has helped me to be able to share responsibility with those I am working with knowing that I cannot do it alone. It has also helped me in giving instruction to staff ... planning and supervision has really helped me because I now know that before any work can come out well, prior planning is essential. With this I am doing well because I am able to apply it to my work.”
Several participants cited the skills they gained and how they applied them in their ministries: “I gained accountability, communication, strategic planning, delegation, conflict management and creative programs that can help the community to become self-sustaining … I have also kept dairy cattle and sheep to generate more income for the school.” Esther affirmed that the knowledge and skills she gained have not only benefited her but also the larger community she serves:

I wrote a proposal to Mission Zentralle and got $14,117 for baking machine and to Hilton Fund for Sisters in the amount of $6,360 for incinerator… I have initiated a nutrition program for the malnourished children and ante-natal Mothers.” Magdalene added, “I undertook a project for purchasing a car for pastoral care services… I conducted a fund raiser … that raised $41,866… now we can go visit the rural areas to bring medical care the community.

Other projects initiated included, sinking borehole for clean water in the communities, providing healthcare support such as dental care for children with no insurance, services to elderly individuals, orphanages and care for people with leprosy. These projects engange the communities served to provide them with a bridge to break poverty barriers and supporting them to develop self-esteem, confidence and attitude change. Most of the served particularly youths, in schools and orphans have become more engaged in ways no one would have imagined. Sophia observed: “Loss of their parents and relatives … and with no counseling support seemed to have shattered these children lives … however, our programs here provided the needed support and they have responded with positive attitudes that there is light at the end of the tunnel.”

**Strategies to Involve Community in Leadership**

Participants explained about strategies they have used to engage the community served to become more creative, problem solvers, and taking on making decisions that affect their lives. According to Bandura (1986), Social Learning Theory indicates that human behavior is learned through observation and modeling others. The results, of such observations are that learning becomes a reciprocal relationship between an individual and the environment. In addition, Bandura (1977) suggests that humans learn behavior through socialization (e.g. leadership, moral behavior) and model behavior from their parents, older siblings, leaders, and educators. Modeling may be perceived as transfer of skills by participants to their ministries, mentoring and conducting workshops to those they serve. As a result, thought process and patterns of behavior may be altered. Charbonneau, Barling and Kelloway (2000) in a research on application for social learning theory established that people tend to mirror behavior exhibited by their parents/seniors and exhibit similar behaviors with their peers.

Over 90% of the participants expressed that through the SLDI program, they acquired knowledge and skills that enabled them to improve their leadership styles and ascertain community engagement in leadership, decisions making and effectively sharing management roles. Some engagement strategies cited as relevant included participatory, delegation, consultation, team-building and sharing responsibilities. The outcome of staff and community engagement was evident in staff becoming friendlier, creative, and resourceful, engaged, energized to deliver services and rewarding experiences leading to significant improvements in programs and related outcomes.

Over 92% of the participants reported more involvement in leadership and community support services. Susan said, “I involve colleagues and the community we serve in identifying the needs, discussion on ways to address those needs and decision making through correspondences …I solicit their opinion especially when a decision becomes a problem from the immediate team.” Posner added:

I try to show concern … by being interested in the lives of staff in the health care center and outside of official duties … I ask them about their family, children, and events taking place in the neighborhood … I try to engage them by wanting to know what is happening and how they are doing, and how we can engage more, as a result they have become
interested, feel appreciated and cared for … in return I have seen more laughter and engagement and participation in search for solutions in community issues …being interested with the underserved and wanting to know their challenges and including them in searching for solutions seem to have unlocked their human potentials.”

Similar statements were expressed: Irene reported,

“I always ask for their opinion, I engage them in the management team.” And Luciana said, “I do a lot of teamwork with the employees … by distributing duties to staff and sharing on the challenges and ways to overcome them.” Patricia added, “I share experiences with colleagues, together we have helped each other in the implementation of major projects.”

Mentoring was cited as an essential strategy that facilitated engaging particularly women in the neighborhood. Participants felt so empowered by having regular meetings to discuss ways to nurture and sustain their families. Majority 90% cited mentoring as a strategy they all use to engage staff and communities they serve. Tanisa explained, “I first mentored staff … I shared the knowledge and skills I acquired from the program … now we both have similar skills.” Margaret reported that meeting regularly and sharing with the staff and community helped to build a community:

There was bonding with staff and community members…

I see them taking problems and challenges in the community as a family, they donate for tuition for children who are orphaned … they donate to support funeral expenses for the orphaned children …slowly their lives and attitudes towards life is changing… they only need someone to hold their hand to show then the way, and they follow. Bibiana added: “we hold monthly meetings and share ideas and views concerning our clients and their needs, this has helped us to create programs that are relevant to address the community needs.”

Certainly, examples provided here reveal that community engagement builds social capital, improves social relations ties, creates networks and overall provides support for the underprivileged persons. As a result, changes have been reported in community health and wellbeing. More participation has been reported on the communities that otherwise would have waited for support. They have been engaged in human rights workshops, conflict management and resolution and have set community watchdog committee. There is less behavior problems reported because the youths are engaged in the community. The communities are becoming neighborhood watch adults are playing roles of each other’s keeper and their children too. However, there are challenges of creating jobs for the youths and women in order to lower idleness, and bingeing.

CONCLUSIONS

Present-day organizations invest in leadership development as a resource for maximizing productivity and improving performance (McCall, 1998). In support of leadership development, Charan, Drotter and Noel (2001) assert that quality leaders shift their focus from individual performance to leading others. Also, successful leaders encourage sustained skills training, mentoring and coaching to build meaningful leadership potential in the organizations thereby increasing productivity (Hill, 2003; Ladyshewsky, 2007; Patterson, 2003). These kinds of leaders enable the workforce to become functional contributors and motivate them to mentor and coach others to increase the organizational outputs and enhance quality relationships that encourage altruism, humility, vision, trust and service. The findings in this study reveal that leadership development was essential in increasing women religious self-confidence and esteem in
leadership. The women applied the knowledge and skills in their projects creating huge transformation in these programs and positively affecting the people they serve.

Jackson (2004) argues that amid the impressive activity of leadership development, practitioners are not clear why and how leaders in Africa change their behavior. The case of SLDI provides some lessons, that having a goal-oriented program with clear attainable and measurable objectives can facilitate increased capacity in leaders. In addition, clear program delivery measures of such a program can facilitate attitude change, adaptation of new skills and implementation of these skills in organizations. Moreover, majority of organizations are conduits in engaging other people to take active roles in social, economic and political change. For the women religious, their organizations focus towards empowerment of the underprivileged. Practice of the skills they gained from the SLDI program created change in them, their ministries and the people they serve. As a result, skills trickle down to the workforce and beneficiaries of their programs. SLDI participants were eager to gain knowledge and skills as well as practice and create desired changes in their communities. However, skills adaptation and transfer depends on the knowledge and skills individuals wish to transfer to their workplaces, as well as the level of acceptance and adoption of the new skills in workplaces.

Leadership descriptions provided by the participants indicate that they adopted collaborative, democratic leadership models that sought to involve their colleagues and those they serve. Plummer (2003) suggests that “good leadership involves collaborative relationships that lead to collective action grounded in shared values of people who work together to effect positive change” (p. 256). Majority of these women were able to establish a broader connections and contacts for business success, thereby forming social networks that facilitate collaboration in leadership roles. Their increased ability in fundraising locally and internationally to support their ministries attests to their networking capacities. Sorenson et al, (2008) adds that “networks enable women to acquire resources to meet business needs." Furthermore, women have the ability to see things in an integrated system, "women view business, family, community and society as an integrated whole not as a separate economic reality" (Plummer, 2003, p. 242).

The services provided by these women as described in this research attest to their ability to apply ethics of care. Ethics of care was evident in their leadership which derives in the conscious awareness to protect, to nurture, to nourish, and to support humanity. In initiating the projects, these women seek to address the needs of humanity. They recognized that each decision a leader makes, it comes with a level of restructuring of human life. So, good administration at its heart may be a resolution for moral dilemmas because leaders would resolve issues as soon as they arise Because of the uncertainties, complexities, and operations, as leaders these women described the need for leadership development that helped them to be open to and applying multiple lenses to deal with emerging issues in their community and organizational setting. Moreover, mentorships was seen as a favorable strategy to increase investment returns for women empowerment and reframing organizations by adopting the best leadership strategies through practice of skills and engaging their communities to resolve their issues amicably.

In forming their leadership concepts and practices, the SLDI program was essential to reshape these women’s leadership styles and evaluate strategies and approaches they use in leading others. The diagram below illustrates theoretical perspectives pertinent for a beneficial leadership development program in Africa as evident from the participants’ practices and feedback from their organizations. SLDI program has produced best practices that other workforce development programs can learn.
The SLDI program had meaningful investments in the women religious in the six sub-Saharan countries. Participants have learned to undertake fundraising activities that have yielded many benefits for the ministries and improved services for the people they serve. Because women religious initiate projects that primarily serve the underprivileged, the outcomes of this study revealed the use of ethics of care guides most of these woman’s actions and services in their ministries. Overall, the data gathered from the interviewees revealed that the SLDI program had consequential impacts on the trainees, their ministries and their communities. Effects of the skills gained were evident in sustainable mentoring, the innovative projects created and in the endeavor to pass on knowledge and skills to co-workers.

REFERENCES


A Study of the Relationship Between Moral Maturity and Respondent’s Self-Rated Leadership Style

Charles R. Salter
Schreiner University

Mary H. Harris
Cabrini University

Mark Woodhull
Schreiner University

Jay McCormack
Schreiner University

The study of moral development and the effects it has on decision making have garnered a good deal of interest in the last thirty years. Rest, Thoma, and Narvaez (1999e) discuss the cognitive schemas associated with the different levels of moral development as stated by Kohlberg (1984). Rest et al. (1999e) suggest that cognitive moral schemas present in our conscious aid our retention of factual similarities between our experiences and ultimately aid in our decision making and search for further information. This implicit moral theory is similar to the leadership theory noted as Implicit Leadership Theory or the theory that one also carries in her or his memory a certain slate of factors which they use to identify a leader’s behavior as being those of a good leader or an ineffective leader (Salter, Green, Ree, Carmody-Bubb, & Duncan, 2009).

INTRODUCTION

The research on trait theory and implicit leadership theory have been reinvigorated by research on transformational leadership presented by Bass and Avolio (1994) in their Full Range Leadership Model: transformational, transactional, management by exception active, management by exception passive, and laissez-faire leadership, have led to the continuing study of follower perceptions of leadership, leader implicit values, the spirituality of the leader and leadership style. Bass (1990) suggests that if transformational leadership could be based on one’s background characteristics, values, ethics, or traits, then these traits were universal to mankind. Lord and Maher (1991) suggest that within the realm of implicit leadership theory, the more a follower can prototype a leader’s style or compare the leader’s behavior to their schema of a good leader’s values and ethics, the more effective communications will be between follower and leader.
Moral Schemas an Implicit Theory

Bartlett (1932) was the first one to propose a theory of abstract learning and remembering experiences to be utilized later in decision making he noted as cognitive schemas. Kintsch (1994) found that these mental organizers are not attached to the limbic systems unconscious decision making, but seem to reside in the rational prefrontal cortex mechanisms. Traditional discussions by schema theorists (Rummelhart, 1980; Taylor & Crocker, 1981) indicate that schemas are understood to be generalized knowledge structures residing in long term memory. Schemas have been theorized to be a set of expectations, hypotheses, concepts or organized regularities formed in the cognition of one’s mental facilities and based on the cognitive processes of similarities, associations and recurrences in experiences.

Taylor et al. (1981) stated that cognitive schemas help to form our perception and guide our information seeking behaviors. While there are numerous schemas individuals possess, Narvaez (1999) identified reaction times and memories identified in moral judgment, while Rest (1986) noted these moral judgments as moral schemas.

Rest et al. (1999e) states that the Defining Issues Test 2 measures how individuals perceive moral situations in terms of three schemas: Personal Interests, Maintaining Norms, and Post-Conventional thinking. The three schemas are presumed to be ordered developmentally. The Personal Interests schema justifies the moral decision of an actor by appealing to the personal stake that actor has in the consequences of an action; this stage is considered to occur only in early childhood. Maintaining Norms moral schema initiates in the moral decision maker a recognition that moral decisions should be made on the basis of what is good for society; this decision making ability is thought to occur in adolescents to early adulthood. The justification of a moral decision when one is at the Post-Conventional stage moral development is directed toward shared societal ideals, which are opened to rational critique and can be challenged by new experiences and logic; this cognitive organization for decision making is not fully formalized by all, and is thought to occur later on in one’s maturation process.

Leadership Schemas and Implicit Leadership Theory

The beginning of a discussion on follower’s expectancies of leader behavior or implicit leadership began by Eden and Leviathan (1975) who found that leader’s behaviors guide a perceiver’s encoding of relevant information. Carlisle and Phillips (1984) found that the perceiver’s formation of leadership perceptions was enhanced when a leader’s traits were positively prototyped by the follower. Mischel (1977) suggested that traits are important as constructs for perceivers, which help them to organize perceptions of others. Winter and Uleman (1984) indicated that individuals unconsciously make trait inferences when encoding information into memory. Lord, DeVader, and Alliger (1986) concluded that research on implicit leadership theory indicates the relationship between the perceiver’s cognitive schema fabricated by a leader’s traits and their importance as perceptual constructs for perceivers. Lord and Maher (1991) found that a follower’s recall of leadership information instructions is enhanced if the follower has correctly cognitively mapped or prototyped the leader’s traits.

Lord, Brown, and Freiberg (1999) state that even small portions of behavior, perhaps even single word communications, in the absence of further communication, might elicit from the follower a prototypical implicit based leadership style stored in memory. As stated by Eden and Leviathan (1975), leader behaviors guide memory of small tasks it is intuitive to surmise that a small prototypical behavior would guide a follower’s assessment of a leader’s leadership style.

Keller (1992) stated that implicit leadership asks about the relationship between the evaluations and perceptions of leaders. Kark and Shamir (2002) asserted that transformational leaders have dual influence on followers. These authors state that transformational leaders’ influence over the follower is derived by their ability to change the personal identity and the social identity of the follower through communication. The personal identity of the follower models the leader, and the social identity forms identification with the work unit. The authors go further to state that identities are formed by personality traits, quality of relationships, and group norms. Lord, et al. (1999) suggested that implicit leadership theories were a category system, which emphasized how prototypical behavior influenced the leadership perceptions and distortions in memory about leaders by perceivers.
Leadership and Moral Development

There has been some research with regards to the relationship between the moral development of leaders and their leadership style. Research on military personnel by Olsen et al (2006) stated that individual differences in moral reasoning and moral identity significantly affect leadership behavior. Further results indicated post conventional moral reasoning and moral identity were positively related to transformational leadership behavior, and negatively related to passive-avoidant leadership. These findings corroborated Bass’ findings that leaders with a strong moral identity would be more likely to emphasize moral values in their decision making and communication with their subordinates, which may be linked to the transformational facets of inspirational motivation and idealized influence as proposed by (Bass 1998a; 1998b). Research also suggest people with high moral reasoning should be motivated to act morally based on this internalized moral identity Rest (1986), Aquino and Reed (2002), Burns (1978) and Turner et al (2002). Bass and Steidlmieier (1999) emphasized that a moral component was also necessary for transactional leadership; however Olsen’s research did not significantly support this finding. Andreescu and Gennaro (2010) performed research to determine the best traits for an ideal police officer using the Leadership Behavior Description Questionnaire for XII (Stodgill, 1974), which has two styles of leadership: worker-center and task-centered. Although this research did not focus on moral development, it did show that transformational leadership is the preferred leadership style and that women tend to exhibit more transformational leadership styles.

Walker et al (2009) focused their research on how spirituality (defined both in religious and non-religious terms) is a desired trait in leadership resulting in a positive impact on leadership in three areas: the leader’s inner self, interaction with others, and the leader’s tasks and activities. This study involved community college presidents and chancellors and the participant leaders expressed their spiritual qualities in their leadership through their principles, values and beliefs which centered on servant leadership, community building, creativity and communication (Walker et al, 2009). Klenke’s (2003) research suggested that the roots of effective leadership may be grounded in a spiritual dimension and that common characteristics of effective leaders are an inward focus, potential for self-discovery, reflective analysis, and personal reinvention. This research used the MLQ to link spirituality, leadership and moral development, but produced inconsistent results, due to the difficulty in defining spirituality and measuring it. A related study by April et al (2010) which focused on Korver’s five principles for leaders to avoid ethical mistakes, linked ethics to being an authentic leader. This research involved middle managers and grounded theory to analyze the qualitative results – asking them what enabled and disabled them to make ethical decisions in the workplace. The two most frequent enablers listed were upbringing and spirituality (April et al, 2010). Glanz (2010) also discussed how a lack of empirical research on ethics in educational leadership is evident. The above research focused more on how to provide ethical leadership in strategic planning by developing a conceptual framework for justice and caring in strategic leadership.

Leadership Morality and Gender

Although there has been sufficient research on the relationship between leadership style and gender, gender and the relationship between moral development and ethics in leadership style choice has not been explored as extensively. Survey research has shown that less than half of American workers feel their leaders are senior people of high integrity (Koehn, 2005). Gardner (2007) stated leaders feel three types of ultimate responsibility: for ethical conduct of an organization and its workers, for fulfillment of an organization’s goals, and for serving the greater good. One research study confirmed that most people, particularly leaders, possess a strong sense of personal responsibility (Schroer, 2007). Remund (2011) found that leaders feel responsible for ethical conduct within an organization, but must balance this objective with the sense of responsibility for helping achieve organizational goals and simultaneously serving the public good. Although Remund’s aforementioned research focused on corporate communications leaders, the results found that gender did not surface as a significant determinant, but the authors encouraged that future analysis involving gender and other variables should be pursued for more insightful influences (Remund, 2011). Green, Duncan, Salter, and Chavez (2012) found that women held stronger opinions about the benefits of five aspects of leadership generally considered to contribute to
outstanding leadership taken from (House, Hanges, Javidan, Dorfman, & Gupta, 2004): integrity, visionary charisma, participative, humane-oriented and diplomatic. In this same study women versus men were found to hold stronger opinions about the liabilities of three aspects generally considered to inhibit outstanding leadership: conflict inducer, autocratic and malevolent leadership behavior. Salter, Green, Duncan, Berre, and Torti (2010) found women to be significantly more sensitive to the transformational and passive leadership language of the leader than men.

Singh (2012) analyzed by gender the perceptions of good and bad leadership and explored the attributes of leaders as perceived by their male and female followers. This research focused mostly on transformational vs. transactional leadership styles and other typical gender traits, but did not explore the impact of gender and ethics. This research deviates from the large body of literature on the leadership styles of men and women (Eagly & Carli, 2007; Eagly & Johnson, 1990; Eagly, Karau & Makhijani, 1995; Helgesen, 1990; Rosener, 1990; Yoder, 2001). Although Butz et al., (2007) does not investigate moral development and ethics in research on the leadership styles of men and women, the study does consider the differences in the gender’s socialization processes and the related organizational culture.

Salter, et al. (2009) found a significant difference between the transformational ratings of the leader versus their political party affiliation of the rater, with the greatest difference between those who identified themselves as Republican and those who identified themselves as Democrats, which intuitively suggest an interaction between respondents’ moral schema and a halo effect, filtering effect, or selective perception within the realm of decision-making. Rest et al. (1999e) suggests that at the highest form of level development the respondent would show a more critical rationalization of the communications and behaviors of the leader disregarding halo effects, selective perceptions, and other perceptual screens.

Little research has been done to investigate the relationship between a respondent’s moral maturity rating and it’s affect on the prototyping of leader behavior in regard to leadership style. The purpose of this study was to test the theoretical proposition that there is a relationship between respondent’s moral maturity and the respondent’s rating of their own leadership behavioral style as it aligns with Bass & Avolio’s (1994) Full Range Leadership Model. If a follower’s moral maturity predisposes him/her to engage in a leadership style, then followers could more readily interpret the foundations of a leaders’ communications leading to a more complete understanding between leader’ motivations and follower’ understanding.

The current research examined the degree to which the respondents’ moral maturity, as measured by the DIT 2, Rest et al. (1999e), is related to an individual’s implicit perceptual leadership style ratings of transformational, transactional, or passive style as found by Bass & Avolio (1994) Multifactor Leadership
Questionnaire (MLQ). The study’s research questions center on the respondent’s moral development and their self-rating of their leadership style as being transformational, transactional, or passive stated below.

As previous research found a relationship between moral reasoning and moral values relating to transformational leadership and has further suggested a moral component to transactional leadership style (Bass, 1998a; 1998b; Olsen et al., 2006; Bass & Steidmeier, 1999). The present research investigated the relationship between a respondent's moral development as measured by the DIT2 (test of Moral Development) and the transformational, transactional, and passive leadership ratings of the respondent when controlling for the respondent's age, education, gender, political affiliation, and ethnicity.

METHODOLOGY

Participants

The sample for this study consisted of 346 respondents. Of the 346 responses, 321 were fully completed and usable, for a return ratio of approximately 93%. Participants were undergraduates who volunteered from one university in South Texas and gender consisted of 41.9% females and 58.1% males, with a mean age of 19.5 years old with a standard deviation of 3.03 and ages ranging from 17-38. The ethnicity of the sample subjects consisted of 73.3% White, 21.1% Spanish/Hispanic/Latino, 3.7% Black/African American/Black, and 1.9% Asian. Their educational levels consisted of 95.6% working on their undergraduate degree, 4.4% working toward their Master’s degree. Subjects identified themselves politically as being very liberal 5.6%, somewhat liberal 19.3%, neither liberal nor conservative 37%, somewhat conservative 28%, and 10.1% very conservative. Concerning the moral development of participants in accordance with Kohlberg (1984) stages of moral development, 6.5% were stage 1, 21.4% were stage 2, 32.3% were stage 3, 12.7% were stage 4, 7.5% were stage 5, 13.7% were stage 6, and 5.9% were stage 7.

Materials and Procedure

This study was of a correlational research design whose central topic of investigation was the relationship between the respondent’s moral maturity, as operationally defined by the Defining Issues Test (DIT 2) and the respondent’s self-rating of leadership style as measured by (Bass & Avolio, 1994) Multifactor Leadership Questionnaire. The DIT 2 is a measure of the respondent’s moral development and is based on (Kohlberg, 1984), stages of moral development. The data collection instrument, including a demographic page and the two aforementioned survey instruments, was given to those participants who voluntarily agreed to complete the surveys, in the multiple student samples. The sample was a convenient sample and consisted of undergraduate and graduate students from two universities in Texas.

The survey was constructed of three sections: the section asking respondents to give Demographic information, the Defining Issues Test-2 section asking respondents to give a best result answer to ethical scenarios, based on the Center for the study of Ethical Development DIT-2. Bebeau & Thoma, (2003), which reflects Kohlberg (1984) stages of moral maturity, and lastly the respondent’s rating of their leadership style as defined by Bass and Avolio (1994) Multi-factor Leadership Questionnaire measuring the Full Range Leadership Model.

The DIT-2 includes five hypothetical moral dilemmas; each followed by 12 issues that could be involved in making a decision about the dilemma. Participants were asked what decision they would make in each dilemma and which issues they consider most important in making the decision. These responses are scored to find which moral schema students follow in making moral decisions:

- Personal interest’s schema: considering what will benefit me and help others to like me
- Maintaining norms schema: considering what will maintain the law and social order
- Postconventional schema: considering human rights and other moral principles

The reliability and validity of this instrument has been thoroughly investigated by Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau, and Thoma, (1999b) who found internal consistency coefficients using Cronbach’s α ranging from r = .70 to r = .80, and validity correlates related to cognitive capacity measures of moral
comprehension $r = .60$ on the measure related to cognitive capacity of pro-social behaviors and desired professional decision making and political attitudes and political choices ranging from and $r = .40$ to $r = .65$.

The reliability and validity of the Multifactor Leadership Questionnaire, published by Bass and Avolio (1994) has also been tested on numerous occasions (Avolio, Bass, & Jung, 1999, Judge, Piccolo, & Ilies, 2004, Rowold & Herrera, 2003, Rowold, 2004). The reliability ratings of all items on the scale ranged from $r = .74$ to $r = .94$, while the validity ratings for these items ranged from $r = .79$ for transformational leadership styles, $r = .56$ for transactional leadership styles, and $r = .91$ to $r = .84$ for passive leadership style.

**Results**

A series of regression models were conducted on all of the nine styles of the Full Range Leadership Model: Idealized Influence Active, Idealized Influence Behavioral, Inspirational Motivation, Intellectual Stimulation, Individual Consideration, Contingent Reward, Management by Exception Active, Management by Exception Passive and Laissez-faire leadership as defined by the MLQ-5X and demographics (political party affiliation, ethnicity, education, gender, and age), and moral maturity as defined by the DIT-2.

As indicated in Table 1, Moral Maturity ratings variance could best be predicted for these respondent’s by the respondent’s perception of their leadership style as a leader who engages in Transformational Leadership Style of Inspirational Motivation and the Transactional Leadership Style of Contingent Reward accounted for 29.0 % ($R^2 = .290$) of the variance in ratings. Respondent’s estimation of their leadership behaviors constituting the Full-Range Leadership Model styles of contingent reward, idealized influence active, and inspirational motivation showed a positive correlation to moral maturity ratings of the respondent, $p < .00$, $F (3, 318) = 9.736$.

The demographic variables of political party affiliation and race were shown to add to the prediction model as ethnicity improved overall model predictability to 35.2 % ($R^2 = .352$), a change in predictability of $.9% (AR^2 = .062)$, and showed a correlation to moral maturity ratings, $p < .01$, $F (3, 317) = 4.35$. When adding political affiliation to the model the predictability of the model increased to 40.7 percent ($R^2 = .407$) for an incremental change of 5.5 ($AR^2 = .055$) and showed a correlation to transformational ratings, $p < .00$, $F (3, 317) = 12.223$.

**TABLE 1**

LEADERSHIP STYLE AND MORAL MATURITY RATINGS REGRESSION MODEL OF CHANGE STATISTICS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>$R^2$</th>
<th>$R^2$ Change</th>
<th>Sig. Change</th>
<th>Df</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Leader Style: CR &amp; IS</td>
<td>.290</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>318</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ethnicity</td>
<td>.352</td>
<td>.06</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Political Affiliation: Liberal vs.</td>
<td>.407</td>
<td>.05</td>
<td>.02</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conservative</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. Leadership style variables are, CR = contingent reward, IA = Idealized Influence (active), IS = Inspirational Motivation; Political Affiliation consist of liberal vs. conservative.

A Scheffe Post Hoc test was run and as indicated in Table 2, the greatest variance in ratings existed between those with Somewhat Liberal political affiliations, who were rated significantly lower on the moral maturity Stage 3 than their Very Conservative political affiliations counterpart, with a mean difference = 1.32. Stage 6 moral development ratings indicated that the greatest variance in mean scores existed between those who were Somewhat Liberal, who were rated significantly lower, and those who were Very Conservative, with a mean difference = 1.36 and Stage 7 where the Very Liberal political affiliates scored significantly lower than the Very Conservative political affiliates with a mean difference = 1.37.
TABLE 2
SCHETTE POST HOC MORAL MATURITY RATINGS BASED
ON POLITICAL AFFILIATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Political Affiliation</th>
<th>Mean Difference</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stage 3: SL v. VC</td>
<td>1.32</td>
<td>.236</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 6: SL v. VC</td>
<td>1.36</td>
<td>.262</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 7: VL v. VC</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>.313</td>
<td>.005</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: SL = Somewhat Liberal, VC = Very Conservative, VL = Very Liberal

As Figure 1 indicates there was a significant difference, \( p < .000, F (6, 316) = 6.44 \), between the political affiliation of the respondent and their moral maturity. The political affiliation mean score for those graded out as Stage One of Moral Maturity was found to be 2.05, indicating that they were slightly liberal, versus those that were graded out in Stage 7 of Moral Maturity having a mean political affiliation of 3.4 being either not affiliated politically or slightly conservative. Figure 1 was included as a line graph here to indicate the intuitive anomaly which occurs at Stage 4 of Moral Maturity and the self-description of the respondent as being either liberal or conservative.

FIGURE 1
MEAN SCORE OF POLITICAL AFFILIATION AND MORAL MATURITY

A Scheffe Post Hoc test indicated the greatest difference in ratings existed between those identifying themselves as having an ethnicity of White versus respondents identifying themselves as being Black. Those whose ethnicity was White were rated significantly higher in moral maturity than respondents whose ethnicity was black, with a mean difference = 1.37 and a \( p < .05 \). There were no other significant differences between the moral development of any of the other ethnicities.
A subsequent Scheffe Post Hoc test was run which indicates that the greatest variance in ratings existed between those identifying themselves as using contingent reward as a leadership behavior marginally with a self-rating of 1 to those who rated themselves as utilizing contingent reward behavior regularly with a self-rating of 4. Those whose self-rating was 4, who utilized contingent reward regularly, were rated as significantly more morally mature than those who rated themselves using reward marginally, with a 1 rating, with a mean difference = 1.81, p < .05.

Another iteration of the Scheffe Post Hoc test indicates that the greatest variance in ratings existed between those identifying themselves as using inspirational motivation as a leadership behavior marginally with a self-rating of 1 to those who rated themselves as utilizing inspirational motivation behavior regularly with a self-rating of 4. Those whose self-rating was 4, who utilized inspirational motivation regularly, were rated as significantly more morally mature than those who rated themselves using inspirational motivation marginally, with a 1 rating, with a mean difference = 1.52, p < .05.

Hypothesis Tests
As stated in the research question the relationship between respondent’s moral maturity ratings as operationally defined by the DIT 2, and the self-ratings of their transformational leadership style, composed of, idealized influence (active) idealized influence (behavioral), inspirational motivation, individual consideration, and intellectual stimulation, based on the MLQ5X, when controlling for age, ethnicity, political affiliation, and gender was found to exist. As a significant relationship was found to exist between, the respondent's self-rating of transformational leadership style and their self-ratings of moral maturity. Specifically Respondent's rated in Stage 4 of moral development utilized contingent reward more readily, than Respondents in Stage 1, who more frequently engaged in the transformational component Inspirational Motivation.

Findings also, indicated a significant relationship between the transactional style known as Contingent Reward and Moral Maturity. As moral development increased from stage of development to stage of development so did the usage of Contingent Reward behavior or Transactional Style of Leadership. Finally, there were no significant findings concerning passive leadership styles and any of the tested variables.

DISCUSSION
The pertinence of this research to organizational leaders is aligned toward a better understanding of followers’ moral development in association with their leadership behavioral style and communication processing behaviors, which have been stated to emanate from one’s moral schemas as stated by Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau, and Thoma, (1999e). Leaders’ change styles in order to better motivate their followers to higher productivity, the understanding of the relationship between a leader’s preferred leadership style and their moral development will aid followers and the leader’s leader as to what motivates the mechanisms they utilize to communicate to and motivate others. If leader’s moral maturity effects their perception of a leadership style’s effectiveness, then followers and their leaders could more productively communicate, which will in favorable situational environments enhance performance of the organization. It is assumed that if a leadership style is not recognized by the follower through the attribution processes imbedded in implicit leadership theory and implicit moral maturity theory, then the positive outcomes of that form of leadership are wasted on the unperceiving follower.

From a practical standpoint leaders need to understand their propensities, based on their level of moral maturity, to utilize communication mechanisms, which fulfill their need to behave congruently to their level of moral development. It is also necessary for leaders to recognize their follower’s different levels of moral development. As leaders, understanding that one’s default leadership styles of behavior, which emanate, at least in part, from one’s level of moral development, might not speak effectively to follower’s whose level of moral maturity is not complimentary, is important to motivating all levels of followers.
Of further note, if we understand constituent’s levels of moral development then we can better communicate around the perceptive boundaries associated with our communicative behaviors, of selective perception, halo effect, self-fulfilling prophecy, and their interaction with follower attribution of the leader, then we could better assimilate unique follower training programs to enhance organizational behavior, which could create an efficiency of productivity.

The finding on moral maturity and political affiliation is intuitively spurious, in that it would appear to one that political affiliation is a philosophical ideal by which one would fulfill the human needs associated with different levels of Moral Development. It is intuitive that individuals within the associated different levels of political affiliation should be rated as to be in high stages of moral maturity, this finding that political conservatives are more highly rated in the levels of moral development intuitively speaks to a sample population in which the highest political affiliation numbers were slightly conservative to highly conservative.

The significant relationship found between moral maturity and the leadership traits Inspirational Motivation and Contingent Reward, concur with prior research, which suggest that the communicative behaviors of successful political leaders speak to transformational language and to transactional leadership language as well (Gardner, 1987; Hargrove, Duncan, Green, Salter, & Trayhan, 2011). Gardner (1987) and Hoyt and Blascovich (2003) suggests though transformational and transactional leadership styles might be needed to accomplish different aspects of the leadership role, both are needed for effective leadership.

What was surprising to one is what was not found to have a significant relationship in this study, there was not found a relationship between gender and moral development, there too was no significant finding between the components of transformational leadership referred to as, individual consideration, idealized influence (active or behavioral) or intellectual stimulation and moral development. As intuitively suggested in (Green, Duncan, Salter, & Chavez, 2012; Salter, Green, Duncan, Berre, and Torti 2010) which suggested that women were significantly more concerned with a leader’s integrity and more sensitive to the transformational and passive leadership language of the leader than men. However, while the studies mentioned above actually rated the actions of some other leader, this study rated their own moral development and their leadership style, the interesting difference between a male’s implicit expectations of their own behavior and perhaps the lesser expectations one might have of the practical behavior of a leader might constitute the lack of significant difference between the ratings of men and women in this study. In other words men have the same high expectations of their own behavior as do women, it is suggested that they simply might not expect the same high standard from their leaders.

Limitations to the Findings

The use of a sample of convenience in this research limits the study’s ability to generalize these findings. Findings taken from a sample consisting of only those seeking a higher education in a population might not be representative of the population as a whole. Therefore, these finding are not necessarily similar to the findings of a representative sample of the entire population. This study should be repeated with a more representative sample.

Recommendations of Future Research

More research should be done on the implicit perception of individuals and how they view themselves and others as leaders. The relationship between implicit perception and the formulation of one’s decisions is important to the better understanding and communication of leaders and constituents in the work place in our society. Researchers should recognize the different disciplines engaged in contributing to the study of leadership and make the effort to traverse uncommon ground toward a better understanding of leadership and decision-making. Disciplines worthy of study include those associated with implicit motivations and concern, satisfying the intrinsic needs of the constituent and the leader at work, and communication verbal and non-verbal cues that reinforce positive emotion and result in extra effort.

Lastly, more research should be devised attempting to understand the perceptual differences between political affiliation, leadership ratings and moral development. While this study found a significant difference between the Moral Development of different politically affiliated individuals, intuitively these
do not seem to be related. As stated above, political affiliation would seem to be more be a means or a
design of the mechanisms or means one would utilize to fulfill the human needs associated with different
levels of Moral Development. As Mischel (1977) suggests the process of decision formulation with
schemas and their aid in information gathering seem to be subconscious and involuntary. If however,
political schemas (Democrat or Republican) exist as intuition would allow, then to what reflexive
decision-making processes are they responsible for our political choices? And, more importantly how can
two opposed political affiliations ever come to compromise, for the betterment of society? In his treatise
on the will and St. Augustine, King (2010) states that St. Augustine promulgated that our will is not
responsible for those things in which it possesses no control, that the will is self-determining, meaning the
power of our will comes from our will to possess it, and that we are responsible for having a good will
toward our fellow human beings. The author goes on to say for St. Augustine a good will consisted of: 1)
prudence or the knowledge of what was good for oneself and seeking it, and knowing what was not good
for oneself and avoiding it, 2) bravery, the ability to take with equanimity the things that are beyond our
control and to press on, 3) moderateness, what trait theorist refer to as emotional stability, and 4) justice
or the need to pursue fairness for all persons. Perhaps it is somewhere within the exercise of our wills that
we can then think past our schemas or our automatic responses to come to further reason in every
situation, which will then aid in the performance of our industries and our societies.

REFERENCES

Andreescu, V., & Vito, G. F. (2010). An exploratory study on Ideal Leadership Behavior: the opinions of

April, K., Peters, K., Locke, K., & Mlambo, C. (2010). Ethics and Leadership: Enablers and stumbling
blocks. Journal of Public Affairs, 10(3)152-172.

Psychology, 83, 1423–1440.

Avolio, B. J., Bass, B. M., & Jung, D. I. (1999). Re-examining the components of transformational and
transactional leadership using the Multi-factor Leadership Questionnaire. Journal of Occupational and
Organizational Psychology. 72:4, 441-462,


leadership (pp. 169–192). Westport, CT: Praeger.

NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc.


Development University of Minnesota.


Nightingale, Curie, and Roosevelt as Exemplars of the Fabulous Five Dimensions of Centered Leadership

Kelley A. Conrad
University of Phoenix

Anastasia Metros
University of Phoenix

Barbara Shambaugh
Nursing Consultant

Phenomenological patterns identified from lived experiences described in the biographies of Nightingale, Curie, and Roosevelt were found consistent with the Centered Leadership model (Barsh, Cranston, & Lewis, 2011) confirming the model as a valuable guide for leadership development of women. This biographical case study of three outstanding women from the last century analyzed information from their own words quoted in collected works, books, and articles they authored or written about them. We documented evidence of the fabulous five dimensions of meaning, framing, connecting, engaging, and energizing from Centered Leadership for all three exemplars supporting the model.

INTRODUCTION

The research in this article started with an interest in Florence Nightingale. We were researching her recently published “Collected Works” (McDonald, 2002-2010) when someone said she was one of only three women on a list of the 100 most influential people of the last 1000 years. We never found that list. We did find several lists of influential leaders and noted very few women on them. We found Florence Nightingale, Marie Curie, and Eleanor Roosevelt on many of these lists. Intrigued, we began examining the lives and contributions of these three exemplary women in hopes of developing an informative perspective on the leadership characteristics of remarkable women. We felt exploring their lives would be of interest and offer some insights valuable to women today.

Problem

The literature exploring barriers restricting the advancement of women into leadership roles is extensive (Bruckmuller & Branscombe, 2010; Moss-Kanter, 1993; Payne, 2005). Less well studied are women who have emerged as leaders in scientific and applied fields in times even more restrictive than the present. Several recent leadership models appeared relevant. Cheung and Halpern (2010) developed a model recognizing the “culture of genders” (p. 182) that included a focus on relationship oriented leadership traits, the value of teamwork and consensus, and effective work-family interface. Barsh,
Cranston, and Craske, (2008); Barsh and Cranston (2009); and Barsh, Cranston, and Lewis (2011) developed a similar but more comprehensive model, Centered Leadership, which we found interesting.

**Centered Leadership**

Our investigations exploring the lives of these three standout women led us to deeper consideration of the McKinsey and Company *Centered Leadership Project* (Barsh & Cranston, 2009; Barsh, Cranston, & Craske, 2008; Barsh, Cranston, & Lewis, 2011). From over eight years of research on remarkable women, McKinsey consultants, Barsh, Cranston, and Craske (2008), developed the leadership model *Centered Leadership*. The model describes five interrelated dimensions, also known as, “the fabulous five.”

*Meaning.* When women find their strengths and put them to work in the pursuit of an inspiring purpose.

*Managing energy.* When women recognize from where they derive their energy, how they apply it, and how to manage it.

*Positive framing.* When women adopt a constructive way of seeing their world, expand their horizons, and become resilient moving ahead even when things do not go as planned.

*Connecting.* When women build stronger relationships, increase their sense of belonging, and identify others who can help them develop.

*Engaging.* When women become self-reliant, confidently accepting opportunities, speaking up, and collaborating with others.

We found Centered Leadership useful and adopted it as the framework for our comparison study of the three women. We feel the examples of Florence Nightingale, Marie Curie, and Eleanor Roosevelt provide insights into characteristics that distinguish outstanding female leaders. Integrating experiences selected from their biographies and personal papers using Centered Leadership (Barsh, Cranston, & Lewis, 2011) makes the examples of these three women more meaningful for women of today.

**Research Questions**

Our original question was, “What are some common phenomenological patterns in the lives of Nightingale, Curie, and Roosevelt identifiable in their biographies that could be shared with other women and would contribute to the professional and personal successes of women today?”

After we discovered Centered Leadership (Barsh, Cranston, & Lewis, 2011), we modified our research question to, “Will phenomenological patterns identified in the biographies of Nightingale, Curie, and Roosevelt be consistent with Centered Leadership (Barsh, Cranston, & Lewis) and how might they confirm the model as valuable to the professional and personal successes of women today?”

**Design**

We selected a case study approach as consistent with our focus on the three women previously identified by the historical listings. Since the three women have died, the most direct information available was material in their own words cited in collected works; books and articles they authored; and comments, feelings, or behaviors attributed to them by authors of their biographies. To emphasize the analysis of each subject, each of the researchers initially focused on one woman, identifying and classifying data on their subject. After we expanded the focus of data collection to include the other two women, the other two researchers added additional data as appropriate. Data collection continued until the research team identified no additional fresh information in the historical and biographical sources.

**Results**

We wrote case records for each of the three women. We also explored theoretical models of successful women that might be helpful integrating the case record observations. It was from this search that we identified the McKinsey *How Remarkable Women Lead* study and decided to test the theory behind the Centered Leadership assessment and development processes (Barsh, Cranston, & Lewis, 2011) using the information on our three exemplars. We organized our collected data in a matrix of categories
consistent with Centered Leadership (Barsh, Cranston, & Lewis). Following the reorganization of the data, we inductively examined the data for each of our three women leaders for consistency and support of the Centered Leadership model (Barsh, Cranston, & Lewis). Doing this, we were able to identify examples from the lives of all three women exemplifying components of Centered Leadership. This was true despite the very different temperaments of Nightingale, Curie, and Roosevelt. This finding confirmed the value of Centered Leadership (Barsh, Cranston, & Lewis) for understanding successful women and for communicating this in systematic ways to other women in leadership. Following are the case descriptions.

**FLORENCE NIGHTINGALE (1820-1910)**

A woman with ideas well before her time, Florence Nightingale earned recognition for her ideas in a world that initially dismissed her as an upper class, privileged woman seeking a charitable activity to occupy her time. She developed and emerged as a major leader in hospital hygiene, health care, and the design and management of hospitals. Her influence became pervasive as it supplied or anticipated many of the building blocks of modern nursing, public health, and hospital care. Known poetically after the Longfellow poem about her as “the lady with the lamp,” Florence Nightingale challenged the already entrenched medical fraternity with straightforward correct science and practice based on careful observations and insightful deductions. She also challenged established public health and hospital practices that persisted as habits even after the accumulating knowledge and experience demonstrated they were dangerous. Her pioneering efforts created the field of professional nursing and the evidence-based nursing practice of today.

A recent biographer, Lynn McDonald, described Nightingale’s central influence,

> a 'Nightingale methodology' can be identified: read the best information available in print, especially government reports and statistics; interview experts; if the available information is inadequate send out your own questionnaire; test it first at one institution; consult practitioners who use the material; send out draft reports to experts for vetting before publication. (2006, p. XX)

In addition to her other talents, Florence Nightingale was a creative data analyst who collected, tabulated, displayed, and interpreted descriptive statistics analyzing the mortality data for soldiers in the Crimean War. Motivated by her distress over her war experiences in Scutari, she invented the polar area diagram using it to associate the mortality data with unsanitary conditions, contagious diseases, and war wounds. Using her analysis and illustrations, she showed that most of the British soldiers died from unsanitary conditions not from war wounds. After the war, she refined her analysis process and advocated for standardized, accurate statistics as a basis for improving medical and surgical practices. Her paper, *Proposals for a Uniform Plan of Hospital Statistics* (1861), changed the existing practice of simply reporting deaths to include William Farr’s classification of diseases as the basis for tabulation of hospital morbidity. This approach has become a standard practice in hospitals and other organizations that need to track disease information. In *Notes on Nursing*, Florence Nightingale wrote:

> In dwelling upon the vital importance of sound observation, it must never be lost sight of what observation is for. It is not for the sake of piling up miscellaneous information or curious facts, but for the sake of saving life and increasing health and comfort. (p. 70)

Nightingale became the first woman Fellow of the Royal Statistical Society in 1858 and an honorary member of the American Statistical Association in 1874.

Nightingale’s emphasis on analysis and understanding as the model for nurses continues today. This was demonstrated by Betts and Wright (2009) who quoted Strachan, Delaney, and Sensmeier (2006) that nurses are, “…knowledge facilitators, translators and interpreters of scientific information to support
patient preference and the development of individualised care pathways to support improved health outcomes” (p. 509).

Another example of the continuing influence of Nightingale is a recent Meyers and McNicholas (2008) article. This article reported data collected on Meyers’ multi-ligament knee reconstruction experiences at Warrington Hospitals over 7 years. The researchers displayed the results of the operations in a diagram presenting defined, colored spaces representing each of six possible ligament components. The colored spaces overlapped to show all the combinations used in the surgeries. This was a direct, current application of the descriptive statistical processes developed by Venn and Nightingale.

**Nightingale as a Centered Leader**

Our content analysis of biographical material supported the identification of Florence Nightingale as a centered leader consistent with the categories identified in the Barsh, Cranston, and Lewis (2011) theoretical model. The following excerpts provide evidence of the model as an analytic tool used to examine some of the reported experiences and comments of Florence Nightingale.

**Meaning**

Originally unhappy with her social station, Nightingale found happiness by selecting a career in nursing based on her belief that God had called her to the profession. She took great satisfaction from her efforts as a nurse, manager, and consultant contributing to the health of British soldiers. A take-charge administrator at the Harley Street London Nursing home and in the British military hospital in Scutari, she consistently demonstrated independence, persistence, and organization. She withstood initial criticism and resistance of doctors and military officers in Scutari and eventually won their acceptance and support.

**Positive Framing**

Nightingale demonstrated unceasing concern for the suffering of soldiers. Her dedication to them and her leadership in the army hospital in Scutari won her the accolade of “Angel of the Crimea.” Even when she was seriously ill with Crimean fever, Nightingale continued to work in the Crimea instituting sanitary reforms in Scutari and Balaclava. She began her studies documenting most war casualties were due to nosocomial infections and not a direct result from the wounds. Later in life when confined to her home, Nightingale continued to influence health care reforms and the development of nursing as a profession through her far-reaching correspondence.

**Connecting**

Although she shunned publicity, as a member of the British landed gentry, Nightingale had connections in high British social circles. Her correspondence with royalty, viceroys, cabinet ministers, and international leaders was extensive. She approached Sidney Herbert, British Secretary of War, and Queen Victoria with appeals to win support for the reforms. She advocated to improve hospital conditions and treatment of British soldiers. She donated the 45,000 pounds raised in her honor by the public to found the St. Thomas’ Hospital nurses training school.

**Engaging**

One biographer credited Nightingale’s influence to the fact she was a prolific writer. Her recently published collected works (McDonald, 2002-2010) contains 18 volumes. Her writing was persuasive. She invented a statistical process, the polar area graph, known today as the modern circular histogram used for displaying grouped cyclic data. The +plus magazine of living mathematics called Florence Nightingale, “The compassionate statistician” (Magnello, 2010, para. 1).

**Energizing**

Early in her career, Nightingale eagerly accepted the leadership of a 38-nurse delegation to Scutari, Turkey. She worked to change the conditions in the hospital by directing her nurses to work supporting the physicians and improve sanitation even when resisted. After her return to England, she shunned
publicity and sequestered herself in her home to avoid the press and the adoring public. However, through extensive correspondence, she remained in contact with her supporters and other leaders who could influence nursing and the improvement of hospital conditions. Through her personal model and continuing efforts, Nightingale became an inspirational model for women and nurses creating a legacy of leadership that persists today.

MARIE SKLODOVSKA CURIE (1867-1934)

Marie Sklodovska Curie was from a scientific family of Polish patriots. Her father was a professor of physics at the University of Warsaw. Her mother ran a private high school for aristocratic young women in Warsaw. As a child, Curie polished instruments in her father’s physics laboratory exposing her to science early in her life. Even though she was valedictorian of her class in high school, she did not anticipate attending college since young women in Poland at that time could not do so. Marie worked as a private tutor and studied in an underground Polish “floating University.” There she took classes forbidden in the regular Polish universities. Later, Marie also taught classes in the floating University to working women where she was impressed by how quickly and how well these women learned. Her next employment was as a governess. She lived with a cultured upper class family near Sczuki. There she also started a school for peasant children, teaching them two hours a day. Marie’s sister was in medical school in Paris and Marie worked to pay her sister’s tuition on the promise that once her sister became a physician she would bring Marie to Paris to study. Marie’s hope was to join her sister in Paris to study mathematics and physics. Marie’s intent was to return eventually to Poland and teach high school.

After Marie’s sister married a Polish exile who was a practicing doctor, she invited Marie to move in with her and her husband in Paris. Marie accepted the offer and enrolled at the Sorbonne. There she worked on her masters in mathematics and increased her knowledge of French. Eventually Marie rented a garret in the Latin Quarter of Paris. She placed first in her mathematics exam but she also wanted to study physics. Marie successfully applied for the Alexandrovitch Scholarship for young Poles studying abroad and was able to begin her study of physics. Some years later, she repaid the foundation for the scholarship assigned to her. For her studies in physics, she needed a laboratory and arranged for one with Pierre Curie, then a well-known physicist. The two of them were married after working together for about a year.

Marie had nurtured an interest in radioactivity after reading an article in 1895 by Antoine Henri Becquerel. Radioactive rays were a mystery; similar to X-rays yet different since they were spontaneously produced. However, Marie was not able to satisfy her curiosity and study them. Marie earned a master’s degree in secondary education. After the birth of her daughter, Marie was able to study the rays emitted by uranium and coined the term “radioactivity” to describe the rays. She also hypothesized a new element, radium, as the source. By 1898, Pierre and Marie began collaborating to verify the existence of radium. Marie continued work on her doctorate earning it in 1903. This was the same year she shared the Nobel Prize in physics with her husband and Antoine Becquerel. In 1906, Pierre was killed in an accident. Marie though depressed, continued her work on radium.

After Pierre’s death, Marie took over his laboratory and teaching position at the Sorbonne. She was successful isolating radium metal and invented the technique used to weigh radioactive substances producing the first international standard of radium which was supplied to several other physics research laboratories. Marie managed the construction of the Institute of Radium and in 1911 was awarded her second Nobel Prize, this time in chemistry. During World War I, Marie invented a portable X-ray unit, arranged to have a number of these constructed, then trained 150 French housewives to operate them. The devices came to be known as “little Curies” and were used to diagnose war wounds in medical facilities near the front lines. Despite her two Nobel Prizes, the French Academy of Sciences never admitted her to membership. Marie Curie died in 1934 from leukemia likely caused by her long exposure to radioactive materials.
Marie Curie as a Centered Leader

Our content analysis supported the identification of Marie Curie as a centered leader consistent with the categories identified in Barsh and Cranston’s (2009) Centered Leadership. The following summarizes major information from Curie’s life categorized by the dimensions of Centered Leadership.

Meaning
Marie Curie’s childhood was a happy one. Her intention was to become a high school teacher in Poland and after she left to attend college, she always intended to return. She worked as a governess to support her sister who was studying in France. Later, Curie also moved to France to study. As a student, she lived a Spartan existence not discouraged by being cold or hungry. Although she said self-awareness, “does not exist for me” (Curie, 1937, p. 403), her work first as a laboratory assistant and later as Pierre Curie’s wife and co-researcher eventually gave great meaning to her work. She was described as being most at home in her laboratory.

Framing
Once she started studying radioactivity in the effort to find its source, Curie became single minded in her pursuit. She was happy and absorbed working to extract Radium in the shed that served as the laboratory. After her husband Pierre’s death, Curie took over his teaching position and laboratory at the Sorbonne. The Curies did not patent Radium but instead donated it saying, “…humanity needs dreamers” (Curie, 1937, p. 336).

Connecting
Known as a shy person, on rare occasions when she entertained others, Curie was described as a meticulous hostess. With her husband, she published 32 scientific papers in five years, establishing her reputation. From then on, she regularly received letters from the greatest scientists of the early twentieth century and was the only woman scientist in many scientific and academic meetings. A hands-on scientist and builder, Curie was highly involved with the architect when managing the building of the Physics Laboratory at the Sorbonne. She drew plans, climbed scaffolding, argued with the architect. During WWI, her she donated the award from her Nobel Prize to fund mobile X-Ray units, known as “little Curies,” used to identify shrapnel in wounded soldiers. Curie developed the reputation of being a kind, gentle, person when working with the wounded.

Engaging
Curie took the risk of abandoning the study of Uranium in favor of examining all known chemical bodies that emitted spontaneous rays. Although fame and publicity brought her misery and torment, Curie supported others in their scholarly efforts and research. Curie persisted in her efforts even through a period when she was close to suicide because of the personal attacks of the French press. Marie won her second Nobel Prize based on her own efforts, even though the French Academy of Sciences repeatedly rejected her for membership.

Energizing
Curie loved working in her laboratory. It became her secret universe marked by the rigor of her work, her passions for science and radioactivity. Marie was convinced there was a new element involved in the release of spontaneous rays and suggested the name for radioactivity. Said, “I’ve got to find it. We are sure” (Curie, 1937, p. 157). She ignored initial symptoms of radiation sickness and persisted in her research to find Radium even though the element existed only in her and Pierre’s imagination.

Curie became a world-renowned scientist who made discoveries altering basic scientific tenants in physics and chemistry, discovered two new elements, and won two Nobel Prizes in an age when virtually no women worked in science. She was the first woman admitted to several prestigious scientific societies where she was accepted as a peer.
ELEANOR ROOSEVELT (1884-1962)

Eleanor Roosevelt was born into a well-known, socially prominent New York City family. She had buckteeth and was not considered attractive; however, her father encouraged her to become socially aware by pointing out differences between her clothes and those of other children like newsboys and homeless people. After Eleanor’s mother died when Eleanor was eight, the young woman moved to her maternal grandmother’s home where she was raised under strict discipline. This even included a steel brace for her back to improve her posture. Not a studious child, Eleanor began to develop intellectually when at 15 she attended boarding school in London. There she learned French, Italian, and developed an interest in current events. After boarding school, her grandmother refused to allow Eleanor to attend college. Rather than joining the social activities of other young people in her social class, Eleanor became engaged in various philanthropic organizations and activities. Among these were the Junior League, the Rivington Street Settlement House, and the Consumer’s League.

In 1903, Eleanor renewed her friendship with a relative and former playmate, Franklin Delano Roosevelt. Over the objections of both sides of the family, the two were married. As Franklin’s wife, Eleanor bore six children in the next 12 years. She also allowed her mother-in-law to regulate much of her life. This changed in 1910 with Franklin’s election as governor of New York. In 1913, Franklin was appointed Secretary of the Navy and the Roosevelts moved to Washington. There Eleanor, “…looked at everything from the point of view of what I ought to do, rarely from the standpoint of what I wanted to do” (Roosevelt, 1949, p. 23). During WWI, Eleanor became the manager for a Red Cross canteen that included tours of naval hospitals. These experiences led to Eleanor’s demand of Franklin that the country address the living conditions of the poor and the depressed staff she had observed.

In 1918, Eleanor learned that her husband was having an affair with her personal secretary, Lucy Mercer, an affair that lasted until Franklin died. Although Eleanor did not divorce Franklin, she became an independent partner. After Franklin’s paralysis from polio, Eleanor took on the lead parent role for their children while nursing Franklin. Her encouragement was part of the reason he decided to run for president. After his election, Eleanor expanded the previous role of first ladies by promoting social causes like the National Training School for Girls. She also took many social issues to her husband supporting the causes of women, blacks, and the needy. In This I Remember (1949), she explained,

Franklin often used me to get the reflection of other people’s thinking because he knew I made it a point to see and talk with a variety of people. I did not need to go on lecture trips, or go to inspect projects in different parts of the country, but my husband knew that I would not be satisfied to be merely an official hostess. (p. 3)

She initiated first lady press conferences and banned male reporters. Eleanor also wrote a daily newspaper column My Day and lectured all over the country.

After Franklin died, Eleanor continued her public life serving twice as a member of the U.S. delegation to the U.N. where she served on the Human Rights Commission and was a key author of the U.N.’s Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948). She was a shrewd, effective advocate for it in the closing debate. Eleanor also served in the Eisenhower and Kennedy administrations. After her death in 1962, the New York Times printed this summary of her achievements, “…[N]o First Lady could touch her for causes espoused, opinions expressed, distance spanned, people spoken to, words printed, precedents chattered, honors conferred, degrees garneted” (New York Times, 1962) . John Cooper, Jr. in the introduction to her biography described her thus,

For the last thirty years of her life, Eleanor Roosevelt was the most famous and at times the most influential woman in the world….It seems doubtful that she would have achieved a stature anything like she did without her husband’s position. Still, in contrast to every other first lady, it is easy to imagine her establishing a public position for herself...
if she had remained single, had been widowed in early adulthood, or had married a man who never entered politics. (p. vii)

Arthur Schlesinger in the forward to Lash’s *Eleanor and Franklin* (1971, p. xi) summarized Eleanor succinctly in these words, “Her liberation was not an uncovenanted gift. She attained it only through a terrifying exertion of self-discipline….”

### Eleanor Roosevelt as a Centered Leader

Our content analysis supported the identification of Eleanor Roosevelt as a Centered Leader consistent with the categories identified in the Barsh and Cranston (2009) model. The following examples from her life demonstrate the presence of the fabulous five dimensions from the model.

#### Meaning

Although her childhood was not a happy one, Roosevelt taught herself to be effective. She volunteered and emerged as a leader for many causes. A willing and vocal advocate for many causes, Eleanor became a skilled negotiator and speaker. As an independent partner to FDR, she brought many issues to him that he might otherwise have ignored. Roosevelt was also a strong voice for a new more-equal role for women in organizations and in government. Her advisory group during the 1924 Democratic convention strongly advocated for the Shepard-Towner Act, landmark legislation that was the first Federal health and welfare program.

#### Framing

Eleanor was aware of her impact and used it to draw attention to issues. She often sat in the sections reserved for Blacks at meetings. She quit the DAR and invited Marian Anderson to sing at the White House after the DAR refused Anderson permission to sing at Constitution Hall. Eleanor entertained gridiron widows on the night the male press gave a stag party for the president. Although she “dreaded” the spotlight on the president’s family, she felt her activities would be curtailed so the president’s would dominate. She advocated, “Do one thing every day that scares you” (Roosevelt, 1937, Book Jacket).

#### Connecting

Many of the women reporters who participated in her press conferences as first lady became devoted followers and protective guardians. Eleanor established a cottage furniture factory and was comfortable having workmen around. She followed Louis Howe’s advice to become more politically active and to persuade FDR to run for president. She commented that as first lady when shaking hands in a reception line she concentrated on faces and recognizing as many people as she could. After FDR’s death, Eleanor built relationships supportive of women and equal rights as the U.S. United Nations Representative. This resulted in her being a primary author of the Human Rights Declaration.

#### Engaging

Eleanor took lessons to improve her speaking voice and developed skills presenting her ideas and values. She was FDR’s legs visiting groups all over the country and around the world. She made sure FDR heard the voices of reform by inviting people with different political persuasions to dinner and purposefully seating them next to him. Eleanor was willing to risk taking on new responsibilities and assumed public service roles on national and international levels to improve the lot of the needy, Blacks, and women. She easily related to people from all walks of life. She wrote books, edited a magazine, wrote a daily newspaper column, held press conferences, and visited many places in person.

#### Energizing

A careful strategist, Eleanor developed great social adeptness extending across economic groups and social classes. Lorena Hickok was her confidante and talking with her helped Eleanor deal with the emotions that “ate into my soul.” Roosevelt demonstrated flow by taking advantage of the opportunities
to be a leader in many organizations. She famously quit the DAR to make an important point about
equality when the organization closed Constitution Hall to Marian Anderson. She initiated first lady press
conferences holding them for women reporters.

In her biography of Eleanor, Lois Scharf (1987) commented,

Eleanor Roosevelt was a practiced politician and an articulate spokeswoman for views
that marked American liberalism in the middle third of the twentieth century. The manner
in which she met the changes and challenges of her complex, often battered world
personalized the experiences of a generation of Americans. Together with her husband
during his three terms in office and then during widowhood, she became symbol and
substance of efforts to create a humane social order and a peaceful international
community in the wake of depression and wars, both hot and cold. She appealed to the
most positive qualities of human nature and to an enlightened, caring government to build
a just and secure world. That she became so beloved and admired testifies to the appeal
of her messages to those who listened. (p. ix)

CONCLUSIONS

Barsh and Cranston (2009) referred to the essence of Centered Leadership as “The Fabulous Five”
dimensions. Each of these major components reflects a way of thinking unique to women but which may
apply to men as well. Key elements in the lives of Florence Nightingale, Marie Curie, and Eleanor
Roosevelt, when examined through the lens of the model, confirm the fabulous five dimensions of
Centered Leadership as meaningful.

Meaning

The defining trait for successful leaders, meaning, led our three women to the jobs and roles they
filled. Their ownership of the meaning of what they were doing vitally enabled all else. Nightingale felt
called to nursing and pursued it even though her family resisted. Curie felt called to be a teacher and bring
credit to her native Poland. Her support of and identification with Polish education continued even though
she wound up working and living in France most of her adult life. Intrigued by the source of radioactivity,
Curie researched it most of her life even when doing so exposed her to difficult and dangerous working
conditions that injured her health. Roosevelt became attracted to social causes including the poor and the
rights of women. Her youthful experiences focused her not on the life of a debutant (to which she was
born) but on a life of philanthropy and humanitarian service.

Framing

Barsh and Cranston (2009) described framing as a choice and positive framing as a natural ability for
many women. Curie exhibited this first by framing her aspirations in terms of becoming a teacher in her
native Poland. Later, she stepped into leadership roles at the Sorbonne and Institute of Radium and
framed her role to understanding radioactivity, demonstrating the existence of Radium, and defining the
international standard for measuring radioactive elements. Roosevelt made several conscious decisions to
reframe her role. As a young woman, she rejected the expected role of a New York debutante and
volunteered in community service winning acclaim as a Red Cross canteen leader in WWI. In This I
Remember, Roosevelt recalled that, “Life was never dull” and “I had many occasions to think seriously
about the problem that faces the family of a man in American public life, especially a man who becomes
the subject of great controversy…” (p. 9). After her marriage to FDR, she became and remained
politically active as a spokeswoman for the poor and underprivileged first as a way to encourage FDR and
later for herself. Nightingale knew early on that she did not want the protected life of the English rich to
which she was born. After some explorations, she felt God called her to be a nurse. She began exploring
nursing even against the expressed preferences of her father. Her assignment to the Crimea cemented her
choice of nursing. It was there she earned fame for her success improving the conditions of the military
hospital in Scutari and at other military hospitals. For the rest of her life she framed her activities in terms of improving the sanitation and health of British soldiers, the people of India, and in developing a professional role for nurses through education and professional pay.

**Connecting**

Although shy when young, Roosevelt demonstrated this characteristic by her active involvement in many service organizations, by and by her outspoken and steadfast willingness to use her own position to bring attention to the poor, Black, and disadvantaged in our society. Roosevelt was at first a surrogate for her husband, but soon became a force in her own right. Nightingale skillfully used her family’s social connection and status to generate support for her activities when she was opposed by establishment physicians and military leaders. She avoided most public acclaim but capitalized on it by taking her case directly to Queen Victoria and winning the Queen’s support for the changes needed in the British military. Later in life although semi secluded, Nightingale routinely met with and counseled with many world leaders about public health and nursing issues. Curie initially connected with intellectuals and teachers in Poland while preparing herself to join them. Her studies in France continued through three master’s degrees and her doctorate. Curie was never accepted by the French academics but her marriage to Pierre Curie and subsequent two Nobel Prizes gave her a world-wide following that provide support in several key instances. One of these was the purchase of a gram of Radium for the Radium Research Institute so her studies could continue after the original Radium supply she had refined was exhausted.

**Engaging**

Barsh and Cranston (2009) see engagement as an empowering characteristic. Those who have it pursue meaning by reaching out to others. One way Barsh and Cranston characterized this skill was “stand up, speak up” (p. 196). Nightingale demonstrated this skill early when she stood up to her father and family in her desire to be a nurse. She demonstrated it later during her work in Scutari by standing up to the doctors and army leaders to obtain the changes needed to address the sanitation problems in the hospital. Later she documented her analysis and presented the case for reform in the British military including taking her case directly to the Queen in order to achieve the needed changes. Curie often preferred a lower profile role and disliked the attention of the press. She persisted in her research and won acclaim through her two Nobel prizes. She had friends and a lawyer represent her case to take her husband’s position at the Sorbonne after his death and she headed the construction and operation of the Radium Institute. Eleanor Roosevelt, first learned social graces at boarding school in England but developed considerable skill as an advocate for minorities. Eleanor’s effectiveness as a representative for the President and as a spokesperson for minorities and poor won her great acclaim. After FDR’s death, Eleanor chaired the human rights commission for the UN and was a prime defender of it in the final debate. She was also a spokeswoman in the Truman, Eisenhower, and Kennedy administrations.

**Energizing**

The extraordinary commitment and long hours required of leaders have deep reservoirs of energy and be able to not only sustain themselves but also energize others. Part of this is good work-life balance, another is knowing what energizes you. Even though Marie Curie was a focused and extremely hard persistent worker in the physics laboratory, she was still able to be a mother to two daughters. She was meticulous in her accounting and marshaled finances well, being generous to a fault. Curie shared her financial resources with others, even when close to poverty herself. Central to her commitment was her scientific curiosity and interest in radioactivity and radium. Eleanor Roosevelt found her energy being a spokesperson for women, Blacks, and the poor. She became a well-known author and lecturer using her stature and writing to develop public support for needed reforms. Roosevelt was a strong continuing advocate for the New Deal and enjoyed her role as a diplomat without portfolio. Florence Nightingale drew her energy from being of service. Early in her life, she lamented that she was accomplishing nothing. In the Scutari assignment, she was a take-charge administrator who challenged the existing authorities and revolutionized hospital sanitation and administration. Even though she contracted Crimean
fever, she continued to work. The money contributed to her on her return to England was used to establish a school of nursing. Later Nightingale served as a consultant to many public health leaders and national leaders as well.

IMPLICATIONS

Remarkable women like Florence Nightingale, Marie Curie, and Eleanor Roosevelt accomplish great things and emerge as leaders others turn to for inspiration and guidance. They exhibit flow (Csikszentmihályi, 2008), their work and accomplishments seem effortless, but this appearance often masks great focus and effort. We learn much by studying such women. Today, there is a need to reframe our cultural perspectives guiding how women are viewed as organizational leaders (Barsh & Yee, 2011). A conceptualization like Centered Leadership (Barsh & Cranston, 2009; Barsh, Cranston, & Craske, 2008; Barsh, Cranston, & Lewis, 2011), helps us identify and organize the unique skills and abilities of outstanding, exemplary women in leadership roles. When we know the distinctive strengths of women leaders, we can help counter incorrect but deep-rooted beliefs that hinder recognition and advancement of women and guide the development of women building the skills needed of effective leaders. We have come to a new appreciation for the skills of the three women we studied and for the robust theoretical model provided by Centered Leadership (Barsh & Cranston; Barsh, Cranston, & Craske; Barsh, Cranston, & Lewis) particularly when applied to remarkable women leaders.

REFERENCES


